

R.R. Verkerk

Fact-Finding in Civil Litigation

A Comparative Perspective



Ius Commune Europaeum

Remme Verkerk
PhD thesis

Fact-Finding in Civil Litigation. A Comparative Perspective

ISBN 978-94-000-0074-2
D/2010/7849/83
NUR 822

© 2010 Intersentia
Antwerp - Oxford - Portland
www.intersentia.com

Cover photograph © Kuzma - Dreamstime.com

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photo copy, micro-film or any other means, without written permission from the author.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Dit boek vormt de afsluiting van een project waar ik meerdere jaren aan heb gewerkt. Een bijzondere periode, waarin ik veel heb mogen leren. Een periode waarin ik vrijwel zonder uitzondering met plezier 's ochtends mijn kantoor binnenstapte. De rust van het onderzoek werd vaak afgewisseld met de gezellige drukte van het onderwijs.

Tijdens de afgelopen jaren heb ik mijn werkzaamheden met veel collegae besproken. Ik heb veel mogen leren van de talloze gesprekken die in formele en informele settings plaatsvonden. Een speciaal dankwoord voor mijn beide promotoren is hier zeker op zijn plaats. Jaap en Remco, jullie hebben me beiden gesteund, vertrouwen gegeven en me gevraagd en ongevraagd van advies voorzien. Eveneens wil ik alle andere collegae aan de faculteit bedanken, met velen heb ik samen onderwijs verzorgd, congressen bezocht en regelmatig een praatje gemaakt. Door jullie aanwezigheid is werken zoveel meer geweest dan het verrichten van werkzaamheden. Ik hoop jullie ook in de toekomst nog vaak te treffen.

I also would like to address the many colleagues that have provided me with very valuable assistance writing this book. First of all, I thank the members of the Assessment Committee, that have put a lot of effort reading the manuscript. Their comments and suggestions have improved the quality of this book. I would like to thank colleagues at the University of Vienna and those at Wayne State University for their assistance. I would like to express gratitude to the many American academics and practitioners that have helped me to understand the American procedural system. Without their assistance, it would not have been possible to understand the operation of the American procedural system.

Verder een woord van dank aan de vele anderen die dit werk mogelijk gemaakt hebben. Een woord van dank aan de Rechtbank Maastricht, waar ik een unieke mogelijkheid gekregen heb het Nederlands burgerlijk procesrecht zelf toe te passen. Eveneens wil ik hen bedanken die mij hebben bijgestaan met de afronding en opmaak van dit boek.

Acknowledgements

Tot slot een woord van dank aan mijn vrienden, ouders en familie. In het bijzonder een woord van dank aan Femmie: de rust en liefde die ik thuis ervaren heb, is mijn werk enkel ten goede gekomen. Verder nog een vriendelijk woord voor Lucas en Thijs: zonder jullie was dit boek veel eerder afgerond, maar had mijn werk veel minder betekenis.

Remme Verkerk
Maastricht, maart 2010

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	v
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xiii
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION.....	1
1. The Subject Matter of this Book: Fact-finding in Civil Litigation	1
2. Research Questions and General Overview	4
PART I: GENERAL HISTORIC AND COMPARATIVE INTRODUCTION	
Introduction	11
CHAPTER 2: A CONCISE HISTORY OF FACT-FINDING ON THE EUROPEAN CONTINENT	13
1. Procedure in Medieval and Early Modern Times	13
1.1. The Romano-Canonical Model.....	13
1.2. The Influence of the Romano-Canonical Model	19
2. The Early Codification of Procedural Law	22
2.1. Early Austrian Codifications	23
2.2. The 1806 French Code of Civil Procedure	25
2.3. The 1838 Dutch Code of Civil Procedure.....	26
3. Modern Codifications of Procedural Law	33
3.1. The 1895 Austrian Code of Civil Procedure	33
3.1.1. Introduction of the Austrian Code of Civil Procedure	33
3.1.2. The Leading Principles and Innovations of the Austrian Code.....	35
3.1.3. The Austrian Procedural System since 1895.....	38
3.1.4. The Operation of the Austrian Code in Legal Practice	41

