

PARTY AUTONOMY IN EU PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW

European Family Law Series

Published by the Organising Committee of the
Commission on European Family Law

Prof. Katharina Boele-Woelki (Utrecht)

Prof. Frédérique Ferrand (Lyon)

Prof. Cristina González Beilfuss (Barcelona)

Prof. Maarit Jänterä-Jareborg (Uppsala)

Prof. Nigel Lowe (Cardiff)

Prof. Dieter Martiny (Frankfurt/Oder)

Prof. Velina Todorova (Plovdiv)

PARTY AUTONOMY IN EU
PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW

Choice of Court and Choice of Law
in Family Matters and Succession

Jacqueline GRAY

 INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Mews
Wellington Street | Cambridge
CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1223 736 170
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK and
Rest of the World (incl. Eastern Europe)*
NBN International
1 Deltic Avenue, Rooksley
Milton Keynes MK13 8LD
United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe
Lefebvre Sarrut Belgium NV
Hoogstraat 139/6
1000 Brussels
Belgium
Tel: +32 (0)800 39 067
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada
Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Party Autonomy in EU Private International Law. Choice of Court and Choice of Law in Family Matters and Succession

© Jacqueline Gray 2021

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

ISBN 978-1-78068-974-6
D/2021/7849/5
NUR 822

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

‘Standing on the shoulders of giants’, the well-known quote attributed to Bernard of Chartres (and, more recently, the tagline of Google Scholar), is the phrase that springs to mind when I look back on this research project. For in as much as writing this book has been my own personal challenge, it seems to me that the key to success lies equally in having a network of supportive people who are willing to provide wisdom, collaboration and encouragement throughout the highs and lows that are inevitable on such a journey.

First and foremost, I would like to express my deep gratitude to my supervisor, Prof. Katharina Boele-Woelki. Whilst her insight and innovation helped to establish an invaluable foundation from which to launch this research, the combination of guidance and freedom that she provided throughout created the ideal environment in which to pursue this project. Furthermore, I want to take this opportunity to thank the head of Utrecht Centre for European Research into Family Law (UCERF), Prof. Wendy Schrama, who was ready to offer her support and expertise on a wide range of topics whenever it was required. I also wish to convey my appreciation to the members of the Assessment Committee for their acceptance of this role and for taking the time to provide constructive critique that has aided in the completion of the final version of this manuscript.

I am especially grateful for the diverse opportunities that being part of UCERF and the wider Molengraaff Institute for Private Law has brought me during these past years. Undertaking this research in a setting which seamlessly combines an interdisciplinary focus with an international outlook has irrefutably broadened my horizons. However, it is the people who truly make a place, and I am particularly thankful for the many working relationships that have blossomed into wonderful friendships, both in the Netherlands and further afield (most prominently, my two paranymphs during the defence ceremony: Evelien van Wijk-Verhagen and Maximilian Strutz).

Finally, I would like to take the time to acknowledge the unwavering support of my family, in particular my parents, during the course of this research. I am also grateful to my husband, Martin (my own ‘international’ spouse), who has been there to provide an encouraging voice and a listening ear whenever

it was needed. Last, but certainly not least, I wish to thank my daughter, Emilie, whose entrance into my life has provided perspective, challenge and motivation in the delivery of this paper 'baby'.

Jacqueline Gray
July 2020

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>List of Cases</i>	xvii
<i>List of Treaties and Legislation</i>	xxiii

PART I. CONCEPT AND OBJECTIVES

Chapter 1. Introduction	3
1.1. Premise.	3
1.2. Delineation of Party Autonomy	4
1.3. Development in EU Private International Law	5
1.4. Outline of Approach.	13
Chapter 2. Conceptualising Free Will in EU Private International Law Relating to Family Matters and Succession	15
2.1. Introduction	15
2.2. The Intrinsic Value of Free Will in the Party Autonomy Context	15
2.2.1. Requisite Elements of Free Will	16
2.2.2. Freedom as an Intrinsic Justification for Party Autonomy	18
2.2.3. Reconciling the Will of the Parties with the Law	20
2.3. The Value Attached to Free Will in the EU Setting.	23
2.3.1. European Human Rights Framework	23
2.3.2. CJEU Case Law	25
2.4. Free Will in EU Cross-Border Family Matters and Succession	29
2.4.1. Restricted Character	30
2.4.2. Addressing the Needs of Specific Parties.	32
Chapter 3. The Objectives behind the Unification of Private International Law on Family Matters and Succession	35
3.1. Introduction	35
3.2. The Europeanisation of Private International Law on Family Matters and Succession	36
3.2.1. The Changing Nature of Free Movement	36

3.2.2.	The Emergence of the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	38
3.2.3.	The Development of a Suitable Legal Basis	39
3.3.	Obstacle I: Legal Uncertainty	42
3.3.1.	Extricating the Elements of Legal Certainty	42
3.3.1.1.	The Rule of Law	44
3.3.1.2.	Securing a Predictable Outcome	44
3.3.1.3.	The Protection of Legitimate Expectations.	45
3.3.2.	Sources of Legal Uncertainty in EU Cross-Border Family Matters and Succession	47
3.3.2.1.	The Complexity of the Private International Law Framework	48
3.3.2.2.	The Indefinite Nature of the Private International Law Framework	49
3.3.2.3.	Expectations that have Arisen under a Previously Applicable Legal System	50
3.3.2.4.	Entrenched Expectations as to the Effects of a Relationship	51
3.4.	Obstacle II: Lack of Affinity with the Applicable Law	54
3.4.1.	The Components of Close Connection	55
3.4.1.1.	Everyday Life	56
3.4.1.2.	Origin and Culture	57
3.4.1.3.	Situational Affinity.	57
3.4.2.	Difficulty in Securing a Law of Close Connection	58
3.5.	Obstacle III: Practical Hindrances to Accessing Justice	59
3.5.1.	Access to Justice for Parties in Cross-Border Situations	60
3.5.2.	Barriers to Accessing Justice in the Private International Law Setting	61
3.5.2.1.	The Necessity to Travel to Attend Proceedings	61
3.5.2.2.	Complex Proceedings	61
3.5.2.3.	Incompatible Interactions.	63

