THE RECAST OF THE EUROPEAN WORKS COUNCIL DIRECTIVE

Edited by
Filip DORSSEMONT
Thomas BLanke

intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
Filip Dorssemont and Thomas Blanke (eds.)

© 2010 Intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
www.intersentia.com

ISBN 978-94-000-0075-9
D/2010/7849/61
NUR 825

etui.
The ETUI is financially supported by the European Community. The European Community is not responsible for any use made of the information contained in this publication.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.
In Memory to Brian Bercusson
PREFACE

On 16 May 2009, EC Directive 2009/38 (Recast Directive) was published in the Official Journal. This directive is the outcome of a recasting procedure. With effect from 6 June 2011, EC Directive 94/45 on the establishment of a European works council or a procedure in Community-scale undertakings and Community-scale groups of undertakings for the purposes of informing and consulting employees (EWC Directive) will be repealed.

Nearly a decade has gone by between the date which had been scheduled for the review of the EWC Directive and the publication of the Recast Directive. Nearly 15 years lie between the publication of the EWC Directive and that of the Recast Directive. As witnessed by the grandfather clause of Article 13 of the EWC Directive, the emergence of the European works councils has preceded the adoption of the EWC Directive.

The present volume is retrospective and prospective. The book unfolds as a diptych. The first part examines the background and some of the loopholes of the EWC Directive. The background is studied from a conceptual, a historical, a legislative and a case law perspective. Kollonay Lehoczky analyzes the fundamental right of workers to information and consultation under the European Social Charter. Insofar as the EWC Directive as well as the Recast Directive refers to the improvement of the right to information and to consultation of employees as the purpose of the directive, the contribution is quintessential. It provides a fundamental rights perspective. Dølvik focuses on the genesis of the EWC Directive, which was the first EC Directive ever to have been adopted under the Maastricht Protocol on Social Policy. His contribution is complemented by Jagodziński’s reconstruction of the “Quest for an amended EWC Directive”. The EWC Directive stands at the beginning of a genuine renaissance of EC Directives in the field of worker involvement after the golden era marked by the adoption of the Collective Redundancies Directive and the Transfer of Undertaking Directive. Contrary to its predecessors, it has remained unaltered. As indicated in the 7th recital of the Recast Directive, a modernization of the EWC Directive in the light of legislative developments was necessary. At present these directives constitute one of the most developed legislative chapters of European Labour Law. Dorssemont’s comparative contribution focuses on the state of the art of Worker Involvement in secondary EC Law prior to the Recast Directive. A substantial
part of the first panel of the diptych is dedicated to an analysis of the ECJ and domestic case law related to the EWC Directive. This research was operated on the basis of national reports following a questionnaire or format annexed to the book. Both the national reports (Austria, Belgium, France, Germany, the Netherlands, Slovakia, Sweden and the UK) which have been updated until the end of 2009 as well as a comparative or synthetic report have been integrated into this publication.

The comparative and the national reports have been written as part of a research project of the European Trade Union Institute, which was made possible due to the financial support of the European Community. The background of the project is explained by JAGODZIŃSKI.

The second part does not endeavour a systematic analysis of the Recast Directive. It gathers selected essays which have been written by distinguished scholars as well as by experts who have combined a profound knowledge of law in the books with the experience of law in practice. Some of the essays have a topical character. They focus on specific improvements of the Recast Directive (the scope *ratione temporis*, the nature of the recast procedure, the definitions of information and consultation, the issue of continuity, the articulation between European and local information and consultation procedures). Other authors have tackled the subject matter in a more comprehensive manner, though they have done so from a specific and distinct perspective (e.g. the issue of effectiveness, the issue of actors).

This book has been written “under the shadow” of a remarkable and ever inspiring colleague.

As indicated in the explanatory note of Jagodziński, Brian Bercusson played a crucial role in chairing a kick off meeting to launch the research project on the analysis of the ECJ and domestic case law related to European works councils. The kick off meeting was organized shortly after a previous meeting on 12 March 2008, where Brian presented a Report related to “Information and Consultation Rights in Jurisprudence”. This report written in Brian’s typical way, spreading a wave of acute aphorisms, was published posthumously by the SDA in September 2008. We vividly regret that we were deprived of the human and intellectual pleasure to share the publication of this book with him. Brian’s enthusiasm and social commitment continues to be a source of inspiration. It is with a generous smile full of gratitude that we pay tribute to this rigorous optimist in action. We are grateful to Catherine Bercusson for granting us the privilege to dedicate this book to his memory.