3.2.	The Incremental Reform of the Dutch Code of Civil Procedure	45
3.2.1.	Many Proposals, Few Changes, 1838-1959	45
3.2.2.	The Incremental Reform of Dutch Civil Procedure.....	49
4.	The Present Continental Procedural Landscape.....	62
4.1.	The Renewed Structure of the Proceedings.....	62
4.2.	The Rise of Disclosure and Discovery	66
4.2.1.	Demise of the <i>nemo tenetur edere contra se</i> Principle.....	66
4.2.2.	Increased Duties to Provide Information.....	69
4.2.3.	Orders to Produce Evidence.....	72
4.3.	The Deformalization of the Law of Evidence.....	75
4.4.	The Demise of the Adversarial System	76
CHAPTER 3: FACT-GATHERING AND EVIDENCE IN ANGLO-AMERICAN LEGAL HISTORY.....		79
1.	The English Roots of the United States' Procedural System	79
1.1.	Fact Gathering and Evidence in Early English Law	80
1.1.1.	The English Common Law	80
1.1.2.	The Court of Chancery	85
1.2.	Early Modes of Fact Gathering and Evidence in the United States.....	86
1.2.1.	The Early United States Court System	86
1.2.2.	Fact-Finding during the late 18 th and the early 19 th Century	87
1.2.3.	Evidence in the Late 18 th Century and the Early 19 th Century	89
2.	The Codification of Procedural Law	94
2.1.	The Early Codifications.....	94
2.1.1.	The 1805 Louisiana Code of Procedure.....	94
2.1.2.	The New York Field Code	95
2.2.	The Codification of Federal Law.....	98
2.2.1.	The Procedure in the Federal Courts Prior to 1938	98
2.2.2.	The 1938 Federal Rules on Civil Procedure.....	100
2.2.3.	The Codification of the Law on Evidence.....	111
3.	Recent Developments.....	115
3.1.	Critique of the Inefficiency of American Litigation.....	115
3.2.	The Recent History of Discovery: A History of Abuse	116
3.3.	Case Management.....	122
4.	The New Procedural Landscape.....	126
4.1.	Developments in Pleading.....	127
4.2.	The New Middle Phase in Litigation.....	128
4.3.	The Decline of Trials.....	130
4.4.	Conclusion: the Privatization of Fact-Gathering	135

CHAPTER 4: FACT-FINDING: A CONCISE GENERAL COMPARISON.....	139
1. Legal Transplants and the Divergence of Laws.....	139
2. Fact-finding Processes: the Main Differences.....	143
2.1. Concentrated and Dispersed Processes	143
2.2. Different Roles of the Actors in the Legal Process.....	147
2.3. Comparing Fact-finding Processes: the Duration of Litigation	150
PART II: SPECIFIC CHAPTERS ON COMPARATIVE CIVIL PROCEDURE	
Introduction	157
CHAPTER 5: EXPERT EVIDENCE	159
1. The Continental Expert as an Auxiliary of the Court.....	159
1.1. Expertise and its Relation to Judicial Case Management	159
1.2. Court-appointed Experts in Continental Jurisdictions	161
1.3. Fair Trial and the Limits of Court-driven Expertise.....	165
1.4. The Danger of a too Influential Expert.....	168
2. Party-Appointed Experts	170
2.1. Austria	170
2.2. Expert Witnesses in the United States.....	171
2.3. Party-appointed Experts in the Netherlands	177
3. Comparative Lessons and Mixed Models	179
3.1. A Mixed Model: The Single Joint Expert in English Law	179
3.2. The Attractiveness of the Mixed Model.....	181
3.3. Comparative Lessons	182
CHAPTER 6: DISCOVERY AND PARTY INTERROGATION	185
1. History of Party Interrogation.....	185
1.1. Written Interrogatories: A Shared Historic Background	185
1.2. Diverging Modes of Fact-Discovery	192
1.2.1. The Continent: Personal Appearance of the Parties.....	193
1.2.2. Pretrial Conferences in American Law	201
1.2.3. Anglo-American Law: Fact Discovery	203
1.2.4. Party-driven Fact-Discovery on the Continent	210
1.3. Interrogation of Parties as Evidence.....	212
1.3.1. Formal Party Oaths.....	212
1.3.2. Hearing the Parties as Witnesses	217

2.	Principles and Comparative Analysis	231
2.1.	The Practice of Party Interrogation.....	231
2.1.1.	The Frequency, Length and Duration of Party Interrogation.....	231
2.1.2.	The Costs, Effectiveness and Fairness of Party Interrogation.....	234
2.2.	Principles of Party Interrogation.....	239
2.2.1.	Evidence and Party Allegation.....	239
2.2.2.	Rigidity and Flexibility.....	241
2.2.3.	The Preparation of Testimony.....	242
2.2.4.	Direct and Indirect Sanctions	244
2.2.5.	The Scope and Admissibility of Party Interrogation.....	245
2.2.6.	Court-Directed and Party-Directed Modes of Examination.....	247
2.2.7.	Recording the Interrogation	248
2.3.	Diverging Principles in a Comparative Perspective	249

PART III: COMPARATIVE CIVIL LITIGATION: IDEOLOGY, THEORY AND PSYCHOLOGY

Introduction	255
--------------------	-----

CHAPTER 7: THE AUSTRIAN MODEL: A UTILITARIAN APPROACH TO CIVIL LITIGATION

CHAPTER 7: THE AUSTRIAN MODEL: A UTILITARIAN APPROACH TO CIVIL LITIGATION	257	
1.	The Social Model of Civil Procedure.....	257
1.1.	A Collectivistic Point of Departure.....	257
1.2.	A Utilitarian Perspective.....	260
1.3.	The Ends of Civil Litigation.....	262
2.	Refutation of the Adversarial System	264
2.1.	The Principles of Party-Disposition and Party-Presentation	264
2.2.	The Introduction of the Managerial Judge	267
3.	The Pursuit of Truth	269
3.1.	Formal and Substantive Truth	269
3.2.	The Pursuit of Truth: Practical Implementation	271
4.	Critical Observations	276