PART II. PRELIMINARIES OF CHOICE

Chapter 4. Material and Personal Scope.	69
4.1. Introduction	69
4.2. Preliminary Observations	70
4.2.1. The Autonomous Meaning of Concepts in EU Law.	70
4.2.2. Civil Matters	70
4.2.3. International Character	71

4.3.	Matrimonial Matters	73
4.3.1.	Material Scope	74
4.3.2.	Personal Scope	76
4.4.	Property Relations between Spouses and Registered Partners	78
4.4.1.	Material Scope	78
4.4.2.	Personal Scope	82
4.5.	Maintenance Obligations	84
4.5.1.	Material Scope	85
4.5.2.	Personal Scope	89
4.5.2.1.	Debtor	90
4.5.2.2.	Creditor	90
4.6.	Parental Responsibility	92
4.6.1.	Material Scope	93
4.6.2.	Personal Scope	97
4.6.2.1.	Child	97
4.6.2.2.	Holders of Parental Responsibility	97
4.6.2.3.	Parties to the Proceedings	98
4.7.	Succession	100
4.7.1.	Material Scope	100
4.7.2.	Personal Scope	105
4.7.2.1.	Deceased	105
4.7.2.2.	Parties Concerned in the Estate	105
4.8.	Synthesis	107
4.8.1.	Overview of the Findings	107
4.8.2.	Interplay between Related Areas	110
4.8.3.	Gaps to be Addressed	112
Chapter 5. Focus of Choice		113
5.1.	Introduction	113
5.2.	Court	113
5.2.1.	General Delineation	114
5.2.2.	Non-Judicial Authorities	116
5.2.3.	Procedural Guarantees and Requirements	118
5.2.4.	Religious and Other Private Authorities	120
5.2.5.	Arbitral Tribunals	122
5.2.6.	Notification of Non-Judicial Authorities	123
5.3.	Applicable Law	125
5.3.1.	State Law	125
5.3.2.	Universal Scope	126

5.3.3.	Unity of the Law	126
5.3.4.	Exclusion of <i>Renvoi</i>	127
5.4.	Synthesis	128
5.4.1.	Overview of the Findings	128
5.4.2.	Interplay between Related Areas	129
5.4.3.	Gaps to be Addressed	130

PART III. CONTENT OF CHOICE

Chapter 6. Direct Connections	133
6.1. Introduction	133
6.2. Habitual Residence	134
6.2.1. General Description.	134
6.2.2. Choice of Court: Article 4(1)(a) and (c)(ii) of the Maintenance Regulation	139
6.2.3. Choice of Law.	141
6.2.3.1. Article 5(1)(a) and (b) of the Rome III Regulation	141
6.2.3.2. Article 22(1)(a) of the Property Regulations	143
6.2.3.3. Article 8(1)(b) of the Hague Maintenance Protocol	143
6.3. Nationality and Domicile.	144
6.3.1. General Description.	145
6.3.2. Substitution with Domicile.	147
6.3.3. Choice of Court: Article 4(1)(b) of the Maintenance Regulation.	149
6.3.4. Choice of Law.	149
6.3.4.1. Article 5(1)(c) of Rome III, Article 22(1)(b) of the Property Regulations and Article 8(1)(a) of the Hague Maintenance Protocol	150
6.3.4.2. Article 22 of the Succession Regulation	150
6.4. The Place where the Legal Relationship was Created	154
6.4.1. General Description.	154
6.4.2. Choice of Court: Article 7 of the Property Regulations.	154
6.4.3. Choice of Law: Article 22(1)(c) of the Partnership Property Regulation.	156
6.5. Synthesis	156
6.5.1. Overview of Findings	157
6.5.2. Interplay between Related Areas	160
6.5.3. Gaps to be Addressed	163

Chapter 7. Coordinating Provisions	165
7.1. Introduction	165
7.2. Jurisdictions that Decide on Related Matters	166
7.2.1. Article 5 of the Property Regulations	166
7.2.2. Article 4(1)(c)(i) of the Maintenance Regulation.	169
7.2.3. Article 12(1) of the Brussels II Bis Regulation	169
7.3. Laws that Apply to Related Matters	173
7.4. Determining Jurisdiction on the Basis of Applicable Law	174
7.4.1. Article 7 of the Property Regulations	175
7.4.2. Articles 5, 6(b) and 7(b) and (c) of the Succession Regulation.	176
7.5. Designating the Application of the <i>Lex Fori</i>	178
7.5.1. Article 5(1)(d) of Rome III	178
7.5.2. Article 7 of the Hague Maintenance Protocol.	179
7.6. Synthesis	180
7.6.1. Overview of Findings	180
7.6.2. Value Added to the Framework	185
7.6.3. Gaps to be Addressed	188
 Chapter 8. Subsidiary Forms of Party Autonomy	 191
8.1. Introduction	191
8.2. Party Autonomy and Judicial Discretion	191
8.2.1. Article 12(3) of Brussels II Bis	192
8.2.2. Article 15 of Brussels II Bis.	195
8.2.3. Articles 6(a) and 7(a) of the Succession Regulation.	198
8.3. Entering an Appearance before a Court.	199
8.3.1. Article 8 of the Property Regulations	200
8.3.2. Article 5 of the Maintenance Regulation.	201
8.3.3. Article 9 of the Succession Regulation.	202
8.4. Synthesis	203
8.4.1. Overview of Findings	203
8.4.2. Value Added to the Framework	205
8.4.3. Gaps to be Addressed	208
 PART IV. VARIABLES OF CHOICE	
 Chapter 9. Temporal, Formal and Material Requirements	 211
9.1. Introduction	211
9.2. Temporal Limits of Choice	211

