

Towards International Personality:
The Position of Minorities and Indigenous Peoples
in International Law

To Adam

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 10

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Towards International Personality:
The Position of Minorities and Indigenous
Peoples in International Law

Anna Meijknecht

INTERSENTIA – HART
Antwerpen – Groningen – Oxford

This volume is an adapted version of a dissertation defended at Tilburg University on 18 May 2001.

Anna Meijknecht
Towards International Personality: The Position of Minorities
and Indigenous Peoples in International Law

ISBN 90-5095-166-X
D/2001/7849/12
NUGI 698

© 2001 INTERSENTIA Antwerpen – Groningen – Oxford

Behoudens uitzondering door de wet gesteld, mag zonder schriftelijke toestemming van de rechthebbende(n) op het auteursrecht c.q. de uitgevers van deze uitgave, door de rechthebbende(n) gemachtigd namens hem (hen) op te treden, niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of anderszins, hetgeen ook van toepassing is op de gehele of gedeeltelijke bewerking. De uitgevers zijn met uitsluiting van ieder ander herroepelijk door de auteur gemachtigd de door derden verschuldigde vergoedingen van kopiëren, als bedoeld in artikel 17 lid 2 der Auteurswet 1912 en in het KB van 20-6-'64 (Stb. 351) ex artikel 16b der Auteurswet 1912, te doen innen door (en overeenkomstig de reglementen van) de Stichting Reprerecht te Antwerpen.

Niets uit deze uitgave mag worden verveelvoudigd en/of openbaar gemaakt door middel van druk, fotocopie, microfilm of op welke andere wijze ook, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgevers.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photo copy, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

‘The Alsace can exist without France, but France cannot exist without the Alsace.’ The professor at Université Robert Schuman in Strasbourg who made this – questionable – statement in 1994 probably did not realise that his words would signify for me the beginning of six years of reading, thinking, and writing about minorities and indigenous peoples and their position in international law. In 1995, this resulted in a Master’s thesis at the University of Leiden, and, after four years as a Ph.D. student (AIO) at the Schoordijk Institute in Tilburg, in this dissertation.

These years in Tilburg were intensive but happy years, during which I met many new colleagues, friends, and even a husband. I owe a great deal to my supervisor Professor Ernst Hirsch Ballin. Apart from many inspiring discussions during which he often surprised me by his inventive suggestions and comments on my work, he also stimulated me to think and work independently. Thanks are also due to Professor Willem van Genugten whose suggested improvements were invaluable and to Ineke Sijtsma who patiently corrected the English spelling and grammar of the manuscript.

My visit to the Connecticut School of Law in Hartford in 1997 was useful: not only the hours spent in the library, but especially the discussions with Professors Janis and Morawetz and my stay with Gitte and Douglass broadened my horizon.

The discussions and brainstorm sessions with Yvonne Donders, Kristin Henrard, Barbara Oomen, and Sasja Tempelman, in the framework of our ‘minority group’ and the School of Human Rights Research, were very encouraging and often strengthened my enthusiasm for my work.

With Sanne, Machteld, and Astrid, I did not only share a room, but also many ups and some downs in our lives as AIOs and friends. Also Ania, Ilja, Freijkje, Margreth, and Vanessa have contributed to this dissertation by distracting me from my work and enabling me to put it into perspective. To my parents and Timon I owe more than I can express here. Our little Marit was, during this last year, the reason to finish this book; just as my brother Adam, to whom I dedicate this book, was the reason to begin it.

Tilburg, 26 February 2001

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	v
List of Abbreviations	xiii

Chapter I

Areas of Tension Concerning the Sovereignty of States

1.	Introduction	1
2.	Sovereign States	2
2.1.	The Act of State Doctrine	2
2.2.	The Principle of Non-Intervention	3
2.3.	Dualism and Monism	5
2.4.	Conclusion	8
3.	The International Community	9
4.	The 'People'	11
5.	Reasons to Protect Minorities and Indigenous Peoples	13
5.1.	Minorities	14
5.2.	Indigenous Peoples	17
6.	Conclusions	19

