

Humanitarian Assistance and State Sovereignty
in International Law
Towards a Comprehensive Framework

Emilie Ellen Kuijt

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Emilie Ellen Kuijt
Humanitarian Assistance and State Sovereignty in International Law: Towards
a Comprehensive Framework

ISBN 978-1-78068-366-9
D/2015/7849/156
NUR 828

Cover image © Denise Rosenboom – ‘Source’

A thesis edition of this book has also been published by Intersentia.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in an automated data system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission from the author/publisher.

*in loving memory of my grandfather hans b kuijt
auschwitz survivor ∇ 126054*

we must never again stand idly by when a humanitarian crisis unfolds

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It has been a privilege to complete my Ph.D. research with the support of so many wonderful people.

My gratitude first and foremost goes out to Prof. Nico Schrijver, my ‘promotor’. You have expressed faith in me and supported me in every step of this process, as well as in my personal voyage. Nico, I thank you: both for this support, and for always managing to challenge me on the content of the thesis. This appreciation similarly goes out to Dr. Robert Heinsch. Your critical comments and willingness to always discuss my questions and thoughts have improved my work and kept me going through various stages of the research: thank you.

Next to Leiden University, this thesis was written at various stages while visiting Tel Aviv University. I am grateful for the support of Prof. Eyal Benvenisti in giving me an academic home away from home, and for his insightful comments on my manuscript as a member of the Ph.D. committee.

Many thanks of course also go to the other members of the committee: Prof. Willem van Genugten, Prof. Cedric van Ryngaert, Dr. Heike Spieker, Prof. Horst Fischer and Prof. Carsten Stahn for their perceptive comments. You have given me the opportunity to improve myself.

My sincere recognition also goes to the people behind the Gieskes-Strijbis Fund, for their continuous interest in the protection of those in need, resulting in their generous support of this Ph.D. research.

At a personal level, my deep, deep thanks go out to my parents, both of whom have spent many an hour supporting the positive outcome of this project. Parental love is immeasurable. Similarly Steffi, I want to thank you for your steadfast faith in me, and always reminding me of that of opa. Robert Jan: thank you for your brotherly advice and technical support, often supplemented of course by Niene. Our discussions have always helped shape my thoughts.

Words cannot express how honoured I am to have so many wonderful friends, my ‘adoptive family’, who have always cheered me on and believed in the outcome of this project. I am a better friend, researcher and person because of you. I thank you from the bottom of my heart for being there for the hope, the despair and all the chapters in between. In particular my appreciation goes out to Lotte, as well as to Marianne, Jessica, Lisa, Pauline, Rogier, Tali, Ranish, Olga, Denise, Jorrit, Tess and Esther. Many thanks also of course to all those I do not name as space is running out – you know who you are!

Acknowledgements

I would furthermore especially like to thank my dear colleagues at Leiden University. My two roommates Daniëlla and Hanna made me look forward to coming to work every day in the otherwise often lonely process of writing a Ph.D. thesis. The rest of the group has also always made my days in Leiden joyful and only upon leaving did I truly realise what I had: thanks to all and in particular Vid, Ruben, Cecily, Erik, Helen, Niels, Andrea, Luca, Mette and of course the ladies across the hall from my office, Esther, and Wendy for her editorial work! Stefanie: I am glad you jumped on board when I brainstormed the idea of organising a conference together. It was one of the most fulfilling experiences I have had whilst working on my Ph.D., and I am happy we had the opportunity to share it. Thanks also of course to those who have shared my lunches and coffees at TAU, especially Keren, Mirjam, Masua and Myriam – it has been a pleasure sharing my days working on the thesis with you.

And so, it comes to an end. The thesis has been completed. I am grateful to have been surrounded by so many wonderful people during this process. I thank you all.

October 2015

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii

PART I. SETTING THE FRAMEWORK

Chapter 1

Introduction	3
1. Introduction	3
1.1 Introduction	3
1.2 Aim of the Research and Research Questions	8
1.2.1 Aim of the Research	8
1.2.2 General Research Questions and Boundaries	10
1.3 Research Structure	12
1.4 Methodology	14
1.4.1 Primary Sources	16
1.4.2. Secondary Sources	18
1.4.3 Character of the Research	20

Chapter 2

Defining Humanitarian Assistance, the Principles for Its Provision and Determining the Relevant Actors	23
2.1 Introduction	23
2.2 The Concept of Humanitarian Assistance	24
2.1.1 Historical Development	24
2.2.1.1 The Role of the UN in the Development of Humanitarian Assistance	28
2.2.1.2 The Role of the ICRC and IFRC in the Development of Humanitarian Assistance	30
2.2.2 Defining Humanitarian Assistance	32
2.2.3 The Principles for the Delivery of Assistance	38
2.2.3.1 The Principle of Humanity	40
2.2.3.2 The Principle of Impartiality	42
2.2.3.3 The Principle of Neutrality	45
2.2.3.4 An Alternative: The UN Principles Regarding Humanitarian Assistance	47
2.2.3.5 Other Perspectives on the Principles for Providing Humanitarian Assistance	51
2.3 Actors Involved in Humanitarian Assistance	54
2.3.1 Recipients of Humanitarian Assistance	54