9.2.1.	Choice of Court	212
9.2.1.1.	Article 7 of the Property Regulations and Article 4 of the Maintenance Regulation	212
9.2.1.2.	Article 5 of the Property Regulations	213
9.2.1.3.	Articles 5, 6(b) and 7(b) and 7(c) of the Succession Regulation	214
9.2.1.4.	Article 12 of Brussels II Bis	215
9.2.1.5.	Forum Non Conveniens Mechanisms	218
9.2.1.6.	Acceptance of Jurisdiction by Entering an Appearance	218
9.2.2.	Choice of Law	219
9.2.2.1.	Article 5 of Rome III	219
9.2.2.2.	Article 22 of the Property Regulations	220
9.2.2.3.	Article 8 of the Hague Maintenance Protocol	220
9.2.2.4.	Article 7 of the Hague Maintenance Protocol	221
9.2.2.5.	Article 22 of the Succession Regulation	222
9.3.	Formal Validity	222
9.3.1.	Choice of Court	222
9.3.1.1.	Article 7(2) of the Property Regulations	223
9.3.1.2.	Article 4(2) of the Maintenance Regulation	224
9.3.1.3.	Article 5(2) of the Succession Regulation	225
9.3.1.4.	Article 7(c) of the Succession Regulation	225
9.3.1.5.	Article 12 of Brussels II Bis	226
9.3.1.6.	Other Subsidiary Party Autonomy Provisions	227
9.3.2.	Choice of Law	229
9.3.2.1.	Article 7 of Rome III and Article 23 of the Property Regulations	229
9.3.2.2.	Articles 7(2) and 8(2) of the Hague Maintenance Protocol	231
9.3.2.3.	Article 22(2) of the Succession Regulation	232
9.4.	Material or Substantive Validity	236
9.4.1.	Choice of Court	236
9.4.2.	Choice of Law	238
9.4.2.1.	The Rome III Regulation	239
9.4.2.2.	The Property Regulations	239
9.4.2.3.	The Hague Maintenance Protocol	240
9.4.2.4.	The Succession Regulation	241
9.5.	Synthesis	242
9.5.1.	Overview of the Findings	242
9.5.2.	Interplay between Related Areas	246
9.5.3.	Gaps to be Addressed	249

Chapter 10. Enforcement of Choice	253
10.1. Introduction	253
10.2. Exclusivity of Jurisdiction and <i>Lis Pendens</i>	253
10.2.1. Exclusivity of Jurisdiction	254
10.2.2. <i>Lis Pendens</i>	255
10.3. Overriding Mandatory Provisions	256
10.3.1. Article 30 of the Property Regulations	257
10.3.2. Article 30 of the Succession Regulation	259
10.4. Public Policy (<i>Ordre Public</i>)	260
10.4.1. Article 12 of the Rome III Regulation, Article 31 of the Property Regulations and Article 35 of the Succession Regulation	261
10.4.2. Article 13 of the Hague Maintenance Protocol	265
10.5. Substantive Provisions	267
10.5.1. Article 10 of the Rome III Regulation	267
10.5.2. Articles 22(3) and 28 of the Property Regulations	268
10.5.3. Article 6 of the Hague Maintenance Protocol	270
10.5.4. Article 14 of the Hague Maintenance Protocol	270
10.6. (Non-)Recognition of a Relationship	271
10.6.1. General Approach	272
10.6.2. Article 13 of Rome III	278
10.6.3. Article 9 of the Property Regulations	279
10.7. The Impact of Enhanced Cooperation	279
10.7.1. The Rome III Regulation	281
10.7.2. The Property Regulations	282
10.8. Synthesis	283
10.8.1. Overview of the Findings	283
10.8.2. Interplay between Related Areas	286
10.8.3. Gaps to be Addressed	290

PART V. CONCLUSION

Chapter 11. Concluding Synthesis	297
11.1. Introduction	297
11.2. Legal Certainty	297
11.2.1. General Findings	298
11.2.2. Impact of the Interplay between Related Areas	302
11.2.3. Gaps to be Addressed	304

11.3.	Affinity with the Applicable Law	306
11.3.1.	General Findings	306
11.3.2.	Impact of the Interplay between Related Areas	309
11.3.3.	Gaps to be Addressed	309
11.4.	Practical Considerations in Accessing Justice	310
11.4.1.	General Findings	311
11.4.2.	Impact of the Interplay between Related Areas	313
11.4.3.	Gaps to be Addressed	317
11.5.	The Manifestation of Free Will in the Present Framework	318
11.5.1.	General Findings	319
11.5.2.	Impact of the Interplay between Related Areas	326
11.5.3.	Gaps to be Addressed	327
11.6.	Closing Remarks	330
	<i>Bibliography</i>	333
	<i>Index</i>	345

