THE LEGAL STATUS OF INTERSEX PERSONS
The publication of this book was supported by

UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

CFL CAMBRIDGE FAMILY LAW

LMU LUDWIG-MAXIMILIANS-UNIVERSITÄT MÜNCHEN

Philipps Universität Marburg

DAAD Cambridge
THE LEGAL STATUS
OF INTERSEX PERSONS

Edited by
Jens M. Scherpe
Anatol Dutta
Tobias Helms
The idea for this book began as a workshop supported by the DAAD Cambridge Research Hub with funds from the German Federal Foreign Office (FFO), the University of Regensburg and Cambridge Family Law.

The workshop was held at the University of Cambridge/Gonville and Caius College on 21–22 July 2016, jointly organised by the editors of this book. The workshop was attended not only by academics from Australia, Germany, the UK, Ireland, New Zealand, Spain and Italy, but also by representatives of the Law Commission of England and Wales, the German Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection (Berlin), the German Institute for Human Rights (Berlin) and the Ministry for Social Dialogue, Consumer Affairs and Civil Liberties (Malta). While the focus was on legal developments and regulation, there also were contributions from theology, medicine and psychology. There was an intense and productive interdisciplinary and interjurisdictional debate over the two days, and much of this is now reflected in this book. After the workshop, and indeed as a result of it, the research project leading to this book was started, and many additional chapters were commissioned in order to present an even broader discussion of the issues.

However, all major research projects face difficulties of varying kinds, and this one certainly was no exception. Several people who had promised to participate dropped out or failed to deliver. Houses were flooded, illnesses overcome, jobs changed, and children born during the period it took to put this book together. But in the end things came together, and we are pleased with the outcome and the broad range of contributions. We truly hope that this book will contribute to the national and international debates and lead to a focus on the autonomy of the people concerned.

We also are very grateful to many institutions and persons supporting the research project and publication of the book: the Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich for supporting the significant editorial work that needed to be undertaken, and which was handled expertly by Intersentia Publishing; Dafni Lima for her help with the initial editorial work; the Gonville and Caius Conference Office, and particularly Laura Webb, for ensuring that the workshop could take place in such a pleasant and well-organised environment; Ingrid Hobbis of the Cambridge Research Hub for her administrative support; Prof. Chris Young, the Co-Director of the Cambridge Research Hub, for his continuous support of this project; and Intersentia Publishing and particularly Rebecca Moffat, for their work to get this book published. Finally, we would like to thank the contributors to the workshop and particularly the contributors of this volume for their patience and understanding. It has been a long road …

The editors
Cambridge/Munich/Marburg, March 2018
CONTENTS

Preface ................................................................. v
List of Contributors ............................................. xi

The Legal Status of Intersex Persons: An Introduction
  Jens M. Scherpe ................................................... 1

Malta Declaration ................................................... 7

Darlington Statement ............................................. 11

Vienna Statement .................................................. 19

PART I. MEDICINE AND PSYCHOLOGY

Biology of Fetal Sex Development
  Ieuan Hughes .................................................... 25

Intersex in the Brain: What Neuroscience can Tell the Law about
  Gender Identity
  Joe Herbert ....................................................... 45

Gender Identity and Intersex Conditions
  Vickie Pasterski .................................................. 65

Evidence-Based Reviews of Medical Interventions Relative to the
  Gender Status of Children with Intersex Conditions and Differences
  of Sex Development
  Jameson Garland and Milton Diamond ....................... 81

PART II. THEOLOGY AND LEGAL HISTORY

Intersex in the Christian Tradition: Personhood and Embodiment
  Duncan Dormor ................................................. 105
## Contents

**Four Sexes, Two Genders: The Rabbinic Move from Legal to Essentialist Polarisation of Identities**  
Moshe Lavee and Tali Artman Partock .............................................. 165

**Intersex: Some (Legal-)Historical Background**  
Alain Wijffels ................................................................. 181

### PART III. TRANSGENDER, TRANSSEXUALITY AND INTERSEX

**Lessons from the Legal Development of the Legal Status of Transsexual and Transgender Persons**  
Jens M. Scherpe .......................................................... 203

