COLLECTIVE VIOLENCE
AND INTERNATIONAL
CRIMINAL JUSTICE

An interdisciplinary approach

Edited by

Alette Smeulers
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This conference book is the outcome of an expert-meeting organized in June 2009 by the Amsterdam Centre of Interdisciplinary Research on International Crimes and Security (ACIC) which is based at the VU University in Amsterdam. The expert-meeting was financed by the Netherlands Science Organization (NWO) for the research project entitled ‘A criminological approach to individual criminal responsibility for international crimes’ in the innovational research incentive scheme and which had been granted to me in December 2005. A first expert-meeting was organized in April 2007 at Maastricht University. The conference book thereof was also published by Intersentia in this series and is entitled: Supranational criminology: towards a criminology of international crimes and was edited by Roelof Haveman and myself. This book is a follow up on the first conference book.

I wish to thank a number of people for helping to organize the conference and for their support or advice with the editing of the conference book, namely Elies van Sliedregt, Lotte Hoex, Barbora Holá, Klaas Rozemond, Nicole Lijs and Diana Turcas. I would furthermore like to thank all the contributors to the conference book for their contributions. I am also grateful to the participants of the expert-meeting who did not submit a chapter but nevertheless contributed to the discussions during the expert-meeting: Elies van Sliedregt, Leila Sadat and Larissa van den Herik. I furthermore wish to thank Stephan Parmentier and Howard Morrison who both turned out to be excellent chairs and thus greatly contributed to the success of the meeting by ensuring a continuous and lively debate.

I sincerely hope that this book will further contribute to this newly developing field of international crimes and of international criminology and that it will stimulate the academic and interdisciplinary debate on international crimes in order to enhance our knowledge and understanding of these crimes and thus ultimately contribute to preventing such crimes in the future.

Alette Smeulers
Amsterdam, June 4 2010
5. Two case studies ......................................................... 48
   5.1. The Eichmann case ............................................. 48
   5.2. The case of John Deegan ................................. 54
6. Implications and concluding remarks ......................... 58
References ............................................................... 60

PART II.
COLLECTIVE CRIMES – INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITY

Chapter 4. Discourses on international criminality
Athanasios Chouliaras ............................................ 65

1. Introduction .......................................................... 65
2. The collective nature of core crimes as the common ground of
different fields of knowledge ....................................... 67
3. Criminology: state and state-corporate crime as instances of
organizational deviance .............................................. 70
4. International criminal law: looking for the individual criminal,
losing the delinquent state ......................................... 77
   4.1. Contextual elements and admissibility criteria: ‘Walks like a
duck, swims like a duck, and quacks like a duck’… Ain’t a duck! ... 78
   4.2. Modes of individual criminal liability: in search of the
organizational role ................................................... 84
5. The rationale for the international criminal justice system ...... 89
6. Discussion ............................................................. 92
References ............................................................... 94

Chapter 5. Ascribing individual liability within a bureaucracy of murder
Mark Osiel ............................................................ 105

1. Introduction .......................................................... 105
2. Easing superior responsibility: a new concept of effective control ... 106
   2.1. Roxin’s theory of “domination over an organizational apparatus” ... 107
3. Difficulties with Roxin’s approach: a post-Weberian update ....... 110
   3.1. The fungibility of subordinates ................................ 114
   3.2. Discretion enjoyed by subordinates ......................... 114
   3.3. Non-western military organization ......................... 116
   3.4. Shifting the evidentiary onus ................................ 119
   3.5. The sociology of mass atrocity ............................ 122
   3.6. The mental element .......................................... 124
4. Conclusion ............................................................ 125
References ............................................................... 127
Chapter 6. Seizing the “Grotian Moment”: application of joint criminal enterprise liability to the proceedings of the Cambodia genocide tribunal  
Michael P. SCHARF ................................................................. 131

1. Introduction ................................................................. 131
2. Did the Nuremberg precedent establish JCE as customary international law? ........................................... 134
   2.1. Application of JCE at Nuremberg. ............................. 134
   2.2. Nuremberg as a “Grotian Moment” .......................... 143
   2.3. The Concept of “Grotian Moment” ........................... 146
3. Conclusion ................................................................. 148
References ........................................................................ 151

Chapter 7. Criminologically explained reality of genocide, structure of the offence and the ‘intent to destroy’ requirement  
Kai AMBOS ................................................................. 153

