JUXTAPOSING LEGAL SYSTEMS AND THE PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW ON DIVORCE AND MAINTENANCE
European Family Law Series

Published by the Organising Committee of the Commission on European Family Law

Prof. Katharina Boele-Woelki (Utrecht)
Prof. Frédérique Ferrand (Lyon)
Prof. Cristina González Beilfuss (Barcelona)
Prof. Maarit Jänterä-Jareborg (Uppsala)
Prof. Nigel Lowe (Cardiff)
Prof. Dieter Martiny (Frankfurt/Oder)
Prof. Walter Pintens (Leuven)
JUXTAPOSING LEGAL SYSTEMS AND THE PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW ON DIVORCE AND MAINTENANCE

Edited by
Esİn Örücü and Jane Mair
Juxtaposing Legal Systems and the Principles of European Family Law on Divorce and Maintenance
Esin Örücü and Jane Mair

© 2007 Intersentia
Antwerpen – Oxford
http://www.intersentia.com

D/2007/7849/43
NUR 822

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.
PREFACE

Following the publication of *Principles of European Family Law Regarding Divorce and Maintenance Between Former Spouses* by the Commission on European Family Law (CEFL) that was set up in September 2001 with a team of specialists from twenty-two jurisdictions to carry out research in the field of comparative family law, it was considered worthwhile to produce an edited volume to assess the reality of legal systems in view of the Principles, and the Principles in view of the reality of these legal systems.

The CEFL hoped to create a source of inspiration to legislators in the process of modernising their national family laws. "Functional equivalence" was sought and both the "common core" and "better law" approaches were adopted. The drafters chose "the best", "the more functional" and the "most efficient" rules, their touchstone being the modernisation of the law. So, these CEFL Principles are not merely restatements of family laws in Europe, but contributions towards the establishment of a European Family Law.

Only by empirical testing of the Principles in a number of legal systems can one demonstrate whether they are acceptable and/or are regarded as an improvement on existing national laws. For our purposes, after an introductory overview, it was deemed appropriate first to re-test the Principles in a sample of legal systems already considered by the CEFL: France, one head of the civilian tradition; Scandinavia, a variation on the civilian theme; England, the mother of the common law tradition, Scotland, a mixed jurisdiction that has gained popularity within the European Union as a model; and then, to test the Principles in the untested: Malta, a new EU member with a conservative background; Estonia and Lithuania, two new EU members with a socialist background but different socio-cultures; and Turkey, a country bridging two cultures and aspiring to membership of the EU.

The final part of the volume is a comparative assessment of our findings. One study looks at the Principles as harmonious ideals, the other looks at the shortfalls in the ideals as presented and the obstacles to harmonisation.

Esin Örüş and Jane Mair
1 March 2007
LIST OF AUTHORS

Dr Ruth Farrugia
Advocate and Senior Lecturer in Civil Law, University of Malta

Ms Joëlle Godard
Lecturer in Law – University of Edinburgh

Ms Triin Göttig
L.L.M. (Kiel); Research Fellow of Civil Law, University of Tartu, Estonia

Ms Liis Hallik
mag. iur.; Adjunct Instructor, Institute of Law, University of Tartu; Counsellor of the Civil Chamber, Supreme Court of the Republic of Estonia

Dr. Gaël Henaff
Maître de conférences à l’Université de Rennes 2, France

Prof. Dr. Urpo Kangas
Professor in Civil Law, Faculty of Law, University of Helsinki, Finland

Dr Inga Kudinaviciute-Michailoviene
Lecturer in Civil and Commercial Law, Mykolas Romeris University, Lithuania

Dr. Jane Mair
Senior Lecturer in Law, University of Glasgow, School of Law, Scotland, UK.

Prof. Dr. Esin Örücü
Professorial Research Fellow and Professor Emerita of Comparative Law, University of Glasgow, Professor Emerita of Comparative law, Erasmus University Rotterdam and Visiting Professor of Comparative Law, University of Yeditepe, Istanbul, Turkey.

Dr. Rebecca Probert
Lecturer of Private law, University of Warwick, England.

