

**SUPRANATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW:
A SYSTEM *SUI GENERIS***

**ROELOF HAVEMAN, OLGA KAVRAN,
JULIAN NICHOLLS (EDS.)**

Publication of the Grotius Centre for International
Legal Studies, Leiden University/Campus The Hague

Intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – New York

Distribution for the UK:

Hart Publishing
Salter's Boat Yard
Folly Bridge
Abingdon Road
Oxford OX1 4LB
UK
Tel: + 44 1865 24 55 33
Fax: + 44 1865 79 48 82

Distribution for North America:

Transnational Publishers
410 Saw Mill River Road
Ardsley
New York 10502-2615
USA
Tel: + 1 914 693 5100
Fax: + 1 914 693 4430

*Distribution for Switzerland and
Germany:*

Schulthess Verlag
Zwingliplatz 2
CH-8022 Zürich
Switzerland
Tel: + 41 1 251 93 36
Fax: + 41 1 261 63 94

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishers
Churchillaan 108
2900 Schoten
Belgium
Tel: + 32 3 680 15 50
Fax: + 32 3 658 71 21

Supranational Criminal Law: A System *Sui Generis*
Roelof Haveman, Olga Kavran, Julian Nicholls (eds.)

© 2003 Intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – New York
<http://www.intersentia.com>

ISBN 90-5095-314-X
D/2003/7849/44
NUR 824

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS	xiii
---------------------	------

I. INTRODUCTION: A SYSTEM <i>SUI GENERIS</i> ROELOF HAVEMAN	1
--	---

1. Introduction	1
2. Supranational Criminal Law: A System <i>Sui Generis</i>	3
3. Topics	6

II. THE CONTEXT OF THE LAW ROELOF HAVEMAN	9
--	---

1. Introduction	9
2. The Tribunals	10
2.1 Nuremberg, Tokyo	10
2.2 (Former) Yugoslavia, Rwanda	14
2.3 International Criminal Court	17
2.4 Conclusion	19
3. Interpretation of the Law	20
4. The Facts	22
5. National Law V. Supranational Law	25
6. Criminal Law V. International Humanitarian Law	31
7. Common Law V. Civil Law	33
8. Summary and Conclusion	37

III. THE PRINCIPLE OF LEGALITY ROELOF HAVEMAN	39
--	----

1. Introduction	39
2. The Principle of Legality in Civil and Common Law	40
2.1 Lex Scripta et Certa	41
2.2 Non-retroactivity	44
2.3 Analogy	45
2.4 Common features	49
3. Background of the Principle of Legality	50
4. International Humanitarian Law	53

5.	Defining Crimes: <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i>	57
5.1	The ad hoc Tribunals	57
5.2	The ICC	60
6.	Punishments: <i>Nulla Poena Sine Lege</i>	63
6.1	The Rules on Punishment	64
6.2	Nulla Poena	66
6.3	(Former) Yugoslavia	68
6.4	Nulla Poena: Conclusion	72
7.	The Trias Politica: Rules of Procedure and Evidence	73
8.	Summary and Conclusion	75

IV. LEGAL PROCEDURES AT THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT

	PAUL DE HERT	79
1.	Introduction	79
2.	A Retrospective Look At Constitutional Development in the West Regarding Criminal Procedures	81
2.1	Criminal Procedures and American Constitutional Law ..	81
2.2	Criminal Procedures and European Constitutional Law ..	85
2.3	A Binding Element is Partially Lacking for an International Criminal Procedure	89
2.4	An Additional Problem: the Refusal to Globalise	90
2.5	The Problem of Language and Judicial Culture	91
3.	First Meeting Between Legal Traditions: the Investigation Phase	96
3.1	Who does the Investigation?	96
3.2	Pre-Trial Chamber	98
3.3	Rights during the Investigation	100
3.4	Review of the Chosen Procedure	101
4.	Second Meeting: the Trial Phase	104
4.1	A short Summary of the Court's Trial Procedure	104
4.2	The Right of Access to a Jury	106
4.3	The Ban on Default Procedures	108
4.4	The Expediency of the Guilty Plea	109
4.5	The Law of Evidence in America	112
4.6	European Evidential Law	113
4.7	The Exclusionary Rule in the European Tradition	115
4.8	The Law of Evidence in the Statute	117
4.9	Review of Choices made Concerning the Trial Phase ...	119

