HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN EUROPE
HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN EUROPE

Brigit Toebes, Mette Hartlev, Aart Hendriks and Janne Rothmar Herrmann (eds.)
PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Increasingly, scholars from various disciplines are addressing the interfaces between health and human rights. As a legal scholar interested in this area, I started to teach a course entitled ‘Health and Human Rights’ at the University of Aberdeen School of Law in 2006. Finding this an important and developing area of law, I tried to identify its legal contours and its most important topics.

While I decided that there was an urgent need for a book, I struggled to cover all the areas of this broad and developing field. I am therefore utterly grateful to co-editors Mette Hartlev, Aart Hendriks and Janne Rothmar Herrmann for their excellent input and collaboration in this project. Many thanks also go the other authors for their valuable contributions and for their confidence in this project. Without them we would never have been able to cover so many perspectives of this new field and to demonstrate such knowledge and insight.

Altogether, the book is the result of much interaction and debate between the editors and authors of the book, scholars who together cover the wide areas of health law and human rights law from four different countries in Northern Europe. The aim of our project has been to write a truly coherent and comprehensive work with a number of interconnected chapters. These chapters roughly cover the scope of the area of health and human rights in Europe.

A few people have helped us at different stages in the writing and/or editorial process, including Sofia Gruskin and Daniel Tarantola, Herman Nys, Catherine Jacqueson, Dabney Evans, Maria Green, Simone Wijte, Tom Scheirs (Intersentia Publishing), and Fiona McGrath (for editing). Thanks also go to the School of Law of the University of Aberdeen, for extending my affiliation, and to the Faculty of Law of the University of Copenhagen, for enabling us to ‘test’ several chapters of the book by teaching a course entitled ‘Health and Human Rights’ in 2011. Lastly, I am grateful to the Research Department of the Danish Institute for Human Rights for granting me a temporary visiting research position, which enabled me to set the stage for this book.

Brigit Toebes, Managing Editor
Groningen, January 2012
CONTENTS

Preface and Acknowledgements ..................................................... v
About the Editors and Contributors ............................................. xv
List of Abbreviations ................................................................. xvii

Introduction: Health and Human Rights in Europe
Brigit Toebes ................................................................................ 1

1. Rationale and aim of this book ................................................. 1
2. Historical introduction to ‘health and human rights’ .................... 3
   2.1. Introduction ................................................................... 3
   2.2. The human rights movement .......................................... 3
   2.3. Medical law, health law, medical and bioethics, and patients’ rights . 5
   2.4. The public health movement .......................................... 7
3. Theoretical approach .................................................................. 9
   3.1. Main theoretical questions underpinning this research .......... 9
   3.2. Conceptual grounding of human rights law ....................... 10
   3.3. Conceptual grounding and analysis of economic, social and cultural rights ................................................................. 12
   3.4. Identification of main concepts and principles underpinning this study ................................................................. 13
4. Method and chapter outline ....................................................... 16

PART I.
HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS: THE EUROPEAN INSTITUTIONS

Chapter 1. The Council of Europe and Health and Human Rights
Aart Hendriks ............................................................................. 23