Filip DORSSEMONT
Thomas BLANKE
Romuald JAGODZIŃSKI
CONTENTS

Preface ................................................................. vii
About the contributors ................................................. xxv

A. BACKGROUND AND LOOPHOLES OF THE EWC
   DIRECTIVE 94/45

I. The fundamental right of workers to information and consultation
   under the European Social Charter
   Csilla Kollonay Lehoczky ........................................... 3

   Introduction ............................................................. 3
   I. Precedence and sequence of emerging involvement rights in Europe .... 6
      1. The alleged precursor: Article 6 paragraph 1 .......................... 6
      2. The sequence of emerging involvement rights in Europe .............. 8
   II. Common features of Articles 21 and 22 ............................... 10
      1. Legal framework .................................................... 10
      2. Personal scope ..................................................... 11
         2.1. Employers obliged to involve workers in issues of
            management .......................................................... 11
            2.1.1. Restriction of the obligation to ‘undertakings’ .......... 11
            2.1.2. Exempting religious communities and spiritual/
                        ideological undertakings ................................. 14
            2.1.3. Exempting small employers ................................. 14
      2.2. The concept of workers’ representatives ........................... 16
      2.3. The ‘great majority’ rule ........................................ 18
   III. The different attributes of Articles 21 and 22 ....................... 20
      1. Material scope, rules and procedures under Article 21 .......... 20
      2. Material scope, rules and procedures of Article 22 .............. 23
   IV. Article 29: scope, content, rules and procedures .................... 26
   V. Sanctions .................................................................. 28

2. Worker involvement in secondary EC law prior to the Recast
   Directive
   Filip Dorssemont ....................................................... 31

   Introduction ............................................................. 31
## Contents

I. A conceptual study ......................................................... 34  
1. Worker involvement .................................................. 37  
2. Information ............................................................. 38  
3. The right to consultation ............................................ 39  
4. The right to participation ............................................ 46  
5. The representation and the collective defence of the interests of workers .................................................. 48  

II. Basic principles of the Community right to worker involvement ............. 50  

III. The substantive scope of application of the directives in retrospect .... 54  

IV. The spirit of cooperation: re-negotiational, pre-contractual and post-contractual .................................................. 55  

V. Horizontal subsidiarity .................................................. 58  

VI. To whom does this right to information and consultation belong? ........ 62  

VII. Limitations of the fundamental right to information and consultation 66  

1. Limitations 
   
   ratione personae in Treaty articles and human rights instruments .................................................. 67  
2. The limitation 
   
   ratione personae in the worker involvement directives .................................................. 68  
   
   2.1. Undertakings, public and/or private sector .................................................. 68  
   
   2.2. Thresholds and levels .................................................. 71  
   
   2.3. 
   
   Tendenzschutz .................................................. 74  
   
   2.4. Seagoing vessels .................................................. 77  
3. Reservation and confidentiality ........................................ 78  
4. Bankruptcy and analogous insolvency proceedings ........................ 83  

VIII. Sanctions ............................................................... 84  

IX. Conclusion: On articulation and codification ................................ 87  

1. The issue of definitions ................................................ 87  
2. Articulation ............................................................... 88  
   
   
   2.2. EWC Directive and the transfer of undertakings: Effects of structural change .................................................. 88  
   
   2.3. SE Directive and EWC Directive .................................................. 89  

3. The first test of the Maastricht Social Protocol: European works councils  
   
   Jon Erik Dølvik .................................................. 91  

   I. Background ............................................................. 91  
   
   II. The talks about talks ................................................ 95  
   
   III. Organizational and analytical lessons .................................. 99  

References ................................................................. 103  

Intersentia
4. The EWC in domestic and ECJ case law ........................................... 105

I. European works councils related litigation – Rationale for a systematic analysis

  Romuald Jagodziński ..................................................... 107

Summary ................................................................. 107
1. Existing legal studies on EWCs ........................................ 107
2. Background of the research project on EWC-related case law ...... 109
3. Research approach .................................................. 110
4. Conclusion ......................................................... 112
References ............................................................. 113

II. National reports ..................................................... 115

Austria

  Domenico Rief ........................................................... 115

Procedural part ......................................................... 115
1. List of the judgments ................................................ 115
   a. Austrian judgments: Kühne & Nagel AG & Co KG (Germany) v Kühne & Nagel GmbH (Austria) ............................................. 115
   b. Parties ................................................................. 115
   c. Stage of the procedure ........................................... 116
2. Procedure to take legal action ........................................ 116
   a. Standing ............................................................. 116
   b. Financial costs of the legal procedure ......................... 118
3. Judicial interpretation of Article 6 and Article 13 Agreements ........................................... 120
   Substantial part ...................................................... 120
   1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 agreements .................................................. 120
   2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers (‘representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational establishments and of enterprises ................................................. 120
      a. Decision of the Court of first instance ....................... 121
      b. Decision by the Court of Appeals ......................... 123
      c. Decision by the Supreme Court ............................ 123
      d. Comment ......................................................... 125
   3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European works council ................................................. 126
   4. Legal issues of Article 6 Agreements ................................ 126
   5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC ................................ 126