2.3.2 Providers of Humanitarian Assistance	59
2.3.2.1 The Affected State	59
2.3.2.2 International Organisations	63
2.3.2.3 Third States	66
2.4 Conclusion	68

Chapter 3

Humanitarian Assistance: Its Scope of Application and the Applicable Law 71

3.1 Introduction	71
3.2 The Circumstances that may Require Humanitarian Assistance	72
3.2.1 Defining an Armed Conflict	72
3.2.2 Armed Conflicts and the Provision of Humanitarian Assistance	78
3.2.3 Defining Occupation	79
3.2.4 Occupation and the Provision of Humanitarian Assistance	82
3.2.5 Defining a (Natural) Disaster	84
3.2.6 Disasters and the Provision of Humanitarian Assistance	87
3.3 Providing Assistance: Establishing the Existence of a Humanitarian Crisis	89
3.3.1 An Over-Arching Approach to the Provision of Humanitarian Assistance	90
3.3.2 The Material Scope of Application	91
3.3.3 Defining a Humanitarian Crisis	97
3.4 Scope of Application: The Relationship between Human Rights Law and International Humanitarian Law	99
3.4.1 Development of the Interaction between both Fields of Law	100
3.4.2 Applicability of Human Rights in Armed Conflict and Occupation	106
3.4.2.1 Relevance of Continued Applicability and Acceptance Thereof	106
3.4.2.2 The Potential Extraterritorial Scope of Application of Human Rights Treaties	108
3.4.3 Hierarchy or Convergence of International Legal Norms?	113
3.5 Conclusion	120

Chapter 4

State Sovereignty as a Contextual Concept regarding Humanitarian Assistance 123

4.1 Introduction	123
4.2 Sovereignty as a Concept in International Law	124
4.2.1 Historical Context and Relevant Principles in Relation to Humanitarian Assistance	125
4.2.1.1 The Principle of Non-Intervention	126
4.2.1.2 The Principle of Consent	129

4.2.1.3 The Principle of Domestic Jurisdiction	131
4.2.2 Reconceptualising Sovereignty?	133
4.2.2.1 The Post-World War II Era	135
4.2.2.2 Humanitarian Interventions and Humanitarian Assistance	137
4.2.3 The Responsibility to Protect, the UN and Humanitarian Assistance	142
4.2.3.1 UN Endorsement of the Responsibility to Protect	144
4.2.3.2 Humanitarian Assistance and the Development of RtoP in Practice	147
4.2.3.3 Towards a new Definition of Sovereignty	153
4.3 Conclusion	155

PART II. PRIMARY RIGHTS AND DUTIES IN HUMANITARIAN CRISES

Chapter 5

The Potential Human Right to Receive Humanitarian Assistance	161
5.1 Introduction	161
5.2 The Development of Human Rights Relevant to Humanitarian Assistance	163
5.2.1 ‘Generations’ of Human Rights in Relation to Humanitarian Assistance	166
5.2.2 Derogability, Human Rights and the Provision of Humanitarian Assistance	168
5.2.3 Progressive Realisation in the ICESCR	170
5.3 A Human Right to Receive Humanitarian Assistance in International Law?	172
5.3.1 Humanitarian Assistance as a Potential Human Right in International Treaty Law	174
5.3.2 Humanitarian Assistance as a Potential Human Right in Customary International Law	177
5.3.3 Humanitarian Assistance and Collective Human Rights: Rights-holders and Duty-bearers	181
5.3.4 Preliminary Conclusion	184
5.4 Humanitarian Assistance Within the Context of Existing Human Rights	186
5.4.1 The Right to Life	186
5.4.2 Humanitarian Assistance and the Right to Life	190
5.4.3 The Right to Adequate Food	191
5.4.4 Humanitarian Assistance and the Right to Food	198
5.4.5 The Right to Health	200
5.4.6 Humanitarian Assistance and the Right to Health	206
5.4.7 The Right to Water	207
5.4.8 Humanitarian Assistance and the Right to Water	213
5.5 Conclusion	214

5.5.1 Humanitarian Assistance as an Independent Human Right	214
5.5.2 Humanitarian Assistance as a Vehicle in the Fulfilment of Existing Human Rights	217

