

EUROPEAN YEARBOOK OF DISABILITY LAW

European Yearbook of Disability Law

Editors:

Prof. Gerard Quinn
National University of Ireland, Galway (IRL)

Prof. Lisa Waddington
European Disability Forum Chair in European Disability Law
Maastricht University (NLs)

Editorial Board:

Prof. Theresia Degener
Evangelischen Fachhochschule Rheinland-Westfalen-Lippe (GER)

Prof. Aart Hendriks,
Chair in Health Law, University of Leiden (NLs)

Prof. Bjørn Hvinden
Head of Research & Deputy Director NOVA, (NO)

Dovile Juodkaite
Director, Global Initiative on Psychiatry – Vilnius (LI)

Anna Lawson
Senior Lecturer in Law and Member of the Centre for Disability Studies, Leeds University
(UK)

Oliver Lewis
Executive Director, Mental Disability Advocacy Center, Budapest (HU)

John Parry
Director, Commission on Mental & Physical Disability Law, American Bar Association
(US)

Shivaun Quinlivan
Law Lecturer, National University of Ireland, Galway (IRL)

Advisory Board:

Prof. Peter Blanck
Chairman, The Burton Blatt Institute, Syracuse University (US)

Prof. Christopher McCrudden
Lincoln College, Oxford University (GB)

Prof. Michael Stein
William & Mary School of Law and Executive Director, Harvard Project on
Disability Harvard Law School (US)

Yannis Vardakastanis
President of the European Disability Forum (EU)

EUROPEAN YEARBOOK OF DISABILITY LAW

Volume 1

Edited by

Gerard QUINN

Lisa WADDINGTON

 intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

Distribution for the UK:

Hart Publishing
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX12JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 51 75 30
Fax: +44 1865 51 07 10

Distribution for Switzerland and

Germany:
Schulthess Verlag
Zwingliplatz 2
CH-8022 Zürich
Switzerland
Tel: + 41 1 251 93 36
Fax: + 41 1 261 63 94

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Tel.: +1 503 287 3093
Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishers
Groenstraat 31
BE-2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel: + 32 3 680 15 50
Fax: + 32 3 658 71 21

European Yearbook of Disability Law. Volume 1
Lisa Waddington and Gerard Quinn (eds.)

© 2009 Intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
www.intersentia.com

ISBN 978-90-5095-820-2
D/2009/7849/27
NUR 825

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EDITORIAL THE EUROPEAN YEARBOOK OF DISABILITY LAW: A NEW PUBLICATION FOR AN EMERGING FIELD GERARD QUINN and LISA WADDINGTON	1
PART I: ARTICLES AND SHORT COMMENTARIES	3
REDISTRIBUTIVE AND REGULATORY DISABILITY PROVISIONS: INCOMPATIBILITY OR SYNERGY? BJØRN HVINDEN	5
1. Introduction	5
2. A Note on the Conceptualization and Measurement of Disability	8
3. Convergence and Divergence in Calls for Reform	9
4. The Reform Agenda of the OECD	10
5. The Reform Agenda of Scholars Working Within the Framework of Social-Contextual Understandings of Disability	13
6. Redistributive Disability Provisions, Poverty, Employment and Gender 16	
6.1. Level of Redistributive Disability Provisions and the Poverty Risk for Persons with Disabilities	17
6.2. Level of Redistributive Disability Provisions and Employment Rates of Persons with Disabilities	19
6.3. Redistributive Disability-Related Provisions and Gender	22
7. The Potential Contribution of Human Rights Instruments in Promoting and Protecting the Economic and Social Rights of Persons with Disabilities	22
8. Toward a Greater Synergy Between Redistributive and Regulatory Provisions – Civil and Social Rights	25
9. Concluding Remarks	26
‘PROMOTING EQUALITY?’ EARLY LESSONS FROM THE STATUTORY DISABILITY DUTY IN GREAT BRITAIN CAROLINE GOODING	29
1. Introduction	29
2. The Disability Equality Duties	32
2.1. General Duty	32
2.2. Specific Duties	33
2.3. Duty on Secretaries of State	35
2.4. Comparison with Race and Gender Duties	35