Intersentia
Contents

6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ........................................ 126
7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation .............. 126
8. External restrictions to information and consultation ...................................................................... 126
9. Subsidiary requirements .................................................................................................................. 126
10. Other issues ...................................................................................................................................... 126

Belgium

FILIP DORSEMONT ................................................................. 127

Procedural part ........................................................................................................................................ 127
1. List of all the cases .............................................................................................................................. 127
2. Procedure to take legal action .......................................................................................................... 128
3. Judicial interpretation of Article 6 and Article 13 agreements .................................................................. 130
4. Judicial and territorial competence ................................................................................................... 130

Substantial part ....................................................................................................................................... 130
1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 agreements .................................................................................. 130
   a. Facts .................................................................................................................................................. 131
   b. Ruling ............................................................................................................................................... 132
   c. Anticipatory agreements and representativity .................................................................................. 132
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers (‘representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational undertakings or groups of undertakings .............................................................................. 136
3. “The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European Works Council” ................................................................. 136
4. Legal issues of Article 6 agreements ................................................................................................. 136
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC ............................................................................................... 136
6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ...................................................................... 136
   a. Facts .................................................................................................................................................. 136
   b. Ruling ............................................................................................................................................... 137
   c. Assessment ...................................................................................................................................... 138
   d. Sanctions in case of violation of the information and consultation procedure ........................................ 138
7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation .............. 138
8. External restrictions to information and consultation .......................................................................... 138
9. Subsidiary requirements ................................................................................................................... 138
10. Other issues ...................................................................................................................................... 139
France

RACHID BRIHI ................................................................. 141

Introduction ................................................................. 141
Procedural part ............................................................ 141
1. List of all cases ......................................................... 141
2. Standing of the EWC: the issue of legal personality .......... 142
3. Procedure to take legal action ...................................... 143
Substantial part ............................................................ 144
1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 Agreements ................................................................. 144
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers (‘representatives) of the community-scale dimension of transnational undertakings or groups of undertakings ........................................ 144
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European works council ................................ 144
4. Legal issues of Article 6 Agreements .......................... 144
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC ...................... 144
6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure a. On the EWC’s right to information ......................... 144
b. On the EWC’s right to consultation ............................ 146
c. What sanctions should there be for the rights of the EWC? .... 152
7. On the links between the EWC and the national bodies for the representation of workers ..................... 154
8. External restrictions to information and consultation ...... 156
9. Subsidiary requirements ............................................. 156
10. Other issues: towards the affirmation of a true transnational stakeholder? ............................................. 156

Germany

THOMAS BLANKE ................................................................. 159

List of abbreviations .................................................... 159
1. Case studies ............................................................. 159
1.1. Schneider Electric: Review of the appointment of national employees’ representatives to the EWC – national jurisdiction . . 159
1.2. Forbo: The European works council does not supersede national participation rights ........................................ 162
1.3. Valora/Stielke: Priority of the request to set up a Special Negotiating Body pursuant to §9 EBRG over a judicial declaration of the invalidity of an agreement in accordance with §41 EBRG (= Article 13 Directive) ........................................ 164
1.4. British Airways: Injunctive relief for the European Works Council in the case of a failure to consult in temporary injunction proceedings and inadmissibility of the cautioning of a EWC chairperson because she visited a works council abroad (Vienna) in connection with outsourcing measures .......... 166


2. Judgment of the Labour Court of Düsseldorf (19.3.2008): Inadmissibility of the cautioning of the EWC chair on account of a visit to a works council abroad (Austria) with regard to an outsourcing matter .................. 168

1.5. Junk/Kühnel: Timeliness of the consultation procedure ........ 170

1.6. Jungheinrich: Free choice of venue for the EWC committee and the scope of the information obligation – no decision on the merits ............................................. 172

1.7-8-9 Bo-frost, Kühne & Nagel, ADS Anker: The right to information in accordance with Article 11, subsection 2 EWC Directive (§5, subsection 1 and 2 EBRG) .............. 173

1.7. Bo-frost: Claim for information by the EWC for the purpose of clarifying the scope of application of the EBRG .. 175

1. History of the proceedings and central legal issues ....... 175

2. The reception of the ECJ decision in the German literature .................................................. 178

3. The decision of the first division of the Federal Labour Court of 30.3.2004: The right to information presupposes a certain real probability if the directive is to be applicable .................... 179

