

STEREOTYPES AND HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

STEREOTYPES
AND HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

Edited by
Eva BREMS
Alexandra TIMMER



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7PP
United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

Stereotypes and Human Rights Law

© The editors and contributors severally 2016

The authors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover image: Portefeuille des Maîtres du Bauhaus, Schlemmer Oskar (1888–1943) © Centre Pompidou, MNAM-CCI, Dist. RMN-Grand Palais/Jean-Claude Planchet

ISBN 978-1-78068-368-3
D/2016/7849/48
NUR 828



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

CONTENTS

Introduction

Eva BREMS and Alexandra TIMMER	1
1. Stereotyping as a Human Rights Issue: Crosscutting Themes	2
2. Overview of the Volume	5

Building Momentum Towards Change. How the UN's Response to Stereotyping is Evolving

Simone CUSACK	11
1. Introduction	11
2. Key Developments in UN Responses to Stereotyping	13
2.1. There is Greater Visibility of Stereotyping within the UN	14
2.1.1. Gender Stereotyping	14
2.1.2. Disability Stereotyping	20
2.1.3. Other Types of Stereotyping	24
2.2. Analysis of Gender Stereotyping is More Sophisticated	26
2.2.1. The Language Used to Engage with Gender Stereotyping is More Nuanced	27
2.2.2. Analysis of the Impact of Stereotyping is More In-Depth	28
2.3. The OHCHR is Playing a Leadership Role on Stereotyping	30
3. Strategies for Strengthening UN Responses to Stereotyping	31
3.1. Build Capacity to Understand and Identify Stereotypes Accurately	32
3.1.1. Failure to Identify Stereotypes Accurately	32
3.1.2. Build Capacity of UN Mechanisms	33
3.2. Elaborate State Obligations Related to Stereotyping	34
3.2.1. Limited Guidance on State Obligations Related to Stereotyping	34
3.2.2. Elaborate State Obligations Related to Stereotyping	34
3.3. Highlight Good Practice Examples of Challenging Stereotyping	36
3.3.1. Limited Awareness of Effective Responses to Stereotyping	36
3.3.2. Identify and Highlight Measures that are Bringing about Positive Change	37
4. Conclusion	37

Gender Stereotyping in Domestic Violence Cases. An Analysis of the European Court of Human Rights' Jurisprudence	
Lourdes PERONI and Alexandra TIMMER	39
1. The Conceptual and Legal Framework	40
1.1. On Stereotypes	40
1.2. Gender Stereotypes as a Root Cause of Violence Against Women in International Human Rights Law	42
2. Naming and Contesting Gender Stereotypes in Domestic Violence Case Law	48
2.1. Naming Gender Stereotypes and Exposing their Harms	48
2.1.1. Women are (or Ought to be) Weak, Passive and Helpless ...	49
2.1.2. Women Ought to be Submissive.	51
2.1.3. Women (Ought to) Endure Men's Aggressiveness or Violence (and Other Gender Stereotypes)	54
2.1.4. Women are Financially Dependent	55
2.1.5. Women are Mothers and Homemakers (and Other Gender Stereotypes)	57
2.2. Contesting Gender Stereotypes	61
2.2.1. Contesting Individuals' Stereotyping: States' Positive Obligations	61
2.2.2. Contesting Gender Stereotyping by the State: Discrimination	63
3. Conclusion	65
 Gender Stereotyping in the Case Law of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights	
Verónica UNDURRAGA	67
1. The Inter-American Human Rights System	68
2. Gender and Gender Stereotyping in the Inter-American Human Rights System	69
2.1. The <i>Cotton Field</i> Case	70
2.2. The <i>Atala</i> Case	74
3. Some Common Approaches to Both Cases	77
4. Debunking Gender Stereotypes through Adjudication	81
5. Separating the Wheat from the Chaff	83
6. Preparing for Backlash	89

‘My Sense of Humanity Has Gone Down the Drain’. Stereotypes, Stigma and Sanism

Michael PERLIN 95

1. How Stereotypes Limit Human Rights 97
 - 1.1. Lack of Dignity 100
 - 1.2. Stereotypes Contaminate Legislative Debate 102
 - 1.3. ‘Hearts and Minds’ 104
 - 1.4. Value of Test Cases 106
 - 1.5. Relationship to Other Sorts of Stigma and Stereotypes 110
 - 1.6. Impact of the CRPD 112
2. Therapeutic Jurisprudence 114
3. Conclusion 117

Racial Stereotypes and Human Rights

Mathias MÖSCHEL 119

1. Racial Stereotypes and Violence 121
 - 1.1. In Relation to State-Organised Violence/Genocide 121
 - 1.2. Racially Motivated/Biased Violence by State or Public Actors ... 123
 - 1.3. Racially Motivated/Biased Violence by Private Actors 126
2. Racial Stereotypes in the Absence of Violence 127
 - 2.1. Racial Bias in Court Decisions 127
 - 2.2. Racial Profiling 128
 - 2.3. Racial Imagery or Depictions not Leading to Violence 129
3. Specialised Human Rights Bodies Against Racism 131
 - 3.1. International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD) 131
 - 3.1.1. Article 7 131
 - 3.1.2. Article 4 134
 - 3.2. European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) . 136
4. Fighting Racial Stereotypes through Human Rights in the Future? ... 137

The Head of the Woman is the Man. The Failure to Address Gender Stereotypes in the Legal Procedures around the Dutch SGP

Rikki HOLTMAAT 143

1. The SGP: its Origins and Principles, and the Political and Legal Responses to its Discriminatory Policy 146
 - 1.1. The SGP: its Origins and Principles 146
 - 1.2. The Position of the Dutch Government as Regards the SGP 149
 - 1.3. Legal Procedures Against the SGP and Against the Dutch State Supporting the SGP 151

2.	The Construction of the Legal Problem as an Issue of Unequal Treatment of Women	154
2.1.	Four Different Possibilities to Legally Address the SGP's Policy to Exclude Women from Political Participation.	155
2.2.	The Construction of the SGP's Policy as a Case of Unequal Treatment of Women.	159
2.3.	The Impossibility of Justifying Discrimination Against Women with an Appeal to Traditional Gender Roles.	165
3.	The Metaphors Used in the Justification Test in Sex-Equality Cases ...	167
3.1.	The Disastrous Language of Conflicting Rights.	167
3.2.	Towards Using a Different Metaphor	170
4.	Conclusion	171

Gender Stereotyping in the Military. Insights From Court Cases

Rebecca COOK and Cornelia WEISS

175

1.	Introduction	175
2.	Analysis of Cases.	178
2.1.	Exclusion Cases.	178
2.2.	Unequal Treatment Cases.	188
2.3.	Sexual Assault Cases	192
3.	Conclusion	197