5.	Third Meeting: the Appeal Phase	120
5.1	Procedure	120
5.2	Background	121
5.3	Evaluation	124
6.	Judging the Choices Made	125
V.	THE <i>SUI GENERIS</i> RULES OF PROCEDURE AND EVIDENCE	
	OLGA KAVRAN	129
1.	Introduction	129
2.	General Outline of the Rules	130
2.1	An Overview of the Current Procedure	130
2.2	Main Features of the Current Procedure	133
2.2.1	Professional Judges and Rules of Evidence	133
2.2.2	Prosecutorial Discretion, Guilty Plea, Immunity and Plea Agreement	135
2.2.3	Victims and Witnesses	136
2.2.4	Written and Reasoned Judgements and Appellate Review	137
2.2.5	Rule 61 Hearing	138
2.2.6	Other features	139
3.	Major Changes to the Criminal Procedure System	140
3.1	Introduction	140
3.2	Guilty Plea and Plea Agreement	142
3.3	Pre-Trial Proceedings	145
3.4	Witness Interrogation and Presentation of Evidence	150
3.5	Other Rules Increasing the Power of the Judges	151
3.6	Other Amendments Inspired by the Inquisitorial Model of Criminal Procedure	153
4.	Rational Development Or Crisis Management: Is It a System <i>Sui Generis</i> ?	155
4.1	Guilty Plea and Plea Agreement	155
4.2	Pre-trial Procedure	157
4.3	Evidence	158
4.4	Other amendments inspired by the Inquisitorial Model and Increasing the Judges' Powers	160
5.	Threats	160
5.1	Provisional detention	160
5.2	Illegal arrest	161
6.	Conclusion; Some Observations	162

VI. DEFENCE AND FAIR TRIAL	
CAROLINE BUISMAN	167
1. Introduction	167
2. The International Standard of Fairness	169
3. The Overall Right to A Fair Trial	172
3.1 Scope of the right to a fair trial: Ad hoc Tribunals	172
3.1.1 Subject to Art. 22 of the Statute	173
3.1.2 Omissions	174
3.1.3 Lack of protection for the suspect	175
3.2 Implementation of the principles of a fair trial: <i>Ad hoc</i> Tribunals	179
3.3 Overall right to a fair trial: ICC legislation	183
4. Right to Be Tried by An Independent and Impartial Tribunal Established by Law	186
4.1 Are the ad hoc Tribunals established by law?	186
4.1.1 Pre-establishment	187
4.1.2 Non-observance of certain legal codes	190
4.1.3 Comments of the Author	191
4.2 Are the ad hoc Tribunals independent?	195
4.2.1 Structure of the ad hoc Tribunals	195
(i) The Judges	196
(ii) The Prosecutors	197
4.2.2 Operation of the ad hoc Tribunals	198
(i) Pressure from local governments	199
(ii) Pressure from international institutions	202
(iii) Pressure from the UN organs	203
(iv) Pressure from the watching international community	204
4.3 Are the judges of the ad hoc Tribunals impartial?	205
4.4 Right to be tried by an independent and impartial tribunal established by law: ICC legislation	209
5. Presumption of Innocence	211
5.1 The concept of presumption of innocence as developed by the human rights courts	211
5.2 Practice of the ad hoc Tribunals	213
5.3 Presumption of Innocence: ICC legislation	216
6. Equality of Arms	217
6.1 The scope of equality of arms	218
6.2 Position of the ad hoc Tribunals	219
6.2.1 Interpretation of equality of arms by the judges	219
6.2.2 Right to assistance of competent counsel	221

