JUXTAPOSING LEGAL SYSTEMS AND THE PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW ON PARENTAL RESPONSIBILITIES
European Family Law Series

Published by the Organising Committee of the Commission on European Family Law

Prof. Katharina Boele-Woelki (Utrecht)
Prof. Frédérique Ferrand (Lyon)
Prof. Cristina González Beilfuss (Barcelona)
Prof. Maarit Jänterä-Jareborg (Uppsala)
Prof. Nigel Lowe (Cardiff)
Prof. Dieter Martiny (Frankfurt/Oder)
Prof. Walter Pintens (Leuven)
JUXTAPOSING LEGAL SYSTEMS AND THE PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW ON PARENTAL RESPONSIBILITIES

Edited by
Esin Örüçü and Jane Mair
Juxtaposing Legal Systems and the Principles of European Family Law on Parental Responsibilities
Esin Örücü and Jane Mair (eds.)

© 2010 Intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
www.intersentia.com

D/2010/7849/11
NUR 822

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.
We considered it worthwhile to produce once again an edited volume with the aim to assess the reality of legal systems in view of the Principles, and the Principles in view of the reality of these legal systems, following the publication of “Principles of European Family Law Regarding Parental Responsibilities” by the Commission on European Family Law (CEFL).

In the hope of creating a source of inspiration for legislators in the process of modernising their national family laws, the CEFL seeks “functional equivalence” and adopts both the “common core” and “better law” approaches. As a rule, the drafters choose “the best”, “the more functional” and the “most efficient” rules. Their touchstone is the modernisation of the law. Therefore, these CEFL Principles are not merely restatements of family laws in Europe, but contributions towards the establishment of a European Family Law.

Believing that only by empirical testing of the Principles in a number of legal systems can one demonstrate whether they are acceptable and/or are regarded as an improvement on existing national laws, we launched into our project. For our purposes, it was deemed appropriate first to test the Principles in the untested: Scotland, a mixed jurisdiction that has gained popularity within the European Union; Malta, a more recent EU member with a conservative background, Estonia, another more recent EU member with a socialist background; Romania, a new comer into the EU with a socialist background but a socio-culture different to Estonia; and finally Turkey, a country bridging eastern and western values and aspiring to membership of the EU. Next, the Principles were re-tested in two legal systems already considered by the CEFL: Denmark, a variation on the civilian theme, where changes have occurred in 2007 after the national report was prepared and the Principles formulated; and England, the mother of the common law tradition, where there are also some new developments.

The volume starts with an introductory overview and closes with a comparative assessment of our findings. Though this part considers the Principles as harmonious ideals, it is also critical of the shortfalls in the ideals as presented, and views the obstacles to harmonisation.
Preface

Our colleague Joelle Godard who had undertaken to contribute to our volume by juxtaposing the Principles to French law, as she had done in the previous volume on Divorce and Maintenance Between Former Spouses, recently suddenly passed away and we would like to dedicate this volume to her.

Jane Mair and Esin Örücü
1 April 2009
LIST OF AUTHORS

Canan Arin
Member of the Istanbul Bar Association, specialising in family law and criminal law (women’s rights and violence against women and minors)

Marieta Avram
Associate Professor, Vice-Dean, Law Faculty, University of Bucharest

Dr. Flavius A. Baias
Associate Professor, Dean, Law Faculty, University of Bucharest

Dr. Christina G. Jeppesen de Boer
Lecturer in family and comparative law, University of Utrecht

Dr. Ruth Farrugia
Advocate and Senior Lecturer in Civil Law, University of Malta

Stephen Gilmore
Senior Lecturer in Family Law at King’s College London

Triin Göttig
LL.M. (Kiel); Research Fellow of Civil Law, University of Tartu, Estonia

Liis Hallik
mag. iur.; Adjunct Instructor, Institute of Law, University of Tartu; Counsellor of the Civil Chamber, Supreme Court of the Republic of Estonia

Jonathan Herring
Fellow and Tutor in Law at Exeter College, University of Oxford.

Dr. Annette Kronborg
Associate Professor in family and inheritance law, University of Copenhagen

Dr. Jane Mair
Senior Lecturer in Law, University of Glasgow, Scotland
List of Authors

Cristina Nicolescu
Assistant, Law Faculty, University of Bucharest

Prof. Dr. Esin Örücü
Professor Emerita of Comparative Law and Honorary Senior Research Fellow, University of Glasgow, Professor Emerita of Comparative Law, Erasmus University Rotterdam

Dr. Rebecca Probert
Senior Lecturer in Private Law at the University of Warwick, England.

