CHILD SOLDIERS AND TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

Protecting the Rights of Children Involved in Armed Conflicts

Bo Viktor Nylund
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is based on my PhD thesis, which was accepted by the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies, Geneva, in 2014. My sincere thanks go to Professor Andrew Clapham as the thesis supervisor and to Professor Vincent Chetail as second reader. Thank you for your guidance and support throughout the process of study and writing, in particular, the constructive comments and suggestions during the preparation of the mémoire préliminaire de thèse, which spurred me to make a greater effort and dig deeper into the law. Thank you also to Professor Matthew Happold for having agreed to be the third panel member to review this thesis.

I am grateful to colleagues and friends providing comments, inputs, and entertaining discussions about law and practice relevant to the thesis: Camille Gervaux, Cecile Apte, Christine Watkins, Emilia Richard, Evelyne Schmid, Gabor Rona, Ghada Kachachi, Ida Hyllested, Insaf Nizam, Jelena Pejic, Lara Scott, Monika Sandvik, Osman AbuFatima, Pernille Ironside, Rachel Brett, Saudamini Siegrist, Takhmina Karimova, and Subajini Jayasekaran. Some of you have been colleagues in the field addressing the issue of child recruitment, and from these situations, there are records of engagement with children that have guided the work. I want to especially thank those of you who contributed the quotes that have been included in the beginning of each chapter, and which are left as anonymous as possible in order not to expose those children, their families, or those of you who worked with them.

My appreciation goes to my supervisors at UNICEF (from Khartoum to New York Headquarters to Geneva Headquarters to Bujumbura), who over the past several years have signed and approved of requests for special leave and study leave: Ted Chaiban, Susan Bissell, Leila Pakkala, and Andres Franco. More importantly, you were incredible people to work with and I learned so much from you – thank you!

In finalizing the manuscript for publication, I have also greatly benefited from the comments of two reviewers in a double-blind review process, as well as the three general editors of the Intersentia Series on Transitional Justice.

And for first-class editing: Catherine Rutgers, thank you so much! It was a true pleasure working with you, and thanks for being based in a different time zone so that we were able to do the editing and back-and-forths during odd hours.
I want to express gratitude to Shelby Cullom and Kathryn Davis. Thanks to the scholarship provided through your generous donation to the Graduate Institute, I was able to spend significant time on study and writing during periods when I was not working.

And, to complete these acknowledgements with a very important expression of gratitude, I am thankful for the support and understanding and encouragement from my wife, Monika, and our children, Emma, Lisa, and Elias.
ABOUT THE AUTHOR

Bo Viktor Nylund is a protection and legal practitioner who throughout his career has focused on advocacy and engagement with state and non-state actors with a view to driving accountability in the implementation of human rights. Bo Viktor has a Ph.D. in International Law, as well as Master’s degrees in law and political science from Columbia University Law School and Abo Akademi University.


The views expressed in this book are those of the author and are not necessarily shared by UNICEF or the UN.
# CONTENTS

*Acknowledgements* ................................................................. v
*About the Author* ................................................................. vii
*List of Abbreviations* .............................................................. xv

**Chapter 1. Objective, Scope, and Transitional Justice as an Analytical Framework** ................................................................. 1

1. Introduction ........................................................................... 1
   1. Objective and Scope ......................................................... 2
      1.1. Overarching Goals .................................................. 3
      1.2. Organization and Key Areas of Research .................. 4
   2. Transitional Justice as an Analytical Framework ............. 5
      2.1. Transitional Justice as Applied to This Research ....... 7
      2.2. Transitional Justice and Children: an Evolving Area of Study and Research ........................................ 13
   3. Child Recruitment: an Overview of the History ............. 21
      3.1. Historical Examples ............................................... 22
      3.2. International Legal Developments ............................ 25
      3.3. The Concept of "Child Soldiers" ....................... 27
      3.4. The Beginnings of the End to Child Recruitment .... 28
   Conclusion ............................................................................ 30

**Chapter 2. Child Recruitment and the Rule of Law: International Law and the Prohibition against Recruiting and Using Children to Take Direct Part in Hostilities** .................................................. 33