1. Introduction ............................................................................ 23
2. European Convention on Human Rights ................................... 24
   2.1. European Convention on Human Rights ......................... 24
   2.2. Rights and case-law ....................................................... 26
      2.2.1. General .................................................................. 27
      2.2.2. Health and human rights topics ............................... 30
            a. Right to health .................................................. 30
            b. Right to life (Article 2) ...................................... 31
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>c. Right to care (Article 3)</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Patients’ rights (Article 8)</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Conclusions</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. European Social Charter</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. European Convention for the Prevention of Torture</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Conclusions</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2. The European Union and Health and Human Rights</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janne Rothmar Herrmann and Brigit Toebes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. The aim of this chapter</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. The EU, its institutions and functioning</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. EU, health and human rights</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Specific responsibilities for health in the EU</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Focus on human health in the new TFEU</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. EU engagement with public health</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Free movement &amp; health</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Introduction</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. Free movement of services: cross-border healthcare services</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1. The legal framework</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2. Cross-border healthcare and issues of morality</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3. Evaluation</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. Free movement of persons: healthcare professionals</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4. Free movement of goods: pharmaceuticals</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5. Free movement of goods: blood (safety)</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6. Free movement of goods: cells and tissues (safety, standards and quality)</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7. Data protection</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusions</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part II. HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS: AN EXPLORATION OF THE FIELD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3. The Right to Health and Other Health-Related Rights</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brigit Toebes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. The right to health</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1. Introduction</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2. The right to health at the UN level</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3. The right to health at the European level</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.4. Constitutional provisions</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.1.5. The scope of the right to health .......................... 92
2.1.6. Elements of the right to health .......................... 93
2.1.7. Guiding principles for the right to health ............... 94
2.1.8. Vulnerable groups ........................................ 96
2.1.9. Legal obligations .......................................... 97
   a. Respect, protect, fulfil ..................................... 97
   b. International obligations ................................... 99
   c. Core obligations ........................................... 99
2.1.10. The right to health: responsible actors ................. 100
2.1.11. The right to health and public health ..................... 101
2.1.12. Justiciability of the right to health ..................... 102
3. Other health-related rights ...................................... 103
   3.1. Introduction .............................................. 103
   3.2. The right to life .......................................... 104
   3.3. The right to liberty and security of the person ............ 106
   3.4. The right to privacy and family life ....................... 107
   3.5. Freedom of expression and the right to information ....... 107
   3.6. The right to marry and found a family .................... 108
   3.7. The rights to benefit from scientific progress ............. 109
   3.8. Economic, social and cultural rights, and the protection of health ............................................. 109
4. Conclusions ....................................................... 110

Chapter 4. Patients’ Rights
Mette Hartlev ...................................................... 111

1. Introduction ...................................................... 111
2. Definition and development of patients’ rights ................ 112
   2.1. Concept of patients’ rights ................................. 112
   2.2. Development of patients’ rights ............................ 114
3. Patients’ rights in international law: general principles and legal instruments ............................................. 117
   3.1. Legal instruments .......................................... 117
   3.2. General legal principles ..................................... 119
4. Right to self-determination ....................................... 122
   4.1. Autonomy, self-determination and consent ................. 122
   4.2. Patients’ right to self-determination in human rights and patients’ rights law ..................................... 123
   4.3. Restriction on right to self-determination in patients’ rights law ............................................. 125
5. Patients’ right to information ..................................... 130
   5.1. Patients’ interest in information ............................ 130
   5.2. Right to information in medical decision-making ........ 130
   5.3. Right not to know ........................................... 132

Intersentia ix
5.4. Access to medical files .................................................. 133
5.5. General information ................................................. 133
6. Patients who are not competent to give consent ............. 134
7. Medical research ........................................................... 136
8. Privacy and confidentiality ......................................... 138
  8.1. Confidential relationships and informational self-determination  138
  8.2. Processing of health data in connection with medical treatment  140
  8.3. Use of health data for purposes other than medical care ....  142
9. Concluding remarks ...................................................... 144

Chapter 5. Reproductive Health
  Janne Rothmar Herrmann .............................................. 145