(i) Personal strength	222
(ii) Institutional strength	227
6.2.3 Right of access to adequate resources	229
6.3 Equality of Arms: ICC legislation	231
7. Concluding Remarks	232
VII. EVIDENCE: HEARSAY AND ANONYMOUS WITNESSES	
JULIAN NICHOLLS	239
1. Introduction	239
2. The Problem with Hearsay	240
2.1 Intrinsic Considerations: Reliability	241
2.2 Extrinsic Considerations: Policy	244
3. The Adversarial System	247
3.1 Characteristics	247
3.2 Strengths	248
3.3 Weaknesses	249
3.4 The Hearsay Rule, Cross-examination and the Right to Confrontation	252
3.4.1 The Function of Cross-examination	252
3.4.2 The Intersection of the Hearsay Rule and the Right to Confrontation	253
3.4.3 The Intersection of the Right to Confrontation and Witness Anonymity	254
4. The Inquisitorial System	255
4.1 Characteristics	255
4.2 Strengths	258
4.3 Weaknesses	260
4.4 The Hearsay Rule, Cross-examination and the Right to Confrontation	263
4.4.1 The Function of Cross-examination	263
4.4.2 The Intersection of the Hearsay Rule and the Right to Confrontation	263
4.4.3 The Intersection of the Right to Confrontation and Witness Anonymity	264
5. Hearsay, Witness Anonymity and Confrontation: An International Due Process Standard?	264
5.1 The Right to Confrontation: the Rights required by the ECHR	264
5.1.1 Case Law: <i>Kostovski and beyond</i>	266

5.2	Limitations on the ECHR Right to Confrontation	269
5.3	Conclusions: the ECHR Right to Confrontation	271
6.	<i>Ad Hoc</i> Tribunals: Trial Proceedings in the ICTY	272
6.1	Historical Context	272
6.2	Hearsay, the Right to Confrontation, Cross-examination and Witness Protection	274
6.2.1	Statutory Provisions	274
6.2.2	The ICTY Case Law: Tadić	278
6.3	Hearsay and Affidavit Evidence	289
6.3.1	Statutory Provisions	289
6.3.2	Case Law: Tadić and beyond – a Rejection of the Hearsay Rule	290
6.3.3	Case Law: Kordić – Introduction of the Dossier into the ICTY system	296
6.3.4	Assessment	297
7.	The Future Permanent International Criminal Court	298
7.1	A Prohibition of Anonymous Witnesses at Trial	298
7.2	Hearsay	299
8.	Conclusion	300

VIII. AMNESTY AND THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ICC

	KARLIJN VAN DER VOORT & MARTEN ZWANENBURG	305
1.	Introduction	305
2.	The Duty to Prosecute Under International Law	307
2.1	Introduction	307
2.2	An Explicit Duty to Prosecute in Treaties	308
2.3	A General Duty to Prosecute in Human Rights Treaties	311
2.4	Customary International Law and the Duty to Prosecute	313
2.5	Conclusion	314
3.	Amnesties Versus Prosecutions – A Moral Perspective	315
3.1	Introduction	315
3.2	Can Amnesty be Desirable?	315
3.3	Does Justice Always Call for Prosecutions?	318
3.4	Border between Prosecutions and Amnesties	320
4.	The Rome Statute	322
5.	Amnesties in the Context of Ratification of the Rome Statute	325
5.1	The Relationship between the Statute and National Constitutions	325
5.2	Review of the Statute for Compatibility with the Constitution.	326

6.	Country Studies	328
6.1	Colombia	328
6.2	Costa Rica	331
6.3	Ecuador	332
6.4	Uruguay	333
6.5	The Netherlands	336
6.6	France	338
6.7	South Africa	339
6.8	Analysis of the Country Studies	340
7.	Conclusion	342
IX.	EPILOGUE: A SYSTEM <i>SUI GENERIS</i>	
	ROELOF HAVEMAN	347
	LITERATURE	353

ABBREVIATIONS

ACHR	African Charter on Human Rights
AIDP	Association Internationale de Droit Pénal
CDR	Coalition for the Defence of the Republic
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECmHR	European Commission on Human Rights
ECrtHR	European Court on Human Rights
FPR	Rwandese Patriotic Front
HRC	Human Rights Committee
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICDAA	International Criminal Defence Attorneys Association
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
ILA	International Law Association
ILC	International Law Commission
MRND	National Revolutionary Movement for Democracy and Development
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
OtP	Office of the Prosecutor
RPE	Rules of Procedure and Evidence
SC	Security Council
SFOR	Stabilization Force Bosnia Herzegovina
SFRY	Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia
UN	United Nations
UNAMIR	United Nations Assistance Mission to Rwanda
UNCSCW	United Nations Commission on the Status of Women