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Brussels I Regulation	Council Regulation (EC) No 44/2001 of 22 December 2000 on jurisdiction and the recognition and enforcement of judgments in civil and commercial matters [2001] OJ L 12/1
Brussels I Recast Regulation	Council Regulation (EC) No 1215/2012 of 12 December 2012 on jurisdiction and the recognition and enforcement of judgments in civil and commercial matters (Recast) OJ L 351/1
Brussels II bis Regulation	Council Regulation (EC) No 2201/2003 of 27 November 2003 concerning jurisdiction and the recognition and enforcement of judgments in matrimonial matters and the matters of parental responsibility [2003] L 338/1
Brussels IIa (Recast) Regulation	Council Regulation (EU) 2019/1111 of 25 June 2019 on jurisdiction, the recognition and enforcement of decisions in matrimonial matters and the matters of parental responsibility, and on international child abduction [2019] OJ L 178/1 [in force from 1 August 2022]
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EU	European Union
EU Charter of Fundamental Rights	Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union
Hague Maintenance Protocol	Hague Protocol of 23 November 2007 on the Law Applicable to Maintenance Obligations
Maintenance Regulation	Council Regulation (EC) No. 4/2009 of 18 December 2008 on jurisdiction, applicable law, recognition and enforcement of decisions and cooperation in matters relating to maintenance obligations [2009] OJ L 7/1

Matrimonial Property Regulation	Council Regulation (EU) 2016/1103 of 24 June 2016 implementing enhanced cooperation in the area of jurisdiction, applicable law and the recognition and enforcement of decisions in matters of matrimonial property regimes [2016] OJ L 183/1
Partnership Property Regulation	Council Regulation (EU) 2016/1104 of 24 June 2016 implementing enhanced cooperation in the area of jurisdiction, applicable law and the recognition and enforcement of decisions in matters of the property consequences of registered partnerships [2016] OJ L 183/30
Property Regulations	Collective reference to both the Partnership Property Regulation and the Matrimonial Property Regulation (above)
Rome I Regulation	Council Regulation (EC) No. 593/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 17 June 2008 on the law applicable to contractual obligations (Rome I) [2008] OJ L 177/6
Rome II Regulation	Council Regulation (EC) No. 864/2007 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 July 2007 on the law applicable to non-contractual obligations (Rome II) [2007] OJ L 199/40
Rome III Regulation	Council Regulation (EU) No. 1259/2010 of 20 December 2010 implementing enhanced cooperation in the area of the law applicable to divorce and legal separation [2010] L 343/10
Succession Regulation	Regulation (EU) No. 650/2012 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 4 July 2012 on jurisdiction, applicable law, recognition and enforcement of decisions and acceptance and enforcement of authentic instruments in matters of succession and on the creation of a European Certificate of Succession [2012] L 201/107
TEU	Treaty on European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

LIST OF CASES

SUPRANATIONAL JURISPRUDENCE

CJEU

Case 98/78 <i>A. Racke GmbH & Co. v. Hauptzollamt Mainz</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Bundesfinanzhof – Germany [1979] ECR 69	49
Case C-523/07 <i>A</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Korkein hallinto-oikeus – Finland [2009] ECR I-02805	71, 136
Case C-184/14 <i>A v. B</i> . Request for a preliminary ruling from the Corte suprema di cassazione – Italy [2015] ECLI:EU:C:2015:479	96
Case C-169/80 <i>Administration des douanes v. Société anonyme Gondrand Frères and Société anonyme Garancini</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Cour de cassation – France [1981] ECR 1931	43
Case 232/81 <i>Agricola commerciale olio Srl and others v. Commission of the European Communities</i> [1984] ECR 3881	46
Case C-218/16 <i>Aleksandra Kubicka v. Przemysława Bac</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Sąd Okręgowy w Gorzowie Wielkopolskim – Poland [2017] ECLI:EU:C:2017:755.....	82
Case C-565/16 <i>Alessandro Saponaro and Kalliopi-Chloi Xylina</i> . Request for a preliminary ruling from the Eirinodikeio Lerou – Greece [2018] ECLI:EU:C:2018:265.....	96
Case C-565/16 <i>Alessandro Saponaro and Kalliopi-Chloi Xylina</i> . Request for a preliminary ruling from the Eirinodikeio Lerou – Greece [2018] ECLI:EU:C:2017:942 (AG Opinion).....	171
Case C-281/02 <i>Andrew Owusu v N.B. Jackson, trading as ‘Villa Holidays Bal-Inn Villas’ and Others</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Court of Appeal (England and Wales), Civil Division – United Kingdom [2005] ECR I-1445	197
Case C-220/95 <i>Antonius van den Boogaard v Paula Laumen</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Arrondissementsrechtbank Amsterdam – Netherlands [1997] ECR I-1147	62
Case C-497/10 <i>Barbara Mercredi v. Richard Chaffe</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Court of Appeal (England & Wales) (Civil Division) – United Kingdom [2010] ECR I-14309	134
Case C-78/95 <i>Bernardus Hendrikman and Maria Feyen v Magenta Druck & Verlag GmbH</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Hoge Raad – Netherlands [1996] ECR I-4943	262
Case C-4/14 <i>Christophe Bohez v Ingrid Wiertz</i> . Request for a preliminary ruling from the Korkein oikeus – Finland [2014] ECLI:EU:C:2015:563	94
Case C-435/06 <i>C</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Korkein hallinto-oikeus – Finland [2007] ECR I-10141	70