Chapter II

Elements of International Personality

1.	Introduction	23
2.	International Personality in the <i>Reparation for Injuries</i> Case	23
2.1	Personality	26
2.1.1.	Introduction	26
2.2.	Sources of Legal Personality	28
3.	International Legal Capacity	32
3.1.	The Distinction Between the Concepts of International Legal Capacity and International Legal Subjectivity	32
3.2.	Elements of Factual Existence	35
3.2.1.	Autonomy	36
3.2.2.	Will	37
3.2.2.1.	The Content of the Will	40
3.2.3.	Recognition	42

4.	Subjects of International Law	45
4.1.	The Subject-Object Dichotomy	46
4.2.	The Relation Between Legal Subjectivity and Legal Capacity	49
4.3.	Rejection of the Subject-Object Dichotomy	50
4.4.	Practice	52
4.5.	‘Subjects to a Lesser Extent’	55
5.	International <i>Jus Standi</i>	56
5.1.	<i>Jus standi</i> in Relation to the Concepts of Legal Capacity and Legal Subjectivity	58
6.	International Personality: Conclusions	61

Chapter III

The Factual Existence of Minorities and Indigenous Peoples and Their Legal Capacity

1.	Introduction	65
2.	Factual Existence versus Legal Existence	66
3.	Factual Existence of Minorities	67
3.1.	Definitions of ‘Minority’	69
4.	The Existence of Indigenous Peoples	71
4.1.	‘Minorities’ versus ‘Indigenous Peoples’?	74
5.	The Existence of Minorities and Indigenous Peoples According to Objective Criteria	77
5.1.	The Numerical Factor	77
5.2.	Non-Dominance	79
5.3.	Distinctiveness	80
5.4.	Nationality	83
5.5.	Concluding Remarks Concerning the Objective Criteria	85
6.	The Existence of Minorities and Indigenous Peoples According to Subjective Criteria	86
6.1.	The Will to Exist as a Separate Entity	87
6.2.	Sense or Sentiment of Solidarity	89
7.	Balancing Between Objective and Subjective Criteria	92
8.	The Content of the Will	93
8.1.	Preservation of Culture, Traditions, Religion, or Language	93
8.1.1.	What is a ‘Minority Culture’?	94
8.1.2.	To What Extent Should a Minority Culture be Protected?	96
8.2.	To Achieve Equality with the Majority in Law and in Fact	98
8.2.1.	History	98
8.2.2.	Present Legal Practice	101
8.3.	Conclusion	103
9.	Expression of the Will: Representation	103
9.1.	Common Interests	105

9.2.	Do Interests Preexist Representation?	106
9.3.	Recognition of the Representative	107
9.3.1.	Internal Recognition of the Representative	108
9.3.2.	External Recognition of the Representative	110
9.3.3.	External Recognition of Indigenous Peoples' Representatives	111
10.	Summary and Conclusions: From Factual to Legal Existence of Minorities and Indigenous Peoples	114

Chapter IV

Minorities and Indigenous Peoples as Subjects of International Law

1.	Introduction	121
2.	League of Nations: Different Approaches	122
2.1.	Conclusion	127
3.	The Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the European Convention on Human Rights: The Individual as a Subject of Rights	129
3.1.	Rejection of the Strict Individual Approach	131
4.	Article 27 ICCPR: Minorities Perceived as Groups of Individuals	132
4.1.	Conclusion	135
5.	Other International Documents	136
5.1.	The UN Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities: A Mix of Approaches	137
5.2.	Conclusion: The Status of Minorities According to Article 27 ICCPR and the Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities	138
6.	Languages Charter: Protection of Languages	140
7.	A Framework Approach: Positive Obligations for States	141
8.	OSCE: Minority Organisations	146
9.	Indigenous and Tribal Peoples: A Collective Approach?	148
9.1.	ILO Conventions Nos. 107 and 169	148
9.2.	UN Draft Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples: Collective Rights	152
9.2.1.	The Preamble	153
9.2.2.	Collective Rights	154
9.2.2.1.	Combination of Approaches	156
9.2.2.2.	Conclusion Concerning Collective Rights	160
9.2.3.	The Right of Self-Determination	160
9.2.3.1.	The Right of Self-Determination in the Views of the Different Parties Involved in the Drafting Process	162

