

COMPENSATION FUNDS IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

COMPENSATION FUNDS IN
COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

Edited by
Thierry VANSWEEVELT
Britt WEYTS

 INTERSENTIA

Cambridge – Antwerp – Chicago

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Mews
Wellington Street | Cambridge
CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 736 170
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:
NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

Compensation Funds in Comparative Perspective

© The editors and contributors severally 2020

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Image on the cover: © Jacob_09 / Shutterstock

ISBN 978-1-78068-942-5
D/2020/7849/30
NUR 820

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

On 7 June 2016 the Antwerp Liability Law and Insurance Chair (ALLIC)¹ organised an international conference on compensation funds at the University of Antwerp. Experts from several European universities were asked to shed light on this fairly recent phenomenon of compensation law in their respective countries. This book is the result of this conference and further inter-university collaboration between Professors Michael Faure, Ton Hartlief, Gerrit van Maanen (Maastricht University), Jonas Knetsch (Jean-Monnet University Saint-Étienne), Ken Oliphant (University of Bristol), Post-Doctoral Researcher Rosa M. Garcia-Teruel (Rovira I Virgili University) and Doctoral Researchers Larissa Vanhooff and Kim Watts (University of Antwerp).

Since the 2016 conference, there has been no halt to the continued development of compensation funds. Yet there remains a pressing need for further analysis and definition of this field, to better inform the development of these hybrid systems. The contributions within this book are updated to December 2019, and therefore capture the most recent compensation fund developments within the selected jurisdictions.

The importance of compensation funds as a subject is also reflected in two ongoing PhD research projects at the University of Antwerp's Faculty of Law. These projects are funded by ALLIC and the FWO (Research Foundation – Flanders). Larissa Vanhooff is preparing her doctoral thesis on the nature, function and legality of Belgian compensation funds. Kim Watts is preparing her doctoral thesis on comprehensive no-fault compensation funds from a comparative law perspective. Both theses will be written in English and are expected to be completed in late 2021. We are pleased that further research is being undertaken to address important and unresolved questions in the continually evolving field of compensation funds.

The editors would like to thank the authors for their ongoing collaboration and their valuable contributions to this book.

¹ For more information on the chair's activities and research see: <<https://www.uantwerpen.be/en/faculties/faculty-of-law/chairs-and-funds/allic/>>.

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xi

Introduction

Thierry VANSWEEVELT and Britt WEYTS	1
1. Background	1
2. The Origins and Growth of Compensation Funds	2
3. Objectives of this Book and Some Key Ideas	5

Belgium

Larissa VANHOOFF	7
1. Introduction	8
2. Definition and Classification of Compensation Funds	9
3. Belgian Compensation Funds	11
4. Origins of Compensation Funds: Why were they Created?	20
5. Key Features of Belgian Compensation Funds	25
6. Assets and Drawbacks of Funds	36
7. Concluding Remarks	42

France and Germany

Jonas KNETSCH	45
1. Introduction	45
2. Diversity of Compensation Funds in France and Germany	47
3. Doctrinal Issues: What Exactly is a Compensation Fund?	52
4. Procedural Issues: What is the Difference between a Civil Liability Action and Compensation by a Fund?	56
5. Practical Issues: Are Fund Benefits Equal to Full Compensation under Tort Law?	59
6. Organisational Issues: How should Compensation Funds be Coordinated with Tort Law?	62
7. Conclusion	65

The Netherlands

Michael FAURE, Ton HARTLIEF and Gerrit VAN MAANEN. 67

1. Compensation Funds in General 67
2. Conclusion. 87

New Zealand

Kim WATTS 89

1. Introduction 90
2. Scheme Overview 91
3. Why was the ACC Scheme Established? 96
4. How does it Operate? 102
5. The Impact of ACC on New Zealand's Legal System. 109
6. Case Studies Demonstrating the Limits and Complexities
of a Universal Scheme 119
7. Dispute Resolution Issues: Recent Changes to Enable Better
Access to Justice 128
8. The Future of the ACC Scheme 130

Spain

Rosa M. GARCIA-TERUEL. 135

1. General Overview of Compensatory Mechanisms in Spain. 136
2. Compensation Funds, a Solution which is not Representative
of the Options Used to Compensate Victims 139
3. Other Funds that are not Managed by the *Consortio*
De Compensación De Seguros 148
4. The Lack of Compensation Funds for Mass Accidents in Spain
and the Role of Public Aids 152
5. Concluding Remarks 158

United Kingdom

Ken OLIPHANT 161

1. Introduction 162
2. Compensation Schemes: A Chronology 164
3. Characteristics of Compensation Schemes 165
4. Points of Distinction between Compensation Schemes 166
5. The Main Compensation Schemes in the United Kingdom
by Thematic Cluster 167

6. Motor Vehicle Accidents (Uninsured and Untraced Drivers)	175
7. Criminal Injuries Compensation	176
8. Financial Services	177
9. Agriculture	179
10. Rejected Compensation Scheme Proposals	180
11. Possibilities for the Future?	183
12. Conclusion	186

Comparative Analysis

Thierry VANSWEEVELT, Britt WEYTS, Larissa VANHOOFF and Kim WATTS	189
---	-----

1. Introduction	190
2. Operational Field of Compensation Funds	190
3. Purpose and Motivation for Compensation Funds	192
4. Funding of Compensation Funds	198
5. Level of Compensation	200
6. Effect of Compensation Funds on Other Loss Allocation Mechanisms	201
7. Conclusions and the Potential for Reform	207
8. The Future and Ways to Improve Existing Compensation Funds . . .	211
<i>Index</i>	215

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Michael Faure

Professor of Comparative Private Law and Economics and Academic Director of METRO, Maastricht University, the Netherlands; Member of the Rotterdam Institute of Law and Economics, Erasmus University Rotterdam, the Netherlands.

Rosa M. Garcia-Teruel

Postdoctoral Researcher in the UNESCO Housing Chair, Department of Private, Procedural and Tax Law, Rovira i Virgili University, Catalonia, Spain.

Ton Hartlief

Advocat-General at the Hoge Raad (Dutch Supreme Court); Professor of Private Law, Maastricht University, the Netherlands.

Jonas Knetsch

Professor of Civil and Comparative Law, Faculty of Law, Jean-Monnet University Saint-Étienne, France; Fellow of the European Centre of Tort and Insurance Law (ECTIL).

Ken Oliphant

Professor of Tort Law, University of Bristol, United Kingdom.

Larissa Vanhooff

Doctoral Researcher at the Research Foundation – Flanders, University of Antwerp, Belgium.

Gerrit van Maanen

Professor of Private Law, Maastricht University, the Netherlands; Part-Time Judge in the Court of Appeal, s’Hertogenbosch, the Netherlands.

Thierry Vansweevelt

Full Professor in the Faculty of Law and Joint Chairperson of the Antwerp Liability and Insurance Chair, University of Antwerp, Belgium; Advocate at Dewallens & partners.

Kim Watts

Doctoral Researcher, University of Antwerp, Belgium.

Britt Weyts

Full Professor of Private Law and Joint Chairperson of the Antwerp Liability and Insurance Chair, University of Antwerp, Belgium; Advocate at Verbist & Vanlerberghe Omega Law.