1. Introduction ........................................................................... 33
   1. International Humanitarian Law ................................... 35
      1.1. Providing an Initial Focus on Protection of Children in Armed Conflict through the Fourth Geneva Convention ..... 35
      1.2. The Additional Protocols and the Shift towards Specific Provisions Relevant to Child Recruitment .................. 38
      1.3. Key Legal Considerations Relevant to Specific Provisions of the Additional Protocols ........................................ 40
2. The Child Rights Domain ................................................................. 45
   2.1. Focusing on Child Recruitment through the Convention on the Rights of the Child ................................................. 46
   2.2. Key Legal Considerations Relevant to Specific Provisions of the Convention on the Rights of the Child ...................... 48
   2.3. The Optional Protocol on the Involvement of Children in Armed Conflict .............................................................. 50
   2.4. Key Legal Considerations Relevant to Specific Provisions of the Optional Protocol .................................................... 53
3. The Implementation of International Obligations ...................... 56
   3.1. Committee on the Rights of Child Reviews of Optional Protocol Implementation Measures ........................................ 56
   3.2. Key Legal Considerations Relevant to Efforts by States to Implement Provisions Regarding Child Recruitment ............ 58
   3.3. From Prohibition to Crime: Considerations of Child Recruitment as a Crime under International Customary Law ............ 63
Conclusion ..................................................................................... 65

Chapter 3. Child Recruitment and Criminal Justice: the Lubanga Case .. 69

Introduction .................................................................................. 69
1. The Lubanga Case: the Objective Criteria ........................................ 71
   1.1. The Court’s Interpretation of the Law: Forced or Voluntary Recruitment ................................................................. 73
   1.2. The Court’s Interpretation of the Law: the Question of Active Participation ............................................................... 75
   1.3. Establishing the Facts and Application of the Law: How to Determine that Children Were under the Age of 15 ............... 81
   1.4. Establishing the Facts and Application of the Law: How to Determine that Children Were Conscripted, Enlisted, or Actively Used in Conflict ................................................................. 89
2. The Lubanga Case: the Subjective Criteria ....................................... 92
   2.1. Existence of a Common Plan ..................................................... 93
   2.2. Providing an Essential Contribution to the Crime ....................... 96
   2.3. The Mental Element: Intent and Knowledge ........................... 99
Conclusion ..................................................................................... 102

Introduction ......................................................... 109
1. The Security Council’s Engagement on Children and Armed Conflict . . 111
   1.1. The Development of the Security Council Mechanism for Monitoring and Reporting of Grave Violations against Children’s Rights .............................................. 112
   1.2. The Process for Collecting Information .......................... 114
   1.3. The Type of Information Being Collected .................... 116
2. Analysing the Outcome of the Security Council Working Group’s Deliberations ........................................... 118
   2.1. Formal Conclusions and Action Plans ......................... 119
   2.2. Personal Scope: Children Affected by Armed Conflict, Child Recruitment, and the Question of Age in the Security Council Mechanism ...................................................... 121
   2.3. Focus on State and Non-State Actors in the Security Council Mechanism .............................................. 123
   2.4. Temporal Focus of the Security Council: from Prevention to Recovery and Reintegration .......................... 125
   2.5. The Nature of Obligations with Respect to the Security Council’s Thematic Focus .............................................. 127
Conclusion .............................................................. 129


Introduction .............................................................. 135
1. The Right to Recovery and Reintegration in International Law . . . . 137
   1.2. Specific Protection: OPAC and the Committee on the Rights of the Child .............................................. 139
   1.3. Country Reports and Committee Reviews of Recovery and Reintegration Efforts .............................................. 141
   1.4. The Paris Commitments and Principles: Placing a Focus on Reintegration ...................................................... 145
   1.5. Addressing Accountability: the Security Council’s Involvement . . 146
2. Reparations to Former Child Soldiers: International Human Rights and Humanitarian Law as Applied in the Lubanga Case 150
   2.1. Considering Reparations in the Lubanga Case .................. 150
   2.2. Accessibility and Non-Discrimination .......................... 152
   2.3. Individual and Collective Reparations .......................... 154
   2.4. Defining the Beneficiaries ........................................ 155