4. The internal right to information between undertakings . 180

1.8. Kühne & Nagel: Horizontal request for information by the deemed central management against all group undertakings 181

1. Facts of the case: Judicial proceedings in connection with preparing an application ......................... 181

2. Judicial proceedings to assert the right to information ... 183

3. Enforcement of adjudicated claims ....................... 185

4. The central works council’s own efforts .................. 186

5. Alternative courses of action and evaluation: Self-constitution of a EWC? ................................. 186

1.9. ADS Anker: ‘Horizontal’ right to information also against a foreign parent company ........................... 188

1.10. General summary of cases VII–IX: Need for further proceedings ........................................... 189

1.11. Crawford Tar: No information ............................... 191
2. European works councils – A foreign body in German law? ....... 191

The Netherlands
Robbert van het Kaar ........................................... 193

I. Procedural part ............................................. 193
   1. List of cases ............................................. 193
   2. Legal standing ........................................ 193
   3. Costs .................................................... 193
   4. Role of trade unions .................................. 194
   5. Interpretation of judges .............................. 194
   6. Forum .................................................... 194
II. Substantial part ........................................... 194
   1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the
grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related
to Article 13 agreements .................................. 194
   2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers
(‘representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of
transnational undertakings or groups of undertakings .......... 194
   3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment
of a European works council ................................ 194
   4. Legal issues of Article 6 agreements ................. 197
   5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC ............... 197
   6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure 197
   7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national
bodies of employee representation .......................... 197
   8. External restrictions to information and consultation .......... 197
   9. Subsidiary requirements ............................... 197
   10. Other issues .......................................... 197
References ...................................................... 198

Slovak Republic
Maria Svořenová .............................................. 199

Procedural part ............................................. 199
1. List of all the cases ..................................... 199
2. Procedure to take legal action ......................... 200
3. Financial costs of legal proceedings ................. 200
4. The role of trade unions ................................ 201
5. Judicial interpretation of Article 6 and 13 Agreements .... 201
6. Judicial and territorial competence ..................... 201
Substantial part ................................................................. 201
1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 agreements ..................................................... 201
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers (representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational undertakings and of groups of undertakings ......................................... 201
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishing of a European works council ........................................ 202
   a. Legal framework .................................................. 202
   b. Summary ......................................................... 203
   c. Commentary .................................................... 205
4. Legal issues of Article 6 agreements .................................. 206
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC .............................. 206
6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ... 206
7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation ............................ 206
8. External restrictions to information and consultation ............... 206
9. Subsidiary requirements .............................................. 206
10. Other issues ........................................................... 206

Sweden

MAGNUS LUNDBERG ....................................................... 207

Procedural part ............................................................... 207
List of all the cases ........................................................... 207
Substantial part ............................................................. 207
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers (representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational undertakings and of groups of undertakings ......................................... 207
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European works council ........................................ 207
   a. Background .................................................. 207
   b. The legal issue .............................................. 208
4. Legal issues of Article 6 agreements .................................. 211
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC .............................. 211
6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ... 211
7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation ............................ 211
8. External restrictions to information and consultation ............... 211

xvi

Intersentia
9. Subsidiary requirements .................................................. 212
10. Other issues ................................................................. 212
References ........................................................................ 212

United Kingdom
PASCAL LORBER ............................................................... 213

Procedural part .................................................................. 214
1. List of all cases ............................................................... 214
2. Procedure to take legal action ......................................... 216
   a. Standing ................................................................. 216
   b. Financial cost of the legal procedure.......................... 217
   c. Role of trade unions .................................................. 217
3. Judicial interpretation of Article 6 and 13 agreements .......... 217
4. Judicial and territorial competence .................................. 218

Substantial part .................................................................. 219
Thematic Analysis Structure ................................................ 219
1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive) ....................... 219
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers ('representatives') of the Community-scale dimension of transnational establishments and of enterprises ...................................... 220
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European works council ................................ 221
   a. EWC1/2004 Mr. Haines, Ms. Dickson & Mr. Plews and The British Council .................................................. 221
   b. EWC4/2008 Unite the Union and Easyjet ...................... 222
4. Legal issues of Article 6 agreements ................................ 223
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC .............................. 223
6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ................................................................. 223
7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation ...................... 223
8. External restrictions to information and consultation ........ 223
9. Subsidiary requirements .................................................. 223
10. Other issues ................................................................. 223

FILIP DORSSEMONT ........................................................... 225

Procedural and general issues .............................................. 225
Procedural issues ............................................................... 225
1. The EWC and Recast Directive ....................................... 225