Case C-196/04 <i>Cadbury Schweppes plc and. Commissioners of Inland Revenue</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Special Commissioners of Income Tax, London – United Kingdom [2006] ECR I-7995.....	26
Case T-472/93 <i>Campo Ebro Industrial and Others v. Council</i> [1995] ECR II-421	46
Case C-148/02 <i>Carlos Garcia Avello v. État belge</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Conseil d'État – Belgium [2003] ECR I-11613.....	27
Case C-210/06 <i>Cartesio Oktató és Szolgáltató bt</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Szegedi Ítéltábla – Hungary [2008] ECR I-09641	27
Case C-212/97 <i>Centros Ltd v. Erhvervs- og Selskabsstyrelsen</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Højesteret – Denmark [1999] ECR I-1459	25
Case C-111-09 <i>Česká podnikatelská pojišťovna as, Vienna Insurance Group v Michal Bilas</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Okresní soud v Chebu – Czech Republic [2010] ECR I-4545	200
Case C-428/15 <i>Child and Family Agency v. J.D.</i> Request for a preliminary ruling from the Supreme Court – Ireland [2016] ECLI:EU:C:2016:819	93
Case C-428/15 <i>Child and Family Agency v. J.D.</i> Request for a preliminary ruling from the Supreme Court – Ireland [2016] ECLI:EU:C:2016:458 (AG Opinion)	196
Case C-673/16 <i>Coman and Others v. Romania</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling from the Curtea Constituțională a României [2018] ECLI:EU:C:2018:385.....	29
Case 29/84 <i>Commission of the European Communities v. Federal Republic of Germany</i> [1985] ECR 1661.....	43
Cases C-369/96 <i>Criminal proceedings against Jean-Claude Arblade and Arblade & Fils SARL</i> and C-376/96 <i>Bernard Leloup, Serge Leloup and Sofrage SARL</i> . References for a preliminary ruling: Tribunal correctionnel de Huy – Belgium [1999] ECR I-8453	257
Case C-193/94 <i>Criminal proceedings against Sofia Skanavi and Konstantin Chryssanthakopoulos</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Amtsgericht Tiergarten, Berlin – Germany [1996] ECR I-6193.....	37
Case C-251/12 <i>Christian Van Buggenhout and Ilse Van de Mierop v Banque Internationale à Luxembourg SA</i> . Request for a preliminary ruling from the tribunal de commerce de Bruxelles – Belgium [2013] ECLI:EU:C:2009:474	71
Case 7/98 <i>Dieter Krombach v. André Bamberski</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Bundesgerichtshof – Germany [2000] ECR I-1935.....	262
Case C-558/16 <i>Doris Margret Lisette Mahnkopf</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Kammergericht Berlin – Germany [2018] ECLI:EU:C:2018:138	70
Case C-63/93 <i>Duff and Others v. Minister for Agriculture and Food, Ireland, and the Attorney General</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Supreme Court – Ireland [1996] ECR I-57 2 (AG Opinion)	46
Case C-116/02 <i>Erich Gasser GmbH v. MISAT Srl</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Oberlandesgericht Innsbruck – Austria [2003] ECR I-14693	255
Case C-376/98 <i>Federal Republic of Germany v. European Parliament and Council of the European Union</i> [2000] ECR I-8419	40
Case C-267/12 <i>Frédéric Hay v. Crédit agricole mutuel de Charente-Maritime et des Deux-Sèvres</i> . Request for a preliminary ruling from the Cour de cassation – France [2013] ECLI:EU:C:2013:823	86
Case 314/85 <i>Foto-Frost v. Hauptzollamt Lübeck-Ost</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Finanzgericht Hamburg – Germany [1987] ECR 4199.....	43

Case C-345/06 <i>Gottfried Heinrich</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Unabhängiger Verwaltungssenat im Land Niederösterreich – Austria [2009] ECR I-1659.....	43
Case 48/84 <i>Hannelore Spitzley v. Sommer Exploitation SA</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Oberlandesgericht Koblenz – Germany [1985] ECR 787	200
Case C-92/12 <i>Health Service Executive v. S.C. and A.C.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling from the High Court – Ireland [2012] ECLI:EU:C:2012:255	93
Case 145/86 <i>Horst Ludwig Martin Hoffmann v. Adelheid Krieg</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Hoge Raad – Netherlands [1988] ECR 645.....	262
Case C-208/09 <i>Ilonka Sayn-Wittgenstein v. Landeshauptmann von Wien</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Verwaltungsgerichtshof – Austria [2010] ECR I-13693	28
Case 120/86 <i>J. Mulder v. Minister van Landbouw en Visserij</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: College van Beroep voor het Bedrijfsleven – Netherlands [1988] ECR 2321.....	46
Case 143/78 <i>Jacques de Cavel v. Louise de Cavel</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Bundesgerichtshof – Germany [1979] ECR 1055.....	79
Case 78/77 <i>Johann Lührs v. Hauptzollamt Hamburg-Jonas</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Finanzgericht Hamburg – Germany [1978] ECR 169	47
Case C-167/01 <i>Kamer van Koophandel v. Fabrieken voor Amsterdam and Inspire Art Ltd</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Kantongerecht te Amsterdam – the Netherlands [2003] ECR I-10155.....	25
Case C-189/89 <i>Karl Spagl v. Hauptzollamt Rosenheim</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Finanzgericht München – Germany [1990] ECR I-4539.....	46
Case C-656/13 <i>L. v. M.</i> Request for a preliminary ruling from the Nejvyšší soud – Czech Republic [2014] ECLI:EU:C:2014:2364.....	192
Case C-168/08 <i>Laszlo Hadadi (Hadady) v. Csilla Marta Mesko, épouse Hadadi (Hadady)</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Cour de cassation – France [2009] ECR I-6871	146
Case 120/79 <i>Louise de Cavel v. Jacques de Cavel</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Bundesgerichtshof – Germany [1980] ECR 731	88
Case C-106/95 <i>Mainschiffahrts-Genossenschaft eG (MSG) v. Les Gravières Rhénanes SARL</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Bundesgerichtshof – Germany [1997] ECR I-911	222
Case C-391/09 <i>Malgožata Runevič-Vardyn and Lukasz Paweł Wardyn v. Vilniaus miesto savivaldybės administracija and Others</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Vilniaus miesto 1 apylinkės teismas – Lithuania [2011] ECR I-03787	28
Case C-85/96 <i>María Martínez Sala v. Freistaat Bayern</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Bayerisches Landessozialgericht – Germany [1998] ECR-I 2691	37
Case C-335/17 <i>Neli Valcheva v. Georgios Babanarakis</i> . Request for a preliminary ruling from the Varhoven kasatsionen sad – Bulgaria [2018] ECLI:EU:C:2018:359.....	94
Joined cases C-122/99 <i>P and C-125/99 P D. and Kingdom of Sweden v. Council of the European Union</i> [2001] ECR I-4319	75
Case C-187/93 <i>Parliament v. Council</i> [1994] ECR I-2857.....	40
Case T-90/92 <i>Pedro Magdalena Fernández v. Commission of the European Communities</i> [1993] ECR II-971	136
Case C-195/08 <i>PPU Inga Rinau</i> . Reference for a preliminary ruling: Lietuvos Aukščiausiasis Teismas – Lithuania [2008] ECR I-5271.....	171
Case C-404/14 <i>Proceedings brought by Marie Matoušková</i> . Request for a preliminary ruling from the Nejvyšší soud – Czech Republic [2015] ECLI:EU:C:2015:653	95