Dr. Triin Uusen-Nacke
Adjunct Instructor, Institute of Law, University of Tartu; Counsellor of the Civil Chamber, Supreme Court of the Republic of Estonia
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE ..................................................................................... v

LIST OF AUTHORS ................................................................. vii

INTRODUCTORY OVERVIEW

COMMON CULTURES AND DIVERSE LAWS – COMMON LAWS AND
DIVERSE CULTURES
Esin Orucu and Jane Mair ......................................................... 3

1. Introducing the topic .......................................................... 3
   1.1. The European scene, the Commission on European Family Law
   and its work ................................................................. 5
      1.1.1. The European Scene ........................................ 5
      1.1.2. Commission on European Family Law (CEFL) and its
   work ................................................................. 7

2. The general outline of the principles .................................... 11

3. The aim of this research ..................................................... 12
   3.1. Inception of the research ........................................ 12
   3.2. Choice of systems .................................................. 13
   3.3. Assessment of Legal Systems and CEFL Principles ........ 14

4. Concluding remarks .......................................................... 15


FRANCE AND THE PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW REGARDING DIVORCE AND MAINTENANCE BETWEEN FORMER SPOUSES
Joelle Godard and Gael Henaff ................................................. 19

1. Introduction .................................................................... 19

2. Divorce ........................................................................... 20
   2.1. General Principles ................................................. 20
   2.2. Divorce by mutual consent .................................... 22
DIVORCE SYSTEM AND MAINTENANCE OF FORMER SPOUSES IN SCANDINAVIAN COUNTRIES
Urpo Kangas

1. The myth of joint Scandinavia and the myth of the joint legislation in Nordic Countries
2. The compulsory end of joint family life during and after marriage
3. General principles of divorce
   3.1. Permission of divorce
   3.2. Procedure by law and competent authority
   3.3. Types of divorce
   3.4. Divorce by mutual consent
   3.5. Divorce without the consent of one of the spouses
   3.6. Exceptional hardship to the petitioner
   3.7. Determination of the consequences
4. Maintenance between spouses
   4.1. Maintenance during the marriage
   4.2. Maintenance between former spouses
   4.3. Conditions for the attribution of maintenance
   4.4. Determining claims for maintenance
   4.5. Method of maintenance provision
   4.6. Exceptional hardship to the debtor spouse
   4.7. Specific issues
      4.7.1. Multiplicity of maintenance claims
      4.7.2. Limitation in time
      4.7.3. Termination of the maintenance obligation
      4.7.4. Maintenance agreement
5. Conclusion

Persoonlijke kopie van ()
ENGLAND AND WALES JUXTAPOSED TO THE EUROPEAN PRINCIPLES OF FAMILY LAW

Rebecca Probert .......................................................... 55

1. Introduction ................................................................. 55
2. Reforming divorce law ................................................... 55
   2.1. The principle that the law should permit divorce and that no duration of the marriage should be required ................. 56
   2.2. The principle that divorce should be granted by a competent body .................................................. 59
   2.3. The principle that the law should permit divorce by mutual consent without any period of separation .......................... 60
   2.4. The principle that the law should permit unilateral divorce after a period of separation, save where delay would cause exceptional hardship to the petitioner ........................................ 62
3. Maintenance between former spouses .................................. 65
   3.1. The principle that maintenance is not dependent on the type of divorce .................................................. 66
   3.2. The ideal of self-sufficiency .......................................... 66
   3.3. Needs-based maintenance .......................................... 67
   3.4. Factors to be taken into account .................................. 67
   3.5. The mode of providing maintenance ............................. 68
   3.6. Circumstances in which maintenance should be denied ........ 68
   3.7. Multiplicity of maintenance claims ................................ 69
   3.8. Time-limited .......................................................... 70
   3.9. Circumstances in which maintenance should cease ............ 70
   3.10. Maintenance agreements ......................................... 71
4. Conclusion ........................................................................ 72

COMMON PRINCIPLES AND PURPOSES? SCOTS LAW AND THE COMMISSION ON EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW

Jane Mair ................................................................. 75

1. Divorce in Scots law: an introduction .................................. 75
2. The CEFL principles: divorce ............................................. 77
   2.1. General Principles ..................................................... 77
   2.2. Types of divorce ....................................................... 79
      2.2.1. Divorce by mutual consent .................................... 80
      2.2.2. Reflection period and agreements ........................... 80
      2.2.3. Divorce without consent ..................................... 81
      2.2.4. Exceptional hardship to the petitioner ...................... 82
Table of Contents

2.2.5. Agreements ................................................................. 83
2.3. Scots law and the CEFL Principles: Some Conclusions .......... 84
3. Maintenance – Financial provision in Scots law; an introduction .... 85
  3.1. Spousal aliment and separation of property ...................... 86
  3.2. Financial provision on divorce .............................. 87
  3.3. The 1985 Act: orders and principles ........................... 88
4. Conclusions ................................................................. 95

PART TWO – DIVERSITY IN THE NEW MEMBERS OF THE EUROPEAN
UNION: CAN THERE BE ONE WAY FORWARD?