1. Introduction ................................................................. 145
2. Women’s reproductive health and human rights ............ 146
  2.1. Introduction .......................................................... 146
  2.2. Reproductive autonomy .......................................... 147
  2.3. Right to respect for privacy and family life ............... 149
  2.4. The prohibition of discrimination ......................... 149
3. Family planning ............................................................ 149
  3.1. Abortion .................................................................. 150
    3.1.1. The UN Conventions ...................................... 150
    3.1.2. The European Convention on Human Rights ...... 152
      a. The balancing of interests between woman and foetus  152
      b. The balancing of interests between woman and state  155
      c. The balancing of interests between woman and man  158
  3.2. Contraception .......................................................... 160
4. Procreative healthcare services .................................... 161
  4.1. Fertility treatment .................................................. 162
    4.1.1. A privacy issue? ............................................. 162
    4.1.2. Access to treatment? ....................................... 164
  4.2. Embryo and foetus selection ................................... 169
5. Pregnancy, health and autonomy .................................. 174
  5.1. Maternal and foetal health ..................................... 174
  5.2. Forced treatment of pregnant women ....................... 175
6. Concluding remarks ...................................................... 176

Chapter 6. Euthanasia and Physician-Assisted Suicide from a Human
  Rights Perspective
  Jozef Dorscheidt ............................................................ 177

1. Introduction ................................................................. 177
2. Terminology ................................................................. 178
3. End-of-life decisions and human rights. .................................. 181
   3.1. End-of-life decisions and the right to life .......................... 181
   3.2. End-of-life decisions and freedom from inhuman or degrading
treatment ................................................................. 185
   3.3. End-of-life decisions and the right to privacy ......................... 187
4. National legislation on euthanasia and PAS ............................... 189
   4.1. The Netherlands .................................................. 190
   4.2. Belgium ............................................................ 194
   4.3. Switzerland ....................................................... 197
5. Strasbourg jurisprudence on end-of-life decisions ....................... 201
   5.1. Pretty v. United Kingdom .......................................... 201
   5.2. Haas v. Switzerland ............................................. 204
   5.3. Koch v. Germany ................................................. 205
6. A human right to die? ................................................................ 206
7. Final remarks ............................................................................ 209

PART III.
VULNERABLE GROUPS, HEALTH INEQUALITIES, AND THE SOCIAL
DETERMINANTS OF HEALTH

Chapter 7. Health Inequalities and the Social Determinants of Health
   Brigit Toebes, Aart Hendriks and Karien Stronks ...................... 213
   1. Introduction ............................................................. 213
   2. The human rights framework ............................................. 215
   3. Human rights and the social determinants of health ............... 217
      3.1. Availability, accessibility, acceptability, quality, accountability
and participation: ‘AAAQ-AP’ ......................................... 218
      3.2. Vulnerable groups and non-discrimination ....................... 219
      3.3. Definition of legal state obligations .............................. 220
      3.4. Progressive realisation and core obligations ................... 221
      3.5. Indicators and benchmarks ...................................... 222
      3.6. Obligations of non-state actors .................................. 223
   4. Linking the rights framework with the CSDH goals on the social
   determinants ............................................................... 224
   5. Towards accountability for the social determinants of health ...... 225

Chapter 8. Children and the Right to Health Protection
   Henriette Sinding Aasen .................................................. 227
   1. Introduction ............................................................. 227
   2. Legal sources and starting points ...................................... 228
   3. Public health issues relating to children ............................... 229

Intersentia xi
4. Health inequalities affecting children ........................................... 231
5. State obligations to provide equitable access to healthcare for children . 232
   5.1. The Biomedicine Convention ........................................... 232
   5.2. The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union ....... 234
   5.3. Special focus on children and accessibility of healthcare services and information ........................................... 235
6. Health protection and promotion ............................................. 238
   6.1. The European Social Charter (ESC) ..................................... 238
       6.1.1. Overview ......................................................... 238
       6.1.2. General provisions ............................................. 239
       6.1.3. Child-specific provisions ..................................... 241
   6.2. EU regulation .......................................................... 242
       6.2.1. The Charter of Fundamental Rights ............................ 242
       6.2.2. The Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union .... 243
7. Implementation of the right to health for children: challenges and strategies ........................................... 244
8. Conclusion: human rights not a matter of choice but of legal requirement ........................................... 246