Ian Sharpe
B.A., LL.M., Advocate, Scotland

Dr. Triin Uusen-Nacke
Adjunct Instructor, Institute of Law, University of Tartu; Counsellor of the Civil Chamber, Supreme Court of the Republic of Estonia
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE ......................................................................................................................................................v

LIST OF AUTHORS ....................................................................................................................................... vii

INTRODUCTORY OVERVIEW

CATERING FOR DIVERSE CULTURES THROUGH HARMONISED NORMS

Es‘n Örüçü and Jane Mair ........................................................................................................ 3

1. Introducing the topic ............................................................................................................................. 3
   1.1. The European scene and the work of the Commission on European Family Law ......................... 4
   1.1.1. The European Scene ................................................................................................................. 4
   1.1.2. The work of the Commission on European Family Law (CEFL) .................................................. 6

2. The general outline of the principles .................................................................................................... 8

3. The aim of the present research ........................................................................................................ 12
   3.1. Inception ...................................................................................................................................... 12
   3.2. Choice of systems .......................................................................................................................... 13
   3.3. Assessment of legal systems and CEFL principles ........................................................................ 14

4. Concluding remarks ............................................................................................................................. 15

PART ONE – TESTING THE UNTESTED: CAN THERE BE ONE WAY FORWARD?

PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW REGARDING PARENTAL RESPONSIBILITIES AND THEIR IMPLICATIONS FOR ESTONIA

Liis Hallik, Triin Göttig and Triin Uusen-Nacke .................................................. 19

1. General .................................................................................................................................................. 19

2. Contents of parental responsibilities .................................................................................................. 21
   2.1. Care .............................................................................................................................................. 21
   2.2. Determination of residence ......................................................................................................... 22
# Table of Contents

2.3. Education ...................................................................................................... 23  
2.4. Religious upbringing ................................................................................... 24  
2.5. Disciplinary measures and corporal punishment .................................. 25  
2.6. Medical treatment ....................................................................................... 26  
2.7. Statutory representation ............................................................................. 26  
2.8. The child’s right to be heard ....................................................................... 27  
2.9. The right to administer the child’s property ........................................... 28  
3. Attribution of parental responsibilities ........................................................... 30  
3.1. Married and unmarried parents ................................................................ 30  
3.2. Other persons ............................................................................................... 34  
4. Exercise of parental responsibilities ................................................................. 39  
4.1. Interests of the child .................................................................................... 39  
4.2. Joint and sole parental responsibilities ..................................................... 40  
5. Contact ................................................................................................................. 41  
5.1. Contact with parents and other persons .................................................. 41  
5.2. Contact arrangements ................................................................................ 43  
5.3. Breach of the right to contact ..................................................................... 45  
6. Delegation of parental responsibilities ............................................................ 45  
7. Termination of parental responsibilities ......................................................... 45  
8. Discharge of parental responsibilities .............................................................. 46  
9. Procedural issues ............................................................................................... 49  
9.1. Competent authorities ................................................................................ 49  
9.2. Alternative dispute resolution mechanisms ............................................ 50  
9.3. The position of a child in proceedings ..................................................... 52  
9.4. Enforcement of agreements and orders ................................................... 53  
10. Summary .............................................................................................................. 55  

## PRINCIPLES RELATING TO PARENTAL RESPONSIBILITY AND AUTHORITY IN MALTA  
RUTH FARRUGIA .................................................................................................. 61

1. Introduction ......................................................................................................... 61  
2. Definitions .......................................................................................................... 62  
3. Rights of the child ............................................................................................. 70  
4. Parental responsibilities of parents and third persons ................................... 74  
5. Exercise of parental responsibilities ................................................................. 77  
5.1. Parents ........................................................................................................... 77  
5.2. Third persons ............................................................................................... 80  
6. Content of parental responsibilities ................................................................. 80  
6.1. The child’s person and property .................................................................. 80  
6.2. Maintenance of personal relationships .................................................... 89  
7. Termination of parental responsibilities ......................................................... 91  
8. Discharge and restoration of parental responsibilities ...................................... 93  

x

Intersentia
## Table of Contents

9. Procedure ............................................................................................................. 96  
10. Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 99  

**PARENTAL PROTECTION IN ROMANIAN LAW JUXTAPOSED TO THE CEFL PRINCIPLES**  
Flavius A. Baias, Marieta Avram and Cristina Nicolescu ............. 103  

1. General issues .................................................................................................... 103  
2. The content of parental protection ............................................................... 110  
3. The attribution of parental protection ........................................................... 123  
   3.1. The situation of married parents ............................................................. 123  
   3.2. The situation of unmarried parents ...................................................... 126  
   3.3. Other persons ............................................................................................. 128  
4. The exercise of parental responsibilities ......................................................... 131  
   4.1. Interests of the child ................................................................................... 131  
   4.2. Joint parental responsibilities .................................................................. 134  
   4.3. Sole parental responsibilities ................................................................... 142  
5. Contact ............................................................................................................... 144  
6. Delegation of parental responsibilities .......................................................... 149  
7. Discharge of parental responsibilities ............................................................ 150  
8. Procedural issues ............................................................................................... 153  

**SCOTS LAW AND THE CEFL PRINCIPLES REGARDING PARENTAL RESPONSIBILITIES: HARMONY IN PRINCIPLE**  
Jane Mair and Ian Sharpe ............................................................................ 161  