Intersentia
## Contents

2. The reported case law: litigation in four stages .......................... 226
   a. Legal disputes prior to the start of negotiations .................... 227
   b. Legal disputes which arise at the start or during the negotiations . 228
   c. Legal disputes at the start and in the course of a statutory or
      conventional EWC .................................................. 229
   d. Legal disputes subsequent to the expiry or the termination of the
      agreements ......................................................... 233
3. The standing of the European Works Council ............................... 233
4. The domestic Courts and the issue of interpretation .................... 235
5. Private International Law Issues: the issue of competence and
   standing ............................................................. 238

**Substantial issues** ................................................. 241

1. The exemption from the “obligations arising from the EWC
   Directive”: the validity of existing agreements challenged ............ 241
2. Legal issues related to the assessment of the Community-scale
   dimension of transnational establishments and of enterprises ........ 243
3. The designation of national workers’ representatives .................... 248
4. Issues related to the internal Functioning of the SNB and the EWC
   in view of the new Recast Directive .................................. 250
5. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ... 253
   a. The competence of the EWC regarding transnational matters .... 253
   b. The right to information and consultation within the Recast
      Directive ............................................................ 256
   c. Quality of the information and consultation procedure .......... 260
   d. Time is of the essence ............................................ 261
   e. Sanctions in the case of violation of the information and
      consultation procedure ........................................... 261
6. Issues related to the termination of an Article 6 agreement ............ 262
7. External restrictions to information and consultation .................... 263
8. Articulation or *concordantia* with other EC instruments related to
   worker involvement .................................................. 264

**Conclusions** .......................................................... 268

### IV. Format for the national reports related to EWC case law

**Filip Dorssemont** .................................................... 271

Procedural part .......................................................... 271
Substantial part .......................................................... 272
Third part: Collected materials ........................................... 272
   Thematic analysis structure (cf. second part) ......................... 273
   1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the
      grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive) ..................... 273
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers ('representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational undertaking and groups of undertakings ............ 273
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European Works Council ................................. 273
4. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC .................................. 273
5. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure 274
   a. Content and space ...................................................... 274
   b. Time is of the essence ................................................. 274
   c. Quality of the information and consultation procedure .... 274
d. Sanctions in case of violation of the information and consultation procedure .............................................. 274
7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation ......................... 274
8. External restrictions to information and consultation .......... 275
9. Subsidiary requirements .................................................. 275
10. Other issues ........................................................................ 275

B. THE RECAST OF THE EWC DIRECTIVE (2009/38)

   SÉVÉRINE PICARD ............................................................ 279

   I. The recasting technique: the EU legislator in a straightjacket ........ 280
      1. Recast vs revision – definitions and procedural consequences ...... 280
      2. Political consequences of the recast – a limited agenda for reform 282

   II. ‘Back to the future’ – the scope ratione temporis of the Recast Directive ................................................................. 283
      1. No obligation to renegotiate existing agreements ................. 284
      2. A tailored application of the new rules to existing agreements .... 284

   III. Towards a unification of the applicable regime to all company agreements? The key role of the adaptation clause ............ 290

2. Review, revision or recast? The quest for an amended EWC Directive
   ROMUALD JAGODZIŃSKI ..................................................... 293

   Introduction ........................................................................... 293
   I. The prelude to the EWC Directive of 1994 ................................. 294
   II. The first missed deadline for revision ...................................... 294
   III. Position of the European Trade Union Confederation ............ 295
   IV. The employers’ organisations ................................................ 296
   V. 2008: The final phase in the quest for a EWC revision ............. 297
3. Information and consultation in the Recast Directive

CORINNE SACHS-DURAND ........................................... 313

Introduction ................................................................. 313
I. Comparison between different concepts of information-consultation ........ 315
   1. The notion of information and consultation ................................ 315
      1.1. Effectiveness of information and consultation ...................... 315
          a. Effectiveness for the workers ...................................... 315
          b. Effectiveness for the employers .................................... 315
      1.2. The definitions ...................................................... 316
          a. The information ...................................................... 316
          b. The consultation .................................................... 317
          c. The relation with contractual autonomy ........................... 318
          d. Information and consultation in the subsidiary requirements .... 318
   2. Anticipation and action ............................................ 319
II. Will the new concept of information and consultation be effective? ...... 321
   1. The agreements: a possible evolution? .................................... 321
   2. The case law: some tracks for the interpretation of the recast directive? 323
      2.1. The autonomy of the EWC concerning the content of the information ............................................................ 323
      2.2. The necessary quality of the information ............................ 324
      2.3. The respect of a time schedule allowing the workers' representatives to play their role ........................................ 324
      2.4. The powers of the judge (in France) to modify the process, if necessary ......................................................... 325

4. Who is first? The correct timing of information and consultation of European works councils in relation to national rights of worker involvement