THE POSITION IN MALTA JUXTAPOSED TO THE PRINCIPLES OF
EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW: DIVORCE AND MAINTENANCE
Ruth Farrugia ................................................................. 99

1. Introduction ................................................................. 99
2. Matrimonial Breakdown .............................................. 100
  2.1. Marriage ................................................................. 100
      2.1.1. History – Canon Law – the Constitution .................. 100
  2.2. Annulment .............................................................. 103
      2.2.1. Definition ....................................................... 103
      2.2.2. Effects of Annulment ....................................... 104
      2.2.3. Recognition of canonical annulments .................... 105
      2.2.4. Marriages of Convenience ................................. 108
  2.3. Divorce ................................................................. 108
      2.3.1. Position in Malta ........................................... 108
      2.3.2. Registration of foreign divorce judgement ............ 109
  2.4. Personal Separation ............................................... 110
      2.4.1. Chapter 16 – Laws of Malta ............................ 110
      2.4.2. Grounds ....................................................... 111
      2.4.3. Effects according to Grounds ............................ 111
3. Maintenance ............................................................... 113
  3.1. Spouses ............................................................... 114
     3.1.1. Competition for maintenance ............................ 114
     3.1.2. Loss of right to maintenance ........................... 114
     3.1.3. Quantum of maintenance ................................. 115
     3.1.4. Lump sum payments ...................................... 115

xii

Persoonlijke kopie van   ()
### Table of Contents

3.2. Children ................................................. 116  
3.2.1. Parental responsibility ......................... 116  
3.2.2. Court intervention ............................... 117  
4. Link to Brussels II – Regulation 2201/2003 ........ 117  
4.1. Jurisdiction ............................................ 118  
4.2. Recognition and enforcement ..................... 119  
5. Juxtaposition and Comparison with Principles ...... 119  
5.1. Permission of divorce: Principle 1:1 ............ 119  
5.2. Divorce procedure: Principle 1.2 ............... 120  
5.3. Types of divorce: Principle 1:3 ................. 120  
5.4. Mutual consent: Principle 1:4 ................... 120  
5.5. Reflection period: Principle 1:5 ................. 121  
5.6. Content and form of the agreement: Principle 1:6 121  
5.7. Determination of the consequences: Principle 1:7 122  
5.8. Factual separation: Principle 1:8 ............... 122  
5.9. Exceptional hardship to the petitioner: Principle 1:9 122  
5.10. Determination of the consequences: Principle 1:10 123  
5.11. Relationship between maintenance and divorce: Principle 2:1 ... 123  
5.13. Conditions for maintenance: Principle 2:3 ...... 124  
5.15. Method of maintenance provision: Principle 2:5 125  
5.16. Exceptional hardship to the debtor spouse: Principle 2:6 126  
5.17. Multiplicity of maintenance claims: Principle 2:7 126  
5.18. Limitation in time: Principle 2:8 ............. 127  
5.19. Termination of the maintenance obligation: Principle 2:9 127  
5.20. Maintenance agreement: Principle 2:10 ....... 127

### DIVORCE AND MAINTENANCE BETWEEN FORMER SPOUSES IN ESTONIA AND THE CEFL PRINCIPLES

Triin Göttig, Liis Hallik and Triin Uusen-Nacke ............. 129  

1. Introduction .............................................. 129  
1.1. History of Divorce law ............................ 129  
1.2. Contemporary divorce law ......................... 132  
2. Divorce .................................................. 133  
2.1. General ............................................... 133  
2.1.1. General principles of divorce ................. 133  
2.1.2. About divorce statistics in Estonia .......... 134

Intersentia xiii
2.1.3. Competent authorities in the divorce proceedings and the date of termination of marriage upon divorce .................. 135

2.2. Agreement as a ground for divorce .................................................. 136
  2.2.1. Divorce by mutual consent as an independent ground for divorce ................................................................. 136
  2.2.2. Divorce proceedings upon divorce by mutual consent ...... 137
  2.2.3. Reflection period ................................................................. 138
  2.2.4. Agreement of spouses on the consequences of divorce .... 138