Case C-106/16 <i>Proceedings brought by Polbud – Wykonawstwo sp. z o.o.</i> Request for a preliminary ruling from the Sąd Najwyższy – Poland [2017] ECLI:EU:C:2017:804.....	27
Case C-370/90 <i>R v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal and Surinder Singh, ex parte Secretary of State for Home Department.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: High Court of Justice, Queen’s Bench Division – United Kingdom [1990] ECR I-4265.....	37
Case C-38/98 <i>Régie nationale des usines Renault SA v. Maxicar SpA and Orazio Formento.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: Corte d’appello di Torino – Italy [2000] ECR I-2973.....	262
Case C-135/15 <i>Republik Griechenland v. Grigorios Nikiforidis.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: Bundesarbeitsgericht – Germany [2016] ECLI:EU:C:2016:774.....	70
Case 37/70 <i>Rewe-Zentrale des Lebensmittel-Großhandels GmbH v. Hauptzollamt Emmerich.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: Finanzgericht Düsseldorf – Germany [1971] ECR 36.....	47
Case C-90/97 <i>Robin Swaddling v. Adjudication Officer.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: Social Security Commissioner – United Kingdom [1999] ECR I-01075.....	135
Case C-184/99 <i>Rudy Grzelczyk v. Centre public d’aide sociale d’Ottignies-Louvain-la-Neuve.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: Tribunal du travail de Nivelles – Belgium [2001] ECR I-6193.....	37
Case C-284/16 <i>Slowakische Republik v. Achmea BV.</i> Reference for a preliminary: Bundesgerichtshof – Germany [2018] ECLI:EU:C:2018:158.....	123
Case C-372/16 <i>Soha Sahyouni v. Raja Mamisch.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: Oberlandesgericht München – Germany [2017] ECLI:EU:C:2017:988.....	73
Case 264/81 <i>SpA Savma v. Commission of the European Communities</i> [1984] ECR 3915.....	46
Case C-353/06 <i>Stefan Grunkin and Dorothee Regina Paul.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: Amtsgericht Flensburg – Germany [2008] ECR I-7639.....	27
C-267/06 <i>Tadao Maruko v. Versorgungsanstalt der deutschen Bühnen.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: Bayerisches Verwaltungsgericht München – Germany [2008] ECR I-1788.....	86
Case C-524/04 <i>Test Claimants in the Thin Cap Group Litigation v. Commissioners of Inland Revenue.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: High Court of Justice (England & Wales), Chancery Division – United Kingdom [2007] ECR I-02107.....	26
Case C-159/97 <i>Trasporti Castelletti Spedizioni Internazionali SpA v. Hugo Trumpy SpA.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: Corte suprema di cassazione – Italy [1999] ECR I-1597.....	222
Case C-208/00 <i>Überseering BV v. Nordic Construction Company Baumanagement GmbH (NCC).</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: Bundesgerichtshof – Germany [2002] ECR I-09919.....	25
Joined Cases 95/74 to 98/74, 15/75 and 100/75 <i>Union nationale des coopératives agricoles de céréales and others v. Commission and Council of the European Communities</i> [1975] ECR 1615.....	47
Case C-84/94 <i>United Kingdom v. Council</i> [1996] ECR I-5755.....	40
Case C-215/15 <i>Vasilka Ivanova Gogova v. Ilia Dimitrov Iliev.</i> Reference for a preliminary ruling: Varhoven kasatsionen sad – Bulgaria [2015] ECLI:EU:C:2015:710.....	71

ECtHR

<i>E and Others v. Italy</i> (Application no.26431/12), ECtHR (2017)	86
<i>Labasse v. France</i> (Application no.65941/11), ECtHR (2014)	98
<i>Mennesson v. France</i> (Application no. 5192/11), ECtHR (2014)	98
<i>Mazurek v. France</i> (Application no.34406/97), ECtHR (2000)	263
<i>Orlandi and Others v. Italy</i> (Application no.26431/12), ECtHR (2017)	77
<i>Paradiso and Campanelli v. Italy</i> (Application no.25358/12), ECtHR Grand Chamber (2017)	98
<i>Pajić v. Croatia</i> (Application no.68453/13), ECtHR (2016)	86
<i>Pretty v. UK</i> (Application no.2346/02), ECtHR (2002)	24
<i>Wagner and JMWL v. Luxembourg</i> (Application no.76240/01), ECtHR (2007)	24