Chapter 9. The Rights of Persons with Disabilities in the Context of Healthcare
   Oddný Mjöll Arnardóttir ...................................................... 249
1. Introduction ................................................................. 249
2. Disability and health ....................................................... 250
3. Non-discrimination and accessibility ...................................... 253
4. Mental disability and autonomy ............................................ 257
   4.1. Placement in institutions ............................................. 258
   4.2. Treatment ............................................................... 263
       4.2.1. General principles ............................................. 263
       4.2.2. Compulsory medical treatment ................................ 265
       4.2.3. The protection of persons not able to consent ............. 268
5. Concluding remarks ........................................................ 271

Chapter 10. The Right to Health Protection for the Elderly: Key Elements and State Obligations
   Henriette Sinding Aasen ..................................................... 273
1. Introduction ................................................................. 273
2. Legal sources and starting points ........................................... 276
3. Other important instruments ................................................. 277
4. Health concerns and ‘ageism’ ............................................... 279
5. Maltreatment and serious neglect: application of Article 3 ECHR .... 281
6. Right to health protection for older persons: State obligations 283
   6.1. Overview .......................................................... 283
   6.2. The Biomedicine Convention and equitable access to appropriate healthcare .......................... 283
       6.2.1. Starting points ............................................. 283
       6.2.2. 'Equitable access' ......................................... 284
       6.2.3. 'Appropriate healthcare' ................................. 288
       6.2.4. Respect, protect, fulfil: recommendations for actions .............................. 290
   6.3. The European Social Charter and health protection for the elderly ............................................ 292
       6.3.1. General provisions: Article 11 ............................ 292
       6.3.2. General provision: Article 13 ................................ 293
       6.3.3. General provisions: Articles 14, 30 and 31 .................. 295
       6.3.4. Provisions directed towards older persons .................. 295
   6.4. The EU Charter of Fundamental Rights and the right to health protection .............................................. 297
   7. Final remarks .................................................................. 298

PART IV.
CONCLUSIONS, CHALLENGES AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Conclusions
Brigit Toebes ................................................................. 303
ABOUT THE EDITORS AND CONTRIBUTORS

Oddný Mjöll Arnardóttir (PhD) is a Professor in human rights law at Reykjavik University, Iceland. Her main research interests are human rights jurisprudence, non-discrimination law, disability rights and health law. Her publications include Equality and Non-Discrimination under the European Convention on Human Rights (Martinus Nijhoff 2003), The UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities – European and Scandinavian Perspectives (ed., with Gerard Quinn and Martinus Nijhoff 2009), and numerous edited book chapters and articles. She currently holds the post of President of the Board of the Icelandic Human Rights Centre.

Jozef Dorscheidt (PhD) is a senior lecturer in health law, Faculty of Law, University of Groningen, the Netherlands, and board member of the Groningen Centre for Children’s Rights in Health Care. Furthermore, he is an alternate judge at the District Court in Groningen, and alternate legal member of the Dutch Central Commission on Research involving Human Subjects. His research interests involve the legal position of the child in healthcare, health law matters at the beginning and the end of life, and the regulation of medical research on humans.

Mette Hartlev (PhD and LL.D) is a Professor in health law at the University of Copenhagen, Denmark. Her main research interests are health law and patients’ rights, with a special focus on right to health in EU law and international law. She has also researched and published in the field of biolaw and bioethics and law, science and technology studies. She has participated in a number of EU-funded cross-disciplinary research projects, and is a member of the editorial board of European Journal of Health Law.

Aart Hendriks (PhD) is a Professor in health law at Leiden University/Leiden University Medical Centre (LUMC); a health law advisor to the Royal Dutch Medical Association (KNMG); a substitute judge at the District Court of Rotterdam; a Member of the Group of specialists on predictivity, genetic testing and insurance of the Council of Europe; a board member of various national and international non-governmental organisations (NGOs) working in the field of health, disability and human rights law; and an editor of several academic
journals. He obtained his Ph.D. from the University of Amsterdam (UvA) on a
dissertation concerning the right of persons with disabilities to equal access in
the employment market, and has written extensively on such issues as human
rights, health law, minority rights and patients’ rights.