Table of Contents

3.	Enforcement of the Duties	36
4.	Implementation of the Duties.....	37
5.	Early Impact of the Disability Equality Duties.....	39
6.	Criticism of the Public Sector Duties.....	43
6.1.	Weak General Duty?	44
6.2.	Process Driven – Failing to Deliver Change.....	46
6.3.	Lack of Clarity About Equality	48
6.4.	Effective Participation – or Window Dressing?.....	51
6.5.	Limited Enforcement Regime	53
7.	The Future of the Equality Duties.....	54
8.	Conclusion.....	56

LEGAL CAPACITY LAW REFORM IN EUROPE: AN URGENT CHALLENGE

MARY KEYS	59
-----------------	----

1.	Introduction	59
2.	Context for Change	61
3.	Human Rights and Legal Capacity	63
3.1.	Council of Europe and Legal Capacity: Recommendation No. R(99) 4.....	67
4.	The Least Restrictive Alternative.....	70
5.	Approach to the Evaluation of Capacity	71
6.	Fair Procedures, Privacy and Arbitrary Detention	73
6.1.	Notification.....	75
6.2.	Assessment of Legal Capacity	76
6.3.	Forcible Detention for Assessment	76
6.4.	Assessment of Capacity and Mental Health Detention.....	77
6.5.	Evidence	78
6.6.	Right to be Heard	79
6.7.	Legal Representation.....	80
6.8.	Choice of Guardian	80
6.9.	Length of Proceedings.....	81
7.	Legal Rights After a Guardianship Order	82
7.1.	Preservation of Legal Capacity	82
7.2.	Role of the Guardian	83
7.3.	Right of Appeal and Review of Deprivation of Legal Capacity	84
8.	Law Reform	85
9.	Conclusion.....	87

A SHORT GUIDE TO THE UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES

GERARD QUINN	89
--------------------	----

1.	Values: Disability as a Subject of Human Rights.....	89
2.	History: The Evolution of the Rights-Based Framework of Reference on Disability in the United Nations.....	93
3.	Law: The United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities	99
3.1.	General Provisions	99
3.2.	The Rights	104

3.2.1. Rights that Protect the Person	104
3.2.2. Rights that Restore Autonomy, Choice and Independence	105
3.2.3. Rights of Access and Participation.....	107
3.2.4. Liberty Rights.....	109
3.2.5. Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	109
3.3. Implementation and Monitoring	111
3.3.1. International Monitoring	112
3.3.2. Domestic Implementation and Monitoring	113
3.3.3. International Co-operation	113
4. Conclusions	114

A PERSONAL PERSPECTIVE ON THE DRAFTING HISTORY OF THE UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES

STEFAN TRÖMEL	115
---------------------	-----

1. Introduction.....	115
2. Background and Overarching Issues.....	116
2.1. Why is There a Need for a Disability-Specific Convention?.....	116
2.2. The Role of the International Disability Community: the International Disability Caucus (IDC)	117
2.3. Comprehensive Convention Versus Anti-Discrimination Convention ..	118
2.4. No New Rights and No Different Rights than Other Persons.....	118
2.5. Is it a Human Rights Treaty or a Social Development Treaty?.....	119
3. Some Key Issues	120
3.1. Prevention of Impairment	120
3.2. Definition of Disability and Definition of Persons with Disabilities	121
3.3. Discrimination on the Basis of Disability	122
3.4. Right to Life (Article 10)	124
3.5. Situations of Risk and Humanitarian Emergencies (Article 11)	125
3.6. Equal Recognition Before the Law (Article 12)	125
3.7. Liberty and Security of Person (Article 14).....	128
3.8. Freedom from Torture or Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Article 15)	129
3.9. Protecting the Integrity of the Person (Article 17).....	130
3.10. International Cooperation (Article 32).....	132
3.11. National Implementation and Monitoring (Article 33).....	133
3.12. The Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (Article 34 and ff)	134
3.13. Conference of States Parties (Article 40).....	135
3.14. The Optional Protocol to the Convention	135
4. Conclusions	136

IMPLEMENTING THE DIGITAL ACCESSIBILITY AGENDA OF THE UN CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES: CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES

AXEL LEBLOIS	139
--------------------	-----

1. Background to the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities	139
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

2.	ICT Accessibility: an Important Aspect of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities	140
3.	Solutions Adopted by the Convention.....	140
4.	Obligation to Enact Legislation and Regulations for ICTs	142
5.	Opportunities for Developing Nations	142
6.	Facilitating a Successful Implementation of the Convention in Matters of ICT Accessibility and Assistive Technologies.....	143
7.	Bibliography.....	144