NATIONAL JURISPRUDENCE

ENGLAND AND WALES

<i>Allcard v. Skinner</i> (1887) 36 Ch D 145	16
<i>Barclays Bank plc v. O'Brien</i> [1993] UKHL 6	16
<i>Black-Clawson International Ltd. v. Papierwerke Waldhof Aschaffenburg</i> [1975] AC 591	44
<i>Bush v. Bush</i> [2008] EWCA Civ 865	172
<i>C. v. C.</i> [2006] EWHC 3247 (Fam)	226
<i>Chester v. Afshar</i> [2004] UKHL 41	17
<i>Giener v. Meyer</i> (1796) 126 ER 726	6
<i>I. (A child)</i> [2009] UKSC 10	193
<i>Johnson v. Machielsne</i> (1811) 170 ER 1300	6
<i>Law v. Garrett</i> (1878) LR 8 Ch D 26 (CA)	6
<i>LK v. K (No. 2)</i> [2006] EWHC 3280 (Fam)	136
<i>Lloyd v. Guibert</i> (1865) LR 1 QB 115	8
<i>Marinos v. Marinos</i> [2007] EWHC 2047 (Fam)	135, 136
<i>Moore v. Moore</i> [2006] ILPr 29 (628)	136
<i>Munro v. Munro</i> [2007] EWHC 3315 (Fam)	136
<i>Nessa v. Chief Adjudication Officer</i> [1999] 1 WLR 1937 (HL) 1941	136
<i>Oundjian v. Oundjian</i> [1979] 1 FLR 198	137
<i>Peninsula and Oriental Steam Navigation Co. v. Shand</i> (1865) 3 Moo NS 272, 16 ER 103	8
<i>Unterweser Reederei GmbH v. Zapata Off-Shore Company</i> [1968] 2 Lloyd's Rep 158	6
<i>Vita Food Products Inc. v. Unus Shipping Co. Ltd.</i> [1939] AC 277	9

BELGIUM

Cour de Cassation 24 Feb 1938, <i>Revue critique de droit international privé</i> 1938, 661	9
---	---

CZECH REPUBLIC

District Court of Rokycany No. 6 C 59/2011 of 20.9.2011	75
---	----

FRANCE

<i>American Trading Co. v. Quebec Steamship Co.</i> , Cour de Cassation 5.12.1910, Clunet (39) 192, 1156	21
Cass.civ. 5 Dec 1910, S. 1911. I. 129.....	9

NETHERLANDS

Rb. Den Haag, 11-07-2013, nr. C/09/443928 FA RK 13-4125.....	93, 216
Rb. Maastricht, 07-09-2012, nr. 167777 / FA RK 11-1688	215
Rb. Alkmaar, 16-04-2008, nr. 101069 / FA RK 08-239	194
Rb. Zutphen, 07-12-2005, nr. 74327 FA RK 05 2206	193
Hoge Raad, 19 maart 1993, NJ 1994, 187, LJN ZC0897.....	53
Hoge Raad, 13 May 1966, NJ 1967 no.3	9

SPAIN

Audiencia Provincial, Valladolid 12.3.2013 (95/2013)	137
Audiencia Provincial de La Rioja (Sección 1ª) Auto num. 25/2012 de 9 marzo JUR/2012/163092.....	193

LIST OF TREATIES AND LEGISLATION

PRIMARY INSTRUMENTS

INTERNATIONAL TREATIES

European Convention on Human Rights (1950)	23
Statute of the Hague Conference on Private International Law (1955)	71
UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989).....	33, 171, 277

EU PRIMARY LEGISLATION

Brussels I Convention on jurisdiction and the enforcement of judgments in civil and commercial matters of 27 September 1968, [1968] OJ L 299	7
Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union [2012] OJ C 326	23
Consolidated version of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union [2016] OJ C 202/47	12
Consolidated version of the Treaty on European Union [2016] OJ C 202/13.....	23
Lugano Convention of 16 September 1988 on jurisdiction and the enforcement of judgments in civil and commercial matters [1988] OJ L 319	7
Lugano Convention of 30 October 2007 on jurisdiction and the enforcement of judgments in civil and commercial matters [2007] OJ L 339/3.....	7
Rome I Convention on the law applicable to contractual obligations of the 9 October 1980 [1980] OJ L 266	9
Treaty of Nice amending the Treaty on European Union, the Treaties establishing the European Communities and certain related acts [2001] OJ L 80/1	39
Treaty establishing the European Economic Community [1992] OJ C 224.....	36
Treaty on European Union [1992] OJ C 191	37
Protocol on the position of Denmark annexed to the Treaty on European Union and the Treaty establishing the European Community (1997) [1997] OJ C 340/101.....	114
Protocol (No. 4) on the position of the United Kingdom and Ireland annexed to the Treaty on European Union and the Treaty establishing the European Community (1997) [2006] OJ C 321E/198.....	114

HAGUE CONFERENCE INSTRUMENTS

Hague Protocol of 23 November 2007 on the Law Applicable to Maintenance Obligations.....	174, 342
Hague Convention of 30 June 2005 on Choice of Court Agreements	7

Hague Convention of 13 January 2000 on the International Protection of Adults	92
Hague Convention of 19 October 1996 on Jurisdiction, Applicable Law, Recognition, Enforcement and Co-operation in Respect of Parental Responsibility and Measures for the Protection of Children.....	11
Hague Convention of 1 August 1989 on the Law Applicable to Succession to the Estates of Deceased Persons	10
Hague Convention of 22 December 1986 on the Law Applicable to Contracts for the International Sale of Goods	240
Hague Convention of 14 March 1978 on Celebration and Recognition of the Validity of Marriages	134
Hague Convention of 14 March 1978 on the Law Applicable to Matrimonial Property Regimes.....	10
Hague Convention of 2 October 1973 on the Law Applicable to Maintenance obligations.....	86
Hague Convention of 25 November 1965 on the Choice of Court	6
Hague Convention of 5 October 1961 Concerning the Powers of Authorities and the Law Applicable in Respect of the Protection of Infants.....	134
Hague Convention of 5 October 1961 on the Conflicts of Laws Relating to the Form of Testamentary Dispositions	233
Hague Convention of 15 June 1955 on the Law Applicable to International Sales of Goods.....	9
Hague Convention of 15 April 1958 on the Jurisdiction of the Selected Forum in the Case of International Sales of Goods.....	6
Hague Convention of 17 July 1905 on the Effects of Marriage	145
Hague Convention of 12 June 1902 on the Settlement of the Guardianship of Minors.....	134