1. Introduction ................................................................. 153
2. Typologies in criminology ............................................. 154
3. The significance of the criminological typology of perpetrators for the offence of genocide .......................... 159
4. Correspondence of categories of international criminal law with criminological typologies of perpetrators ............. 163
   4.1. Regarding top-level perpetrators “intent to destroy” means knowledge and purpose ........................................ 166
   4.2. As to mid-level perpetrators the knowledge-based approach is applicable ..................................................... 166
   4.3. Regarding the low-level perpetrators it is necessary to distinguish between state agents and private actors. While the former are normally informed about the genocidal (state) plan, the latter are not ..................................................... 168
5. Conclusion: the structure of the genocide offence in light of the criminological findings .................................. 170
References ........................................................................ 171

Chapter 8. ICTY and the culpability of different types of perpetrators of international crimes  
Alette SMEULERS and Barbora HOLÁ ............................... 175

1. Introduction ................................................................. 175
2. Culpability of different types of perpetrators .................. 179
   2.1. Highest level of blameworthiness: criminal masterminds ................................................................. 180
   2.2. High level of blameworthiness: careerists and fanatics ................................................................. 181
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

2.3. Medium level of blameworthiness: devoted warriors ............... 183
2.4. Low level of blameworthiness: “criminals and sadists” and the otherwise law abiding citizens ................................................ 185
2.5. Lowest level of blameworthiness: compromised perpetrator ...... 188
3. ICTY sentencing case law ...................................................... 188
4. Empirical findings ............................................................... 190
   4.1. Methodology ................................................................. 190
      4.1.1. Data Collection ...................................................... 190
      4.1.2. Method ............................................................... 193
   4.2. Results ........................................................................................................ 194
   4.3. Discussion ..................................................................................................... 200
5. Conclusions ......................................................................................... 203
References ............................................................................................ 204

Chapter 9. Child soldiers: agency, enlistment, and the collectivization of innocence

Mark A. Drumbl ................................................................. 207

1. Introduction ......................................................................................... 207
2. Criminally punishing adults for the conscription, enlistment, or use of child soldiers in hostilities ............................................................ 210
   2.1. Special Court for Sierra Leone .................................................. 210
   2.2. International Criminal Court .................................................. 213
   2.3. The agency of child soldiers: assumptions, narratives, and strategies ............................................................................................... 215
   2.4. Conclusion ......................................................................................... 218
3. How do children end up in fighting forces? ....................................... 218
   3.1. Forced conscription ..................................................................................... 219
   3.2. Voluntary enlistment .................................................................................. 222
   3.3. Summary ................................................................................................. 226
4. Conclusion ............................................................................................. 227
References ............................................................................................ 229

PART III.
REFLECTIONS ON INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL JUSTICE AND THE ICC

Chapter 10. The rough edges of the delicate mosaic: complexity theory and the early practice of the International Criminal Court

Salim A. Nakhjavani ................................................................. 235

1. Introduction ......................................................................................... 235
2. Some characteristics of complex adaptive systems .............................. 237
3. Lens, metaphor, analogy, model … or nothing at all? 239
4. Seeking complexity in international criminal justice 243
   4.1. The entry-into-force of the Rome Statute sets in motion a nonlinear, dynamic system 243
   4.2. Outcomes of decisions of the Court may be sensitively dependent on initial conditions and path-dependent 245
   4.3. The Rome Statute may co-evolve with 'neighboring' treaties 246
5. Novel insights or repackaged goods? 250
References 251

Chapter 11. The law and politics of self-referrals
Sarah Nouwen and Wouter Werner 255
1. Introduction 255
2. Self-referrals and complementarity 257
   2.1. Inaction as a ground for admissibility 260
   2.2. Narrowing down the definition of a 'case' 264
   2.3. Broadening the concept of unwillingness 265
   2.4. Conclusion: legal aspects of self-referrals 267
3. The politics of self-referrals 267
   3.1. ICC politics 267
   3.2. National politics 268
   3.3. Conclusion: politics of self-referrals 269
References 270

PART IV. FROM FACTS TO FIGURES

Chapter 12. On research methods for international crimes – methodological issues in the empirical study of international crimes
Catrien Bijleveld 275
1. Introduction 275
2. Criminological areas of study 276
3. Methodological backdrop to social science research 278
   3.1. Working with samples 278
   3.2. Causality 280
   3.3. The role of assumptions 282
4. Research on international crimes 283
   4.1. Studying prevalence 283
   4.2. Etiology 288
   4.3. (Legal) reaction 291
   4.4. Victim studies 292
Chapter 13. Sexual violence during war: variation and accountability
Elisabeth Jean Wood ........................................... 297