AN INTRODUCTION TO THE AUSTRIAN FEDERAL DISABILITY EQUALITY ACT

ANTHONY WILLIAMS.....	147
-----------------------	-----

1.	A Short History	147
2.	Scope of Legislation	147
3.	Definition of Disability	148
4.	Definition of Discrimination	148
5.	Definition of Accessibility / Disproportionate Burden.....	148
6.	Assessment of Reasonableness	148
7.	Burden of Proof.....	149
8.	Special Subsidies for Accessibility Works.....	149
9.	Progressive Action Plan (<i>Etappenplan</i>).....	150
10.	Mandatory Reconciliation Procedure Before Filing a Lawsuit.....	150

PART II: ANNUAL REVIEW OF EUROPEAN LAW AND POLICY

153

THE EUROPEAN UNION

155

1.	Background to the European Union and Disability	155
1.1.	Strategic Direction	159
1.1.1.	Foundations: The European Community Disability Strategy of 1996... ..	159
1.1.2.	Current Strategy: The European Disability Action Plan 2003-2010.....	160
1.2.	Legislative Measures.....	161
1.2.1.	Non-Discrimination Legislation: Directive 2000/78 Establishing a General Framework for Equal Treatment in Employment and Occupation.....	161
1.2.2.	Proposal for a Council Directive on Implementing the Principle of Equal Treatment Between Persons Irrespective of Religion or Belief, Disability, Age or Sexual Orientation (2008).....	162
1.3.	The EC and International Legal Developments.....	164
1.3.1.	Signature & Conclusion (Affirmation) by the EC of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities – Current Progress	164
1.4.	Recent Developments in Miscellaneous Fields.....	167
2.	Activities of the European Commission	168
2.1.	Directorate General for Employment, Social Affairs & Equal Opportunities	169
2.1.1.	Unit for the Integration of People with Disabilities.....	169
2.1.2.	Unit for Equality, Action Against Discrimination: Legal Questions.....	170
2.1.3.	Unit on Action Against Discrimination, Civil Society.....	171
2.2.	Directorate General for Health and Consumer Protection	172

2.3.	Directorate General for Energy and Transport.....	173
2.4.	Directorate General for Development.....	175
2.5.	Directorate General for Internal Market and Services	176
2.6.	Directorate General for the Information Society and Media	177
2.7.	Eurostat	178
3.	Activities of the Council of the European Union.....	180
3.1.	Activities under the Open Method of Co-ordination (OMC).....	180
3.1.1.	Open Method of Coordination- European Employment Strategy.....	180
3.1.2.	Open Method of Coordination- Social Protection and Social Inclusion.....	181
3.2.	EU Presidency and Ministerial Conferences on Disability.....	182
3.2.1.	Slovenian Presidency Informal Meeting of Ministers for Employment and Social Affairs, Brdo pri Kranju, 31 January- 2 February 2008	183
3.2.2.	Slovenian Presidency Conference on the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities – from words to reality?, Kranjska Gora, Slovenia, 22-23 May 2008.....	183
4.	Current Activities of the European Parliament	184
4.1.	The Role and Functioning of the European Parliament	184
4.2.	Activities of the European Parliament Intergroup on Disability.....	184
5.	Case law of the European Court of Justice	188
5.1.	The Powers of the European Court of Justice.....	188
5.2.	Recently Decided Cases.....	189
5.2.1.	Sonia Chacón Navas v. Eures Colectividades SA (2006)	189
5.2.2.	Sharon Coleman v. Attridge Law and Steve Law (2008).....	190
5.2.3.	D.P.W. Hendrix v. Raad van Bestuur van het Uitvoeringsinstituut Werknemersverzekeringen (2007)	192
5.2.4.	Halina Nerkowska v. Zakład Ubezpieczeń Społecznych Oddział w Koszalinie (2008)	194
5.3.	Cases Pending	194
5.3.1.	Gottwald v. Bezirkshauptmannschaft Bregenz	194
5.3.2.	Schultz-Hoff v. Deutsche Rentenversicherung Bundv (2008).....	195
5.3.3.	Stringer v. Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs (2008)	196
5.3.4.	Francisco Vicente Pereda v. Madrid Movilidad S.A.	197
6.	European Economic and Social Committee.....	197
6.1.	Background and Work of the Committee.....	197
6.2.	2008 Opinions with a disability dimension.....	198
7.	Activities of the European Union Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA).....	200
7.1.	Research and Related Activity	200
8.	Studies & Reports	201
8.1.	Mansell et al, 'Deinstitutionalisation and community living – outcomes and costs: report of a European Study', (Tizard Centre, University of Kent, 2007)	201
8.2.	Shima et al, 'The Labour Market Situation of People with Disabilities in EU25' (European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research, 2008).....	203
9.	Annual European Day of People with Disabilities	204
9.1.	European Day 2007 (5-6 December 2007)	205
9.2.	European Day 2008 (1-2 December 2008)	205

THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE	207
1. Background to the Council of Europe and Disability	207
1.1. The Role and Institutions of the Council of Europe	207
1.2. The Strategic Direction of the Council of Europe on Disability.....	209
2. The European Court of Human Rights and Recent Case Law on Disability	210
2.1. Background and Jurisdiction of the Court	210
2.2. Recent Disability Related Case law	213
2.2.1. DH and Others v. the Czech Republic (Judgment of Grand Chamber, November 2007)	213
2.2.2. Shtukaturov v. Russia (Judgment of Chamber, March 2008)	217
2.2.3. Paladi v. Moldova (Judgment of Chamber, July 2007: case referred to the Grand Chamber)	221
2.2.4. Saoud v. France (Judgment of Chamber, October 2007)	224
2.2.5. Hüseyin Yıldırım v. Turkey (Judgment of Chamber, May 2007)	226
2.2.6. Tysiąc v. Poland (Judgment of Chamber, March 2007)	228
2.2.7. DD v. Lithuania, Application Number 13469/06 (pending)	229
3. European Social Charter and Recent Disability Case law	230
3.1. Background of the European Social Charter.....	230
3.2. Recent Conclusions of the European Committee of Social Rights on State Party Reports on Disability.	235
3.2.1. Armenia - Revised Charter (reference period: 2001-2004)	236
3.2.2. Belgium - Revised Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	237
3.2.3. Cyprus - Revised Charter (reference period: 2003-2006).....	239
3.2.4. Estonia - Revised Charter (reference period: 2005-2006)	240
3.2.5. Finland - Revised Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	241
3.2.6. France - Revised Charter (reference period: 2005-2006)	242
3.2.7. Georgia - Revised Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	243
3.2.8. Italy - Revised Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	244
3.2.9. Lithuania - Revised Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	245
3.2.10. Malta - Revised Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	246
3.2.11. Moldova - Revised Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	248
3.2.12. The Netherlands - Revised Charter (reference period: 2006).....	248
3.2.13. Norway - Revised Charter (reference period: 2005-2006)	250
3.2.14. Portugal - Revised Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	251
3.2.15. Romania - Revised Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	252
3.2.16. Austria - 1961 Charter (reference period: 2003-2006)	253
3.2.17. Czech Republic - 1961 Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	254
3.2.18. Denmark - 1961 Charter (reference period: 2005-2006)	255
3.2.19. Germany - 1961 Charter (reference period: 2005-2006)	256
3.2.20. Greece - 1961 Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	256
3.2.21. Iceland - 1961 Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	257
3.2.22. Luxembourg - 1961 Charter (reference period: 2005-2006)	258
3.2.23. Poland - 1961 Charter (reference period: 2003-2006).....	259
3.2.24. Spain - 1961 Charter (reference period: 2003-2006).....	260
3.2.25. Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia - 1961 Charter (reference period: 2005-2006).....	261
3.2.26. United Kingdom - 1961 Charter (reference period: 2004-2006).....	262