THOMAS BLANKE and EDGAR ROSE ................................. 327

I. The relevance of correct timing of information and consultation .......... 327
II. The correct time for information and consultation of the EWC .......... 329
1. Concept and transposition of old EWC Directive 94/45 330
   1.1. The concept of Directive 94/45 330
   1.2. Fall-back provisions of national transposition law 333
   1.3. EWC agreements: French and German regulations at group or company level compared 336
      1.3.1. German agreements 337
      1.3.2. French agreements 338
      1.3.3. Comparison 339
   1.4. Court decisions 340
2. Concept of Recast Directive 2009/38 342
III. Priority regulations concerning the succession of supranational and national information and consultation procedures 344
   1. Priority regulations in times of EWC Directive 94/45 344
      1.1. Early information and consultation of national bodies in France and Germany 345
      1.2. Priority regulations in selected EWC agreements 347
      1.3. Solutions in court decisions 348
IV. Conclusions: The progress made by the EWC Recast Directive 2009/38 352
References 355

5. EWC’s role recast: A European actor? 357
   JOSEE J.M. LAMERS 357

I. Introduction 357
   1. Two directives, two directions? 357
   2. Setup: the European role to play 358
II. The principles of the EWC Directives 359
   1. Why we have a framework solution 359
      1.1. Autonomy: a key principle 360
      1.2. Autonomy v mandatory report back 361
      1.3. Autonomy v transnational competence 362
      1.4. Autonomy v negotiating transnational texts 364
   2. Subsidiarity 364
      2.1. Subsidiarity v competence EU 364
      2.2. Hierarchy of powers 365
      2.3. Subsidiarity v nomination employees’ representatives 365
      2.4. Subsidiarity v insiders, court ruling 366
      2.5. Subsidiarity v confidentiality 367
      2.6. Subsidiarity v duration national mandates 368
   3. Proportionality 368
   4. Equality 370
4.1. Equality v equal access to top management .......... 370
4.2. Equality v equal representation .......................... 371
5. Flexible rule .............................................. 371
6. Spirit of cooperation ....................................... 371
7. Effectiveness .............................................. 372
8. Useful effect .............................................. 372
9. Fundamental rights ....................................... 373
10. Concluding remarks about the principles ................. 373

III. The dialogue of the EWC with central management .... 374
1. The effectiveness of the dialogue .......................... 374
2. Standard setting by courts .................................. 375
3. Linking European consultation with local levels ......... 378
4. The representation status of the EWC ....................... 381
5. Negotiating transnational agreements ...................... 383
6. The relation with the trade unions ......................... 385

IV. EWCs development and European actor? .................. 387
V. Training and time off for EWC members ................. 388
VI. Concluding remarks ..................................... 392
References .................................................. 395

6. Can the Recast Directive bring more and more effective EWCs?
PETER KERCKHOFS ............................................. 399

I. Facilitating new EWCs ....................................... 400
1. The extending geographical scope increased the number of missing EWCs ......................... 401
2. Preparing for the written demand to start the setting up of a EWC .............................................. 402
3. Legal incentives to start the process of setting up EWCs .................. 404
4. Help for SNBs to establish missing EWCs ................ 405

II. Upgrading existing EWCs ................................... 408
1. Legal upgrading of existing EWCs ......................... 408
   1.1. What kind of legal upgrading can existing EWCs benefit from? .............................................. 408
   1.2. Different timing of the legal upgrading of existing EWCs ............................................. 409
2. The shadow of the Subsidiary Requirements of the Recast Directive .............................................. 410
   2.1. The impact of the subsidiary requirements on EWC negotiations ............................................. 411
   2.2. Changes in the subsidiary requirements of the Recast Directive ............................................. 412

III. Effect on actors providing support for EWCs ................. 413
1. Different social partner recommendations in the transition period 414
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. More consensus-oriented approaches may prevail</td>
<td>415</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Conclusions</td>
<td>416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTORS

Thomas Blanke (born 1944) is Professor of law. Since 1972 member of the editorial board of Kritische Justiz. 1975 to March 2009 Professor of labour law at the Carl v. Ossietzky University in Oldenburg (Germany). 1991/1992 Vicepresident of the University. Until 2006 member of the advisory board of the Hanse-Wissenschaftskolleg an Institute for advanced studies and foundation belonging to the Länder of Lower Saxony and Bemen. Former president of the cooperation committee of German Trade Unions and the University of Oldenburg. Member of the ETUI Transnational Trade Union Rights Expert Group.