**Towards Trans and Intersex Equality: Conflict or Complementarity?**  
Peter Dunne .............................................................. 217

### PART IV. NATIONAL LEGAL DEVELOPMENTS

**Australia**  
Claire Fenton-Glynn .................................................. 243

**Sweden**  
Jameson Garland ....................................................... 255

**India**  
Smita Shah ................................................................. 281

**The Netherlands**  
Marjolein van den Brink ............................................... 293

**France**  
Benjamin Moron-Puech ................................................. 305

**Colombia (The Colombian Constitutional Court)**  
Ruth Rubio-Marín and Stefano Osella ........................................... 319

**United States**  
Julie A. Greenberg ..................................................... 339

**Malta**  
Tanya Ní Mhuirthile ..................................................... 357

---

Persoonlijke kopie van ()
Germany (The 2013 German Law)
Tobias Helms ................................................................. 369

Germany (German Inter-Ministerial Working Group)
Thomas Meyer ............................................................... 383

Germany (Gender Diversity in Law)
Nina Althoff ................................................................. 393

PART V. PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW ASPECTS OF INTERSEX

Private International Law Aspects of Intersex
Anatol Dutta and Walter Pintens ................................. 415

PART VI. INTERSEX AND HUMAN RIGHTS

Standing Up for the Human Rights of Intersex People
Dan Christian Ghattas .................................................... 429

The ‘Normalisation’ of Intersex Bodies and ‘Othering’ of Intersex Identities
Morgan Carpenter .......................................................... 445

Intersex Children and the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child
Kirsten Sandberg ........................................................... 515
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Nina Althoff
German Institute for Human Rights, Berlin, Germany

Marjolein van den Brink
School of Law, University of Utrecht, The Netherlands

Morgan Carpenter
Sydney Health Ethics, University of Sydney, Australia; Co-executive Director of Intersex Human Rights Australia (IHRA); GATE, New York, USA

Milton Diamond
John A. Burns School of Medicine, University of Hawai‘i, United States of America

Duncan Dormor
United Society Partners in the Gospel, London, England, United Kingdom

Peter Dunne
Faculty of Law, University of Bristol, England, United Kingdom

Anatol Dutta
Faculty of Law, Ludwig Maximilians University of Munich, Germany

Claire Fenton-Glynn
Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom

Jameson Garland
Faculty of Law, Uppsala University, Sweden

Dan Christian Ghattas
Executive Director of Organisation Intersex International Europe (OII Europe), Berlin, Germany

Julie Greenberg
Emeritus Faculty, Thomas Jefferson School of Law, San Diego, California, United States of America

Tobias Helms
Faculty of Law, Philipps University Marburg, Germany
Joe Herbert
John van Geest Centre for Brain Repair, Department of Clinical Neurosciences, University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom

Ieuan Hughes
Department of Paediatrics, University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom

Moshe Lavee
Department of Jewish History and Thought, University of Haifa, Israel

Thomas Meyer
Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection, Berlin, Germany

Tanya Ni Mhuirthile
School of Law and Government, Dublin City University, Ireland

Benjamin Moron-Puech
Faculty of Law, Pantheon-Assas University Paris (Paris II), France

Stefano Osella
Department of Law, European University Institute, Florence, Italy

Ruth Rubio-Marín
Faculty of Law, University of Sevilla, Spain; School of Transnational Governance, European University Institute, Florence, Italy

Tali Artman Partock
Faculty of Divinity, University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom

Vickie Pasterski
Department of Psychology, University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom

Walter Pintens
Faculty of Law, Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium; Faculty of Law, Saarland University, Germany

Kirsten Sandberg
Faculty of Law, University of Oslo, Norway

Jens M. Scherpe
Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge, England, United Kingdom; University of Hong Kong; Aalborg University, Denmark

Smita Shah
Department of Law, European University Institute, Florence, Italy

Alain Wijffels
Faculty of Law, Catholic University of Leuven and Catholic University of Louvain, Belgium; Faculty of Law, University of Leiden, The Netherlands; Centre d’Histoire Judiciaire (CNRS), France