3.3.	Recent Decisions of the European Committee of Social Rights on Collective Complaints and Disability.....	263
3.3.1.	International Association Autism-Europe v. France (Revised Social Charter, Decision of November 2004).....	264
3.3.2.	Mental Disability Advocacy Centre (MDAC) v. Bulgaria (Revised Social Charter, Decision of June 2008).....	266
4.	European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhumane or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) and Disability.....	269
4.1.	Background of the CPT.....	269
4.2.	The CPT Standards and Disability.....	270
4.3.	The 2008 CPT General Report and Disability.....	273
4.4.	Country Visits of the CPT in 2008 and Disability.....	274
4.4.1.	CPT Visit to Albania (2008).....	274
4.4.2.	CPT Visit to Denmark (2008).....	275
4.4.3.	CPT Visit to Czech Republic (2008).....	276
4.4.4.	CPT Visit to Finland (2008).....	276
4.4.5.	CPT Visit to the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (2008).....	277
4.4.6.	CPT Visit to Portugal (2008).....	278
5.	The Council of Europe Human Rights Commissioner and Disability.....	279
5.1.	Background and Role.....	279
5.2.	Recent Activity of the Commissioner on Disability.....	279
6.	Committee of Ministers and Disability.....	282
6.1.	Recent Activity of the Committee of Ministers on Disability.....	282
7.	The Parliamentary Assembly and Disability.....	283
7.1.	Recent Activity of the Parliamentary Assembly on Disability.....	283
OTHER EUROPEAN INTERGOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS AND CIVIL SOCIETY GROUPS.....		285
1.	European Intergovernmental Organizations.....	285
1.1.	Organization for Economic Co-Operation & Development (OECD).....	285
1.2.	International Transport Forum (ITF).....	288
1.3.	Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE).....	290
1.4.	European Broadcasting Union (EBU).....	291
1.5.	World Health Organization - Regional Office for Europe.....	292
1.6.	European Group of National Human Rights Institutions – (NHRIs-EG).....	293
2.	European Civil Society Organizations.....	294
2.1.	European Disability Forum (EDF).....	294
PART III: ANNEX OF KEY DOCUMENTATION.....		299
PROPOSAL FOR A COUNCIL DIRECTIVE ON IMPLEMENTING THE PRINCIPLE OF EQUAL TREATMENT BETWEEN PERSONS IRRESPECTIVE OF RELIGION OR BELIEF, DISABILITY, AGE OR SEXUAL ORIENTATION.....		301
PROPOSAL FOR A COUNCIL DECISION CONCERNING THE CONCLUSION, BY THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITY, OF THE UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES.....		313

ISSUE PAPER FROM THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE COMMISSIONER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS ON ‘HUMAN RIGHTS AND DISABILITY: EQUAL RIGHTS FOR ALL’	317
EDF POSITION ON THE PROPOSAL FOR A COUNCIL DIRECTIVE ON IMPLEMENTING THE PRINCIPLE OF EQUAL TREATMENT BETWEEN PERSONS IRRESPECTIVE OF RELIGION OR BELIEF, DISABILITY, AGE OR SEXUAL ORIENTATION (ARTICLE 13 DIRECTIVE).....	331
DISABILITY AS THE NEW FRONTRUNNER IN EC NON-DISCRIMINATION LEGISLATION? ...	347
REPORT OF THE PUBLIC HEARING AT THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT: FUTURE ANTI-DISCRIMINATION LEGISLATION: WHAT ARE THE SPECIFICITIES OF THE ‘DISABILITY’ GROUND 14 MAY 2008.....	347
EXTRACT FROM THE JUDGMENT OF THE EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE (GRAND CHAMBER) OF 11 JULY 2006 IN THE CASE OF SONIA CHACÓN NAVAS V EUREST COLECTIVIDADES SA	355
EXTRACT FROM THE JUDGMENT OF THE EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE (GRAND CHAMBER) OF 17 JULY 2008 IN THE CASE OF S. COLEMAN V ATTRIDGE LAW, STEVE LAW	357
EXTRACT FROM THE JUDGMENT OF THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS (GRAND CHAMBER) OF 13 NOVEMBER 2007 IN THE CASE OF D.H. AND OTHERS V. THE CZECH REPUBLIC	359
EXTRACT FROM THE JUDGMENT OF THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS (FIRST SECTION) OF 27 MARCH 2008 IN THE CASE OF SHTUKATUROV V. RUSSIA.....	363
EXTRACT FROM THE DECISION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMITTEE OF SOCIAL RIGHTS OF 4 NOVEMBER 2003 IN THE COLLECTIVE COMPLAINT OF AUTISM - EUROPE V. FRANCE	371
EXTRACT FROM THE DECISION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMITTEE OF SOCIAL RIGHTS OF 3 JUNE 2008 IN THE COLLECTIVE COMPLAINT OF MENTAL DISABILITY ADVOCACY CENTER (MDAC) V. BULGARIA	375