Rachid Brihi is an avocat at the Barreau of Paris. He has been practicing law since 1988 as a labour law specialist, in particular as a legal council of various European Works Councils. In that capacity he contributed to the development of the case law on European Works Councils confronted with restructuring (e.g. during the closure of the Renault Vilvoorde plant in 1997, acting as a council for the Comité Européen Renault).

He participated to numerous conferences, as a specialist of European Works Councils (in particular those organised by the ETUC). He is a lecturer at the Université Paris Ouest (seminaires de pratique du droit social communautaire).

Jon Erik Dølvik is a sociologist, dr. philos, and head of Research at Fafo Institute for Labour and Social Research in Oslo. He has been engaged in a range of comparative studies of labour market governance and employment relations in Europe. Besides his work at Fafo since 1983, Dølvik has been visiting scholar at Wissenschaftzentrum Berlin (1985/86), ETUI in Brussels (1992/93), ARENA at University of Oslo (1995/96), Berkeley (1999/2000), and Center for European Studies at Harvard University (2007/8). He is member of the Editorial Panel of European Journal of Industrial Relations and Transfer European Review of Labour and Research.

Filip Dorssemont graduated in Law in 1993 (Antwerp University) and in Philosophy in 1994 (Leuven University). He became doctor in Law in 2001 (Antwerp University) on a doctoral dissertation in the field of comparative labour law (The legal status of representative trade unions and trade union action). He was an academic assistant at Antwerp University (1993–2002) and Lecturer at Antwerp University (2002–2004) and Utrecht University (2002–2008). In 2008 he was able
to return to his home country due to a Mandat d’Impulsion Scientifique (Ulysse) which was granted by the Belgian Fonds national de la Recherche Scientifique (2008) of the Communauté française. He is hosted as Professor of Labour Law at the Université Catholique de Louvain (Louvain-La-Neuve) (2008). He was invited as Guest Professor at the Université Robert Schumann de Strasbourg (2001); Cassino University (2002) and Universita statale di Milano (2008–2009–2010) to teach Community labour law.

Romuald Jagodziński, Graduated in International Relations (European Studies) in 2004 (University of Poznan, Poland); scholarship in international relations at the University of Bamberg (Germany) in 2001–2002 and European University Viadrina in Frankfurt/Oder in 2003–2004. Continued education on in postgraduate studies (European Law) and obtained Master of European Studies from the College of Europe in Hamburg (Germany) in 2005. Has been working at the European Trade Union Institute since January 2006 as researcher (earlier as a freelance guest researcher in 2002 and 2004). At ETUI responsible for research in the area of worker representation and European Works Councils, including the ETUI European Works Councils database (www.ewcdb.eu).

Peter Kerckhofs graduated as Social Worker in 1991 (KHK Geel) and in International Political Science in 1996 (UCL Louvain-la-Neuve) with a dissertation on the 1994 EWC Directive, that was published in French in Courrier Hebdomadaire of CRISP and in Japanese in the Journal of the Ohara Institute of Social Research. From 1997 to 2005, he worked as a researcher for the European Trade Union Institute, mainly on the EWC database identifying the multinationals covered by the EWC directive and analyzing EWC agreements. Results of this research were published in the European Trade Union Yearbook and in EWC facts and figures. As seconded expert he contributed in 2002 to a policy report of CEDEFOP on Lifelong Learning. Since 2005, he works as political secretary for EMCEF, the European Mine, Chemical and Energy workers’ Federation. In 2007, Peter Kerckhofs became doctor of Philosophy (University of Manchester) with a doctoral dissertation on EWC developments.

Csilla Kollonay Lehoczky is a Professor of Law and Chair of the Labour and Social Law Department at the Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest and also is a Professor of Law at the Central European University, an international post-graduate university in Budapest, Hungary. Since 2001 is a member of the European Committee of Social Rights, the independent expert body of the Council of Europe supervising the implementation of the European Social Charter. She is a member of the network of European gender equality law experts, working for the Commission of the European Union and worked as a member of the expert committee on flexicurity appointed also by the Commission of the European Union. She is a member of the international academic advisory board.
of the ETUI-REHS the research and training institute of the European Trade Union Confederation. She has been a visiting professor at Stanford Law School, the University of Illinois College of Business Administration, and the Johann Wolfgang Goethe University of Frankfurt of Main, Faculty of Law. Her field of teaching and publications cover various areas of labour and employment law, social protection, and equal opportunities law.

Josee Lamers graduated in Law in 1995 at the University of Amsterdam. She got a position as a researcher at the Sinzheimer Institute of the University of Amsterdam and published on “The added value of European Works Councils”. She became coordinator of the post graduate courses on European Labour Relations and on Modernizing Collective Labour Agreements. In 1998 she became Secretary International Affairs at the General Employers Association and set up the international activities for the departments. During a restructuring and merger process in 2007 which had an impact on international activities, she left the employers’ organisation. Since 2008 she is director/owner of Lamers ICM Consultancy (www.lamers-icmconsultancy.com), advising management and also workers’ representatives about international and European social issues. She writes for various (legal) magazines about European social affairs.