Janne Rothmar Herrmann (PhD) is an Associate Professor in biolaw at the
Faculty of Law of Copenhagen University. Her research interests include biolaw
& bioethics, reproductive rights, conscientious objections, beginning and ending
of life, and privacy & technology. She is a Member of the Nordic Committee on
Bioethics by appointment by the Nordic Council of Ministers, and is currently
an elected Member of the Board of Directors of the European Association of
Health Law.

Henriette Sinding Aasen (dr. juris) is professor at the Faculty of Law at the
University of Bergen, Norway. She is currently the coordinator of the University
of Bergen’s research programme on the Rule of Law and Democracy. Her current
research activities are in the area of health and human rights, vulnerable groups
(children, immigrants, women), constitution and welfare state. She has
participated in several national law commissions in the area of health, human
rights and biomedicine research, and is currently leading three interdisciplinary
research projects funded by the Norwegian Research Council (Juridification and
social citizenship; Constitution, welfare state and citizenship; Health promotion,
dignity and human rights: the improvement of maternal health in Tanzania).

Karien Stronks (PhD) is professor of social medicine at the Academic Medical
Center (AMC) /University of Amsterdam (UvA), and head of the department of
Public Health of the AMC. Her main research interests are inequalities in health
caused by socioeconomic status, as well as ethnic background, and the
effectiveness of interventions and policies tackle these inequalities.

Brigit Toebes (PhD) is a lecturer in international law at the Faculty of Law of the
University of Groningen. She previously worked as a lecturer at the University of
Aberdeen School of Law, after which she was based as an external lecturer and
consultant in Copenhagen. Her PhD research, which she conducted at Utrecht
University, involved the definition of health as a human right (Intersentia 1999).
Her research interests are public international law, human rights law, economic,
social and cultural rights and the definition of health as a right, health law, and
medical ethics. She is a Board Member of the International Federation of Health
and Human Rights Organisations (IFHHRO).
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

‘Biomedicine Convention’  Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine (CoE)
CAT  Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (UN, 1984)
CEDAW  Convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination Against Women (UN, 1979)
CIE  Committee of Independent Experts (ESC, CoE)
CoE  Council of Europe
CPT  European Convention for the Prevention of Torture (CoE, 1987)
CRPD  Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UN, 2006)
CSDH  Committee on the Social Determinants of Health (WHO)
EC Treaty  Treaty establishing the European Community (EU, 1993)
ECFR  Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union (EU, 2000)
ECHR  Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (CoE, 1950)
ECJ  European Court of Justice
EComHR  European Commission of Human Rights
ECSR  European Committee of Social Rights (ESC, CoE)
ECtHR  European Court of Human Rights (CoE)
ESC  European Social Charter (CoE, 1961)
EU  European Union
GC  Grand Chamber (of the ECtHR)
GC 14  General Comment 14 to the ICESCR (on the right to health) (UN, 2000)
HIV  Human immunodeficiency virus
ICCPR  International Convention on Civil and Political Rights (UN, 1966)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ICERD</td>
<td>International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (UN, 1965)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICESCR</td>
<td>International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (UN, 1966)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICF</td>
<td>International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIPAA</td>
<td>Madrid Political Declaration and International Plan of Action on Ageing (UN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MWC</td>
<td>International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families (UN, 1990)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Oviedo Convention’</td>
<td>Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine (CoE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAS</td>
<td>Physician assisted suicide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Revised) ESC</td>
<td>(Revised) European Social Charter (CoE, 1996)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEU</td>
<td>Treaty of the European Union (EU, 1992)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TFEU</td>
<td>Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (EU, 2007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDHR</td>
<td>Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UN, 1948)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNECE</td>
<td>UN Economic Commission of Europe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WMA</td>
<td>World Medical Association</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>