2.3. Dissolution of marriage as a ground for divorce ............... 141
  2.3.1. Ascertainment of dissolution of marriage ......................... 141
  2.3.2. Factual separation ........................................................... 143
  2.3.3. Reflection period ........................................................... 144
  2.3.4. Agreement of spouses on the consequences of divorce .... 146

3. Maintenance between former spouses ............................................. 147
  3.1. General remarks on maintenance between former spouses .... 147
    3.1.1. The principle of self-sufficiency and state assistance .... 147
    3.1.2. Right to receive maintenance from a family member, including a former spouse .................................................. 149
    3.1.3. Relationship between a former spouse's right to maintenance and joint property regime and the grounds for divorce ................................................................. 151
  3.2. Specific issues concerning maintenance between former spouses . 152
    3.2.1. Creation of the right to receive maintenance ................. 152
    3.2.2. Termination of the maintenance obligation .................... 155
    3.2.3. Payment of maintenance .............................................. 157
    3.2.4. The amount of support ................................................ 159
    3.2.5. Exemption from and restriction of maintenance obligation ................................................................. 161
    3.2.6. Multiplicity of maintenance claims ............................... 161
    3.2.7. Maintenance agreement ............................................. 163

4. Conclusions .............................................................................. 164

LEGAL REGULATION OF DIVORCE IN THE CIVIL CODE OF THE REPUBLIC OF LITHUANIA AS COMPARED TO THE CEFL PRINCIPLES
Ingas Kudinaviciute-Michailoviene ............................................. 167

1. Introduction ........................................................................... 167
2. Divorce .................................................................................. 168
3. Maintenance between former spouses ................................. 174
PART THREE – AN ASPIRANT CANDIDATE: DO VALUES CLASH?

TURKISH FAMILY LAW FACING THE PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW

Esin Örücü 183

1. Introduction 183
2. Setting the Turkish Scene 185
   2.1. The Importance of Civil Marriage for the Official Legal System 185
   2.2. A Woman's Surname 187
3. Specific Issues Relevant to our Research Areas 188
   3.1. Matrimonial Property 188
   3.2. Grounds for Divorce 190
   3.3. Consequences of Divorce 196
   3.4. Parental Rights and Custody 198
4. Assessment thus far 198
5. Turkish Family Law Juxtaposed to the Principles of European Family Law 201
   5.1. Divorce 201
      5.1.1. General Principles 201
      5.1.2. Divorce by Mutual Consent 202
      5.1.3. Divorce without the consent of one of the spouses 203
   5.2. Maintenance Between Former Spouses 204
      5.2.1. General Principles 204
      5.2.2. Conditions for the attribution of maintenance 205
      5.2.3. Specific Issues 207
6. Concluding Remarks 208

PART FOUR – COMPARATIVE ASSESSMENT

THE NATIONAL LEGAL SYSTEMS JUXTAPOSED TO THE CEFL PRINCIPLES: HARMONIOUS IDEALS?

Jane Mair 213

1. Chapter I: Divorce 215
   1.1. Part I: General Principles 215
      1.1.1. Principle 1:1 215
      1.1.2. Principle 1:2 216
THE PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW PUT TO THE TEST: DIVERSITY IN HARMONY OR HARMONY IN DIVERSITY?

Esin Örücü

1. Introduction ................................................................. 233
2. Harmony may be necessary but CEFL Principles have short-falls ........ 234
  2.1. Divorce .............................................................. 235
      2.1.1. General Principles ........................................... 235
      2.1.2. Divorce by mutual consent ................................ 237
      2.1.3. Divorce without the consent of one of the spouses ...... 240
  2.2. Maintenance ......................................................... 241
      2.2.1. General Principles ........................................... 241
      2.2.2. Conditions for the attribution of maintenance .......... 242
      2.2.3. Specific issues ................................................ 246
3. Harmonisation is rejected as a top-down model ......................... 250
## Table of Contents

**ANNEXES: THE QUESTIONNAIRE AND THE PRINCIPLES**

- QUESTIONNAIRE: GROUNDS FOR DIVORCE AND MAINTENANCE BETWEEN FORMER SPOUSES ........................................ 257
- PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW REGARDING DIVORCE AND MAINTENANCE BETWEEN FORMER SPOUSES .............. 265