9.2.3.2.	The Right of Self-Determination According to the Text of the Draft Declaration	164
9.2.3.3.	Conclusion Concerning the Right of Self-Determination	165
9.3.	General Conclusions Concerning the UN Draft Declaration	166
10.	Summary and Conclusions	167
10.1.	Indirect Approach: Object or Beneficiary of Obligations of the State	168
10.2.	Direct Approach: Subject	170
10.3.	Semi-Direct Approach	172
10.4.	Mosaic of Approaches	173

Chapter V

Minorities, Indigenous Peoples, and Their Competence to Bring an International Claim – *Jus Standi*

1.	Introduction	175
2.	International <i>Jus Standi</i> in Relation to Legal Capacity and Legal Subjectivity	176
3.	The Concept of International <i>Jus Standi</i>	177
4.	Access to the International Court of Justice	178
5.	Access to the Human Rights Committee: The Optional Protocol Procedure	182
5.1.	The Relation Between Article 1 of the Optional Protocol and Article 27 ICCPR	183
5.2.	The <i>Lubicon Lake Band</i> Case and Subsequent Cases	184
5.2.1.	‘Being Affected’ or ‘Being a Victim’	185
5.2.2.	‘Group of Individuals’, ‘Similarly Affected’, ‘Collectively Submitting a Communication’	187
5.2.3.	Role of the Representative	189
5.3.	Conclusion Concerning the Optional Protocol Procedure	190
6.	Groups of Individuals and NGOs	191
6.1.	Article 14 ICERD	191
6.2.	Article 34 ECHR	192
7.	Alternatives	195
7.1.	The Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, Articles 44-46 ACHR	195
7.2.	Inter-State Applications	198
7.3.	The 1503-Procedure	199
7.4.	The Working Group on Minorities and the Working Group on Indigenous Populations	201
7.5.	OSCE: The High Commissioner on National Minorities	203
8.	Developments Towards an International <i>Jus Standi</i> for Indigenous Peoples?	204
8.1.	The UN Permanent Forum	205

8.1.1.	Mandate	206
8.1.2.	Membership	208
8.1.3.	Position of the Forum within the UN System	209
9.	Conclusions	210
Chapter VI		
Minorities, Indigenous Peoples, and International Personality: Conclusions		
1.	Introduction	215
2.	International Personality	216
3.	Minorities ‘as such’: International Legal Capacity	218
4.	Individuals Belonging to a Minority: The Link Between International Legal Subjectivity and International <i>Jus Standi</i>	219
5.	Indigenous Peoples: The Meaning of International <i>Jus Standi</i> for International Personality	222
6.	The Definition of International Personality by the ICJ	224
7.	Further Perspectives	225
8.	The Divergence Between Minorities and Indigenous Peoples	226
	Summary	229
	Nederlandse Samenvatting	235
	Bibliography	241
	Table of Cases	253
	Index of names	257
	Index	259
	Curriculum Vitae	269
	School of Human Rights Research Series	271

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

RIAA	United Nations Reports of International Arbitral Awards
ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
ACM	Advies Commissie Mensenrechten / Advisory Committee on Human Rights and Foreign Policy
ADRDM	American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man
BFSP	British and Foreign State Papers
CAT	Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
CAT Committee	Committee Against Torture
CDI	Committee for the Defense of the Indian
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women
CEDAW Committee	Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women
CERD	Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CSCE	Conference on Security and Co-operation in Europe
CTS	Consolidated Treaty Series
DR	Decisions and Reports
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECionHR	European Commission of Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ETS	European Treaty Series
FUNAI	National Indian Foundation
HRC	Human Rights Committee
HCNM	High Commissioner on National Minorities
IACHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
IWGIA	International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs
ILC	International Law Commission
ILO	International Labour Organisation
ILR	International Law Reports

List of Abbreviations

ITA 6	6 th International Tin Agreement
ITC	International Tin Council
KFOR	NATO Kosovo Force
LNOJ	League of Nations Official Journal
LNTS	League of Nations Treaty Series
LON	League of Nations
MRG	Minority Rights Group
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
OSCE	Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
Res.	Resolution
RJO	Rectificatif au Journal Officiel
Ser.	Series
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations Organisation
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UN GA	United Nations General Assembly
UNGAOR	United Nations General Assembly Official Records
UNPO	Unrepresented Peoples Organization
US	United States Reports (Supreme Court)
WGIP	Working Group on Indigenous Populations
WGM	Working Group on Minorities
WHO	World Health Organisation
YECHR	Yearbook of the European Convention on Human Rights