Pascale Lorber is a lecturer at the School of Law of the University of Leicester. She graduated from the University of Strasbourg (Maitrise droit social) and the University of Leicester (LLM). She teaches UK employment and European social policy. Her research interests are in collective aspects of employment law and atypical workers.

Magnus Lundberg graduated in Law in 2003 (Uppsala University). He has worked as teacher in European law and labour law at Uppsala University (2003–2004), and as researcher at the National Institute for Working Life in Sweden (2004–2006). Between 2007 and 2008 he upheld the position as policy officer at UNI-Europa Finance in Brussels. He is currently deputy general secretary for the Nordic Financial Unions (NFU), located in Stockholm.

Séverine Picard graduated in law in 2000 (Université La Sorbonne, Paris) and completed a Masters in European Law and Policy in 2002 (University of Manchester). She has previously worked as a Research Assistant on European issues in UK based Research institutes (2002-2004) and as a Parliamentary Assistant in the European Parliament (2004-2007). In 2007, she became a Legal Adviser at the European Trade Union Confederation where she has been closely involved in the negotiation and adoption of the Recast European Works Council Directive.
Domenico Rief graduated in law after his studies at the University of Innsbruck and the University of Alcalá de Henares and became doctor in law in the year 2000 (University of Innsbruck). In 2004 he finished his post-graduate studies at the University of Applied Sciences Schloss Hofen (Vorarlberg) with a master in European law. After a traineeship at the Court of Innsbruck and at the department of European relations of the Tyrolean government he was solicitor for labour law at the Chamber of Labour of Tyrol (2001–2005). Since 2005 he is head of the European desk at the Chamber of Labour and since 2008 lecturer of international labour and social law at the University Management Center Innsbruck. Dr. Rief published several articles in Austrian and German labour and social law journals (e.g. Das Recht der Arbeit – DRdA, Zeitschrift für europäisches Sozial- und Arbeitsrecht – ZESAR) and was co-author of the publication of the European Commission “Termination of employment relationships” (2006).

Edgar Rose graduated in Law in 1989 (Bremen University). After various research activities in politics and the law of the welfare state he became a doctor in law in 2005 (Oldenburg University). The topic of the doctoral dissertation concerned challenges to the law of collective wage formation. He works now as a researcher and lecturer at Oldenburg University focusing on consumer protection law, health and safety at work regulation and European labour law.

Corinne Sachs-Durand became a doctor in law in 1982 (Université Robert Schuman, Strasbourg) on the theme of the thresholds in labour law. After being an academic assistant and a lecturer she became a full professor in Labour law in the University of Strasbourg in 2001 (internal French agregation). She is teaching in the Institut du travail of Strasbourg, dedicated to the training of trade unioners in labour law. She also teaches internal Labour law and Community labour law in the master 2 in social law of the University of Strasbourg. She has reponsabilities in a French national revue in labour law and belongs to an international european network EWL, (European Working Group in Labour Law). This group is organising yearly international student seminars, symposiums and issues regular publications.

Maria Svorenova graduated in Law in 1984 on Comenius University, Bratislava, Slovakia. She has been postgraduated in Law in 1988 on Faculty of Law, Safarik University, Kosice, Slovakia and in 1999 in European Substantive Law, Comparative Social Policy and Public Policy Administration on Brunel University, London, United Kingdom. Since 1992 she works as the social policy and legal adviser at the Trade Unions Confederation of the Slovak Republic. She is member of several working groups of the European Trade Union Confederation like NETLEX (the Network of the Trade Unions Legal Experts) and the Social Policy and Legislation Working Group as well as the Slovak Trade Unions. She is co-author of the study “Social Protection Expenditure and Performance Review”
published by the ILO-CEET in Budapest in 2005 and published many expert articles.

Dr. Robbert H. van het Kaar (1957) studied Sociology and received his Degree in Economics in 1998 from the University of Amsterdam. In 1993 he published his dissertation in the field of Law and Industrial Relations. As of 1994 he has been affiliated to several interdisciplinary research groups on Labour Law, Industrial Relations and Company Law, both at the Faculty of Law and the Faculty of Economics and Econometrics of the University of Amsterdam. Currently he is working as a Senior Researcher at the Hugo Sinzheimer Institute for Socio-legal research on Labour and Social Security.

Since 1997 he is the Dutch correspondent for the European Observatory for Industrial Relations (EIRO) and since 2003 a member of SEEurope, a research network on employee participation at company level.