Persoonlijke kopie van ( )
Child Soldiers and Transitional Justice

2.5. Establishing the Type of Reparation .................................. 156
2.6. Implementing a Reparations Scheme ................................. 158
Conclusion .................................................................................. 159

Chapter 6. Child Recruitment and Institutional Justice ............... 163

Introduction ............................................................................... 163
1. Peace Agreements and Children's Issues ............................... 165
   1.1. Analysis of the Provisions Related to Children ............... 165
   1.2. Recovery and Reintegration .......................................... 170
2. Institutional Justice and Child Protection ............................... 172
   2.1. Child Protection Systems in Post-Conflict Environments  .. 172
   2.2. Building Capacities among Non-State Actors ............... 175
   2.3. The Need to Raise Awareness of the Negative Impacts of Child Recruitment ........................................ 176
   2.4. Addressing the Impact of Private Military Security Companies and Other Businesses ............................ 178
Conclusion .................................................................................. 184

Chapter 7. Children Involved in Armed Conflict and Participatory Justice: Balancing Rights and Responsibilities .................. 187

Introduction ............................................................................... 187
1. The Participation of Children in Criminal Justice Processes .... 188
   1.1. Children as Survivors, Victims, and Witnesses of International Crimes during Armed Conflicts .................. 189
   1.2. The Implications of Children's Participation in the Lubanga Case ......................................................... 191
2. Standards on Children as Possible Perpetrators of War Crimes .. 195
   2.1. The Minimum Age of Criminal Responsibility ............... 196
   2.2. Children's Potential Responsibility for War Crimes in International and National Jurisdictions .................. 198
   2.3. Applying the Standard of Reasonable Doubt ................. 203
   2.4. Exclusionary Criteria and Former Child Soldiers Seeking Asylum ......................................................... 205
   2.5. Recovery and Reintegration of Child Soldiers: Applying the Standards of Restorative Justice .................. 208
Conclusion .................................................................................. 210
Chapter 8. Conclusions: Transitional Justice and the Potential for Stronger Protection of the Rights of Children Involved in Armed Conflicts

Introduction .................................................................................................................. 213

1. Analysing International Law Relevant to Child Recruitment through the Transitional Justice Framework .................................................. 214
   1.1. Advantages of an Overall Framework ......................................................... 214
   1.2. Established Practice and Application of the Law .................................. 215

2. Moving Forward in a Transitional Justice Approach: Key Areas for Collaborative and Policy/Legal Action ............................................. 221
   2.1. Domestic Implementation of the Law and the Committee on the Rights of the Child ............................................................... 221
   2.2. Criminal Justice ...................................................................................... 223
   2.3. The Security Council Monitoring and Reporting Mechanism ........ 224
   2.4. Recovery and Reintegration .................................................................. 225
   2.5. Children’s Participation ......................................................................... 227

Annexes .................................................................................................................... 231

Bibliography ............................................................................................................. 239
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AP Additional Protocol
CPA Comprehensive Peace Agreement
CRBP Children’s Rights and Business Principles
CRC Convention on the Rights of the Child
DDR disarmament, demobilization, and rehabilitation
FPLC Forces Patriotiques pour la Libération du Congo (Patriotic Forces for the Liberation of Congo)
GC IV Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War
ICC International Criminal Court
ICRC International Conference of the Red Cross
ILO International Labour Organization
JEM Justice and Equality Movement
LTTE Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam
MONUC United Nations Organization Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo
MRM monitoring and reporting mechanism
OPAC Optional Protocol on the Involvement of Children in Armed Conflict
PMSC private military security company
RCD-ML Rassemblement congolais pour la démocratie – Mouvement de libération (Rally for Congolese Democracy-Liberation Movement)
SCSL Special Court for Sierra Leone
SCWG Security Council Working Group
SLM/A Sudan Liberation Movement/Army
SPLA Sudan People’s Liberation Army
SRSG-CAAC Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Children and Armed Conflict
TMVP Tamil Makkal Viduthalai Pulikal
UK United Kingdom
UN United Nations
UNHCR Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNICEF United Nations Children’s Fund
UPC Union des patriotes congolais (Union of Congolese Patriots)
UPC-RP     Union des patriotes congolais pour la reconciliation et la paix
          (Union of Congolese Patriots for Reconciliation and Peace)
USA       United States of America