SECONDARY INSTRUMENTS

EU DIRECTIVES

Directive 2004/38/EC on the right of citizens of the Union and their family members to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States [2004] OJ L 158/77.....	37
Council Directive 90/365/EEC of 28 June 1990 on the right of residence for employees and self-employed persons who have ceased their occupational activity [1990] OJ L 180/28	37
Council Directive 90/366/EEC of 28 June 1990 on the right of residence for students [1990] OJ L 180/30	377
Council Directive 90/364/EEC of 28 June 1990 on the right of residence [1990] OJ L 180/20.....	37

EU REGULATIONS

Council Regulation (EU) 2019/1111 of 25 June 2019 on jurisdiction, the recognition and enforcement of decisions in matrimonial matters and the matters of parental responsibility, and on international child abduction [2019] OJ L 178/1	73
---	----

Council Regulation (EU) 2016/1103 of 24 June 2016 implementing enhanced cooperation in the area of jurisdiction, applicable law and the recognition and enforcement of decisions in matters of matrimonial property regimes [2016] OJ L 183/1	12
Council Regulation (EU) 2016/1104 of 24 June 2016 implementing enhanced cooperation in the area of jurisdiction, applicable law and the recognition and enforcement of decisions in matters of the property consequences of registered partnerships [2016] OJ L 183/30.....	12
Council Regulation (EC) No. 1215/2012 of 12 December 2012 on jurisdiction and the recognition and enforcement of judgments in civil and commercial matters (Recast) OJ L 351/1.....	7, 122
Regulation (EU) No. 650/2012 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 4 July 2012 on jurisdiction, applicable law, recognition and enforcement of decisions and acceptance and enforcement of authentic instruments in matters of succession and on the creation of a European Certificate of Succession [2012] L 201/107	124
Council Regulation (EU) No. 1259/2010 of 20 December 2010 implementing enhanced cooperation in the area of the law applicable to divorce and legal separation [2010] L 343/10.....	11
Council Regulation (EC) No. 4/2009 of 18 December 2008 on jurisdiction, applicable law, recognition and enforcement of decisions and cooperation in matters relating to maintenance obligations [2009] OJ L 7/1.....	11
Council Regulation (EC) No. 593/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 17 June 2008 on the law applicable to contractual obligations (Rome I) [2008] OJ L 177/6.....	9
Council Regulation (EC) No. 864/2007 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 July 2007 on the law applicable to non-contractual obligations (Rome II) [2007] OJ L 199/40	9
Council Regulation (EC) No. 2201/2003 of 27 November 2003 concerning jurisdiction and the recognition and enforcement of judgments in matrimonial matters and the matters of parental responsibility [2003] L 338/1.....	11
Council Regulation (EC) No. 44/2001 of 22 December 2000 on jurisdiction and the recognition and enforcement of judgments in civil and commercial matters [2001] OJ L 12/1.....	7
Council Regulation (EC) No. 1346/2000 of 29 May 2000 on insolvency proceedings [2000] OJ L 160/1.....	39
Council Regulation (EC) No. 1348/2000 of 29 May 2000 on the service in the Member States of judicial and extrajudicial documents in civil or commercial matters [2000] OJ L 160/37.....	39
Council Regulation (EC) No. 1347/2000 of 29 May 2000 on jurisdiction and the recognition and enforcement of judgments in matrimonial matters and in matters of parental responsibility for children of both spouses [2000] OJ L 160/19	11

EU PROPOSED INSTRUMENTS

Proposal for a Council Regulation on jurisdiction, the recognition and enforcement of decisions in matrimonial matters and the matters of parental responsibility, and on international child abduction (recast) COM(2016) 411/2 final	341
--	-----

Proposal for a Council Regulation on jurisdiction, applicable law and the recognition and enforcement of decisions in matters of matrimonial property regimes, COM(2016) 106 final.....	34
Proposal for a Council Regulation on jurisdiction, applicable law and the recognition and enforcement of decisions in matters of the property consequences of registered partnerships, COM(2016) 107 final.....	34
Proposal for a Council Regulation (EU) implementing enhanced cooperation in the area of the law applicable to divorce and legal separation, COM(2010) 104 final.....	126
Proposal for a Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council on jurisdiction on jurisdiction, applicable law, recognition and enforcement of decisions and authentic instruments in matters of succession and the creation of a European Certificate of Succession, COM(2009) 154 final.....	34, 103, 106
Proposal for a Council Regulation amending Regulation (EC) No 2201/2003 as regards jurisdiction and introducing rules concerning applicable law in matrimonial matters, COM(2006) 399 final.....	179
Proposal for a Council Regulation on jurisdiction, applicable law, recognition and enforcement of decisions and cooperation in matters relating to maintenance obligations, COM(2005) 649 final	262

NATIONAL LEGISLATION

ENGLAND AND WALES

Mental Capacity Act 2005	17
Rules of the Supreme Court 1920.....	6

NETHERLANDS

Burgerlijk Wetboek	53
--------------------------	----

UNITED STATES

Restatement (Second) of Conflict of Laws (1971).....	21
--	----