1. Introduction ........................................................................................................ 161  
2. Responsibilities and rights ............................................................................... 162  
3. Rights of the child ............................................................................................. 163  
4. Parental responsibilities of parents and third parties .................................. 171  
5. Exercise of parental responsibilities ............................................................... 175  
   5.1. Parents ......................................................................................................... 175  
   5.2. Third persons .............................................................................................. 176  
6. Content of parental responsibilities ............................................................... 178  
   6.1. The child’s person and property .............................................................. 178  
   6.2. Maintenance of personal relationships .................................................. 185  
7. Termination of parental responsibilities ....................................................... 187  
8. Discharge and restoration of parental responsibilities ............................... 188  
9. Procedure ........................................................................................................... 189  
10. Concluding remarks ......................................................................................... 192
# PART TWO – RE-TESTING THE TESTED: THE SAME AND THE DIFFERENT

## THE CEFL PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW REGARDING PARENTAL RESPONSIBILITIES AND DANISH LAW

Annette Kronborg and Christina G. Jeppesen de Boer .................... 195

1. Introduction ....................................................................................................... 195
2. Parental responsibilities ................................................................................... 197
   2.1. Definitions ................................................................................................. 197
   2.2. Rights of the child .................................................................................... 198
   2.3. Parental responsibilities of parents and third persons ....................... 200
   2.4. Exercise of parental responsibilities ...................................................... 202
   2.5. Third persons ............................................................................................ 205
   2.6. Content of parental responsibilities ...................................................... 205
   2.7. Maintenance of personal relationships ................................................. 207
   2.8. Termination of parental responsibilities............................................... 209
   2.9. Discharge and restoration of parental responsibilities ....................... 209
   2.10. Procedure .................................................................................................... 210
3. Final assessment ................................................................................................. 211

## A MORE PRINCIPLED APPROACH TO PARENTAL RESPONSIBILITY IN ENGLAND AND WALES?

Rebecca Probert, Stephen Gilmore and Jonathan Herring ........... 213

1. Introduction ....................................................................................................... 213
2. The concept of parental responsibility ........................................................... 213
3. Parental responsibility and the rights of the child....................................... 215
4. The possession of parental responsibility ....................................................... 218
5. The exercise of parental responsibility ........................................................... 221
6. The content of parental responsibility ........................................................... 223
7. Ending parental responsibilities ..................................................................... 228
8. Procedure ........................................................................................................... 229
9. Conclusion ......................................................................................................... 230
PART THREE – AN ASPIRANT CANDIDATE: DO VALUES CLASH?

HOW DOES TURKISH FAMILY LAW FARE COMPARED TO THE PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW REGARDING PARENTAL RESPONSIBILITIES?

Esin Örücü and Canan Arin ....................................................................... 235

1. Introductory overview ................................................................. 235
2. Setting the Turkish scene today .................................................. 237
3. Turkish family law juxtaposed to the principles of European
   family law ..................................................................................... 238
   3.1. Definitions .................................................................................. 238
   3.2. Rights of the child ................................................................. 243
   3.3. Parental responsibilities of parents and third persons .......... 247
   3.4. Exercise of parental responsibilities ........................................ 249
       3.4.1. Parents ............................................................................. 249
       3.4.2. Third Persons ................................................................. 251
   3.5. Content of parental responsibilities ......................................... 252
       3.5.1. The child’s person and property ..................................... 252
       3.5.2. Maintenance of personal relationships......................... 257
   3.6. Termination of parental responsibilities .................................. 260
   3.7. Discharge and restoration of parental responsibilities .......... 262
   3.8. Procedure .................................................................................. 262
4. Concluding remarks ................................................................ 265

PART FOUR – COMPARATIVE ASSESSMENT

HARMONISED NORMS OF PARENTAL RESPONSIBILITIES FACING REALITY

Jane Mair and Esin Örücü ....................................................................... 269

1. Introduction .................................................................................. 269
2. Domestic state of harmony? ......................................................... 270
   2.1. Parental responsibilities .......................................................... 271
   2.2. Content of parental responsibilities ......................................... 274
   2.3. Parents and third parties .......................................................... 276
3. Ideal principles? ........................................................................... 279
   3.1. Better principles? ................................................................. 280
   3.2. Modern principles? ................................................................. 282
       3.2.1. Parental responsibilities and responsible parents .......... 283
       3.2.2. Parents, third parties and de facto parenting ................. 285
Table of Contents

4. Ideals in practice? .............................................................................................. 288
   4.1. A child-centric model ............................................................................... 289
   4.2. Parental separation and continuing relationships ............................... 292
5. Concluding remarks ......................................................................................... 294

ANNEXES: THE QUESTIONNAIRE AND THE PRINCIPLES

QUESTIONNAIRE ..................................................................................................... 299

PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW REGARDING
PARENTAL RESPONSIBILITIES ........................................................................ 307