1. Introduction ............................................. 297
2. Key concepts ........................................... 299
3. Incomplete explanations ............................... 303
   3.1. Type of conflict ................................... 303
   3.2. Opportunity ......................................... 303
   3.3. Incentives .......................................... 305
   3.4. Rape as a substitution for consensual sex .... 306
   3.5. Female combatants ................................. 307
   3.6. Sexual violence as instrumental for the group .. 307
4. Theoretical framework ................................. 309
   4.1. Individual combatants .............................. 309
   4.2. Leadership strategy ................................. 310
   4.3. Institutions for combatant socialization ....... 310
   4.4. Wartime dynamics ................................. 312
   4.5. Military hierarchy ................................ 313
5. When is wartime rape a strategy of war? When is it rare? Top-down and bottom-across logics ....... 314
   5.1. Explaining the absence of sexual violence: two logics . 315
      5.1.1. The top-down logic ........................... 315
      5.1.2. The bottom-across logic ..................... 317
   5.2. Explaining rape as a strategy (or tactic) of war: two logics ...... 318
      5.2.1. Top-down logic: rape as a strategy of war ... 318
      5.2.2. Bottom-across logic: rape as a tactic of war ... 318
6. Conclusion .............................................. 319
References .................................................. 295

Chapter 14. Learning the hard way at the ICTY: statistical evidence of human rights violations in an adversarial information environment
Amelia Hoover Green ....................................... 325

1. Introduction ........................................... 325
2. The prosecution’s analysis ............................ 327
   2.1. Descriptive analysis .............................. 327
   2.2. Causal analysis ................................... 330
3. Defense challenges .................................... 333
   3.1. Defining “statistics” and “the scientific method” .. 334
   3.2. “Fundamental flaws” .............................. 336
4. The judgment .......................................................... 337
5. Lessons learned ...................................................... 343
6. Conclusions ........................................................... 349
References .............................................................. 350

PART V.
FROM FIGURES TO FACTS

Chapter 15. Methodology for the criminal investigation of international crimes
Xabier Aigirre Aranburu ............................................. 355

1. Introduction .......................................................... 355
2. Seize the opportunity structure .................................. 356
3. Beware of the inquisitorial temptation ......................... 358
4. Take a multi-disciplinary approach ............................. 361
5. Disregard simplistic explanations ............................... 364
6. Analysis first .......................................................... 365
7. Focus on specific and contextual elements ................... 367
8. Prioritize documentary evidence ................................ 369
9. Look at the evidence as sample ................................. 375
10. Prioritize insider and international witnesses ................ 376
11. Anticipate security needs ......................................... 379
References .............................................................. 380

Chapter 16. Closing the gap in truth finding: from the facts of the field to the judge's chambers
Martin Witteveen ..................................................... 383

1. Introduction .......................................................... 383
2. The facts .............................................................. 384
3. The investigation .................................................... 386
   3.1. Time lapse ....................................................... 386
   3.2. Consequences of time lapse ............................... 388
   3.3. Lack of documentation ....................................... 388
4. Issues of witnesses' memory ..................................... 389
   4.1. Encoding phase ............................................... 390
   4.2. Retention phase .............................................. 392
   4.3. Retrieval phase ............................................... 393
5. Witnesses' recount of the facts – unprecedented challenges in the context of international crimes ............... 395
   5.1. Trauma .......................................................... 396
   5.2. Quantative answers .......................................... 397

Intersentia xiii
5.2.1. Expediency of the criminal process .......................... 431
5.2.2. Protection of the rights of the accused .......................... 432
6. Conclusion ........................................................................... 433
References .............................................................................. 433

EPILOGUE

Chapter 18. Future perspectives on collective violence and international
criminal justice
Stephen Parmentier and Estelle Zinsstag ............................... 439

1. Introduction ........................................................................... 439
2. Types of violence: collective, international and political .......... 439
3. Types of responses: criminal prosecutions and beyond ........... 442
4. The need for an interdisciplinary approach ............................ 445
References .............................................................................. 445

Contributors ............................................................................ 447