CHAPTER 8: A RECONSTRUCTION OF THE U.S. MODEL: DEMOCRACY AND ADVERSARIALISM

CHAPTER 8: A RECONSTRUCTION OF THE U.S. MODEL: DEMOCRACY AND ADVERSARIALISM	279	
1.	Introduction	279
2.	The Adversarial System	279
2.1.	Defining the Adversarial System.....	279
2.2.	The Rationale behind the Adversarial System.....	281

2.2.1.	Adversarialism and Premature Decisions	281
2.2.2.	The Adversarial System and Perceived Procedural Fairness.....	285
2.3.	The Influence of the Adversarial System on Fact-finding	288
3.	The Civil Jury.....	290
3.1.	Introduction	290
3.2.	The Rationale behind the Civil Jury	293
3.3.	The Influence of the Jury on the Process of Fact-Finding	296
4.	Critical Observations	299
CHAPTER 9: POLITICAL IDEOLOGY, DEMOCRACY AND THE DIVERSE FORMS OF PROCEDURE		301
1.	Introduction	301
2.	Procedure and the Role of the State.....	303
3.	Democracy, Rules and the Organization of Institutions.....	315
4.	Political Ideology, Democracy and the Forms of Procedure.....	324
PART IV: THE (IN)EFFICIENCY OF ADVERSARIAL JUSTICE		
CHAPTER 10: THE (IN)EFFICIENCY OF ADVERSARIAL JUSTICE		329
1.	Introduction: How Simple Cases become Complex Cases.....	329
2.	Efficient Fact-Finding Processes.....	332
3.	Adversarialism and Inefficiencies in Civil Litigation	335
3.1.	Adversarialism	335
3.2.	Adversarial Fact-Finding as a Competitive Game	337
3.3.	Adversarialism and Incentives to Obstruct the Pursuit of Truth	343
4.	Understanding Procedural Legislation.....	344
5.	Efficient Fact-finding: Comparative Remarks.....	350
CHAPTER 11: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION		357
1.	Historical Trends in the Process of Fact-finding.....	357
2.	Different Fact Finding Rules and Practices.....	362

Table of Contents

3.	Understanding Differences: Procedural Models and Rules	364
4.	Understanding Differences: Fact-finding Processes in Action.....	366
5.	Concluding Remarks	370
	SAMENVATTING. HET ONDERZOEK NAAR DE FEITEN IN HET CIVIELE PROCES, EEN RECHTSVERGELIJKEND PERSPECTIEF	371
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	381
	INDEX	435
	CURRICULUM VITAE	441

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ABA	American Bar Association
AcP	Archiv für de civilistische Praxis
ALI	American Law Institute
BlgNr	Beilage(n) zu den stenografischen Protokollen des Nationalrates
C.	Codex (Justinian, 533 A.D.)
CJRA	Civil Justice Reform Act
CPR	Civil Procedural Rules (England)
CEPEJ	The European Commission for the Efficiency of Justice
D.	Digest (533 A.D.)
ECJ	European Court of Justice
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EGZPO	Einführungsgesetz zur Zivilprozessordnung
FRCP	Federal Rules of Civil Procedure
FRD	Federal Rules Decisions
FRE	Federal Rules of Evidence
HNJV	Handelingen Nederlandse Juristen Vereniging
JBl	Juristische Blätter
JZ	Juristenzeitung
LJN	Landelijk Jurisprudentie Nummer
NCSC	National Center for State Courts
NJ	Nederlandse Jurisprudentie
NJB	Nederlands Juristenblad
NTBR	Nederlands Tijdschrift voor Burgerlijk Recht
NUCCUSL	National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws
ÖJZ	Österreichische Juristenzeitung
RGBI	Reichsgesetzblatt
Rv	Wetboek van Burgerlijke Rechtsvordering
RvdW	Rechtspraak van de Week
TCR	Tijdschrift voor Civiele Rechtspleging
Trema	Tijdschrift voor de Rechterlijke Macht
Unidroit	International Institute for the Unification of Private Law

List of Abbreviations

W.	Weekblad van het Recht
WODC	Wetenschappelijk Onderzoek- en Documentatiecentrum
WPNR	Weekblad voor Privaatrecht Notariaat en Registratie
ZPO	Zivilprozessordnung
ZZP	Zeitschrift für Zivilprozess
ZZPInt	Zeitschrift für Zivilprozess international