Chapter 6

The Duty of the Affected State to Provide, and the Right of Persons to Receive Humanitarian Assistance	221
6.1 Introduction	221
6.2 Duties and Rights under General International Law	222
6.2.1 State Sovereignty and the Duty to Provide Humanitarian Assistance	222
6.2.2 State Sovereignty and the Right to Receive Humanitarian Assistance	226
6.3 Duties and Rights under Human Rights Law	227
6.3.1 Duties of the Affected State and Non-State Actor under Human Rights Law	228
6.3.2 Rights of Persons to Receive Assistance under Human Rights Law	233
6.4 Duties and Rights under the UN Framework: the Security Council and General Assembly	236
6.4.1 Duties of the Affected State and Non-State Actor under Security Council Resolutions	237
6.4.2 Rights of Persons to Receive Assistance under Security Council Resolutions	245
6.4.3 Duties of the Affected State under General Assembly Resolutions	246
6.4.4 Rights of Persons to Receive Assistance under General Assembly Resolutions	250
6.5 Duties and Rights in Specific Circumstances under International Law	251
6.5.1 Duties of the Affected State and Non-State Actor in Times of Conflict	252
6.5.1.1 Duties of the Affected State in Times of an International Armed Conflict	252
6.5.1.2 Duties of the Affected State and Non-State Actor in Times of a Non-International Armed Conflict	255
6.5.2 Rights of Persons to Receive Assistance in Times of Conflict	258
6.5.2.1 Rights of Persons to Receive Assistance in Times of an International Armed Conflict	259
6.5.2.2 Rights of Persons to Receive Assistance in Times of a Non-International Armed Conflict	260
6.5.3 Duties of the Affected State (Occupying Power) in Times of Occupation	261
6.5.4 Rights of Persons to Receive Assistance in Times of Occupation	265
6.5.5 Duties of the Affected State in Times of (Natural) Disaster	266

6.5.5.1 The Potential Application of the ILC Study: Protection of persons in the event of disaster	268
6.5.5.2 The Potential Application of the IDRL Guidelines and Model Act	270
6.5.6 Rights of Persons to Receive Assistance in Times of (Natural) Disaster	272
6.5.6.1 The Potential Application of the ILC Study: Protection of persons in the event of disaster	273
6.5.6.2 The Potential Application of the IDRL Guidelines and Model Act	273
6.5.7 Duties of the Affected State under Refugee Law	274
6.5.8 Rights of Persons to Receive Assistance under Refugee Law	276
6.5.9 Duties of the Affected State under the (Potential) IDP Framework	277
6.5.10 Rights of Persons to Receive Assistance under the (Potential) IDP Framework	282
6.6 Ascertaining the Legal Framework in a Humanitarian Crisis	284
6.6.1 The Applicable Lex Specialis in Armed Conflict	284
6.6.2 The Applicable Lex Specialis in Occupation	286
6.6.3 The Applicable Lex Specialis in Times of (Natural) Disaster	287
6.6.4 Determining the Problems and Gaps in the Provision of Humanitarian Assistance	287
6.7 Conclusion	289

PART III. THIRD PARTY ACTION WHEN PROVISION IS LACKING

Chapter 7

Third Parties and the Provision of Assistance: The Right to Offer Assistance and the Related (Potential) Right to Access 307

7.1 Introduction	307
7.2 The Provision of Humanitarian Assistance by Third Parties under General International Law	309
7.2.1 State Sovereignty and the Right to Offer Assistance	309
7.2.2 State Sovereignty and the Right to Access	311
7.3 The Provision of Humanitarian Assistance by Third Parties Under Human Rights Law	312
7.3.1 Human Rights Law and the Right to Offer Assistance	313
7.3.2 Human Rights Law and the Right to Access	317
7.4 The Provision of Humanitarian Assistance by Third Parties Under the UN Framework: the Security Council and General Assembly	320
7.4.1 Security Council Resolutions and the Right to Offer Assistance	321
7.4.2 Security Council Resolutions and the Right to Access	326
7.4.3 General Assembly Resolutions and the Right to Offer Assistance	335
7.4.4 General Assembly Resolutions and the Right to Access	339

7.5 The Provision of Humanitarian Assistance by Third Parties Under Specific Circumstances in International Law	343
7.5.1 The Right to Provide Assistance in Times of Conflict	344
7.5.1.1 The Right to Provide Assistance in Times of International Armed Conflict	344
7.5.1.2 The Right to Provide Assistance in Times of Non-International Armed Conflict	346
7.5.2 The Potential Right to Access in Times of Conflict	350
7.5.2.1 The Potential Right to Access in Times of International Armed Conflict	350
7.5.2.2 The Potential Right to Access in Times of Non-International Armed Conflict	354
7.5.3 The Right to Provide Assistance and the Law of Occupation	357
7.5.4 The Potential Right to Access and the Law of Occupation	359
7.5.5 The Right to Provide Assistance in Times of (Natural) Disaster	361
7.5.5.1 The Potential Application of the ILC Study: Protection of persons in the event of disaster	364
7.5.5.2 The Potential Application of the IDRL Guidelines and Model Act	366
7.5.6 The Potential Right to Access in Times of (Natural) Disaster	367
7.5.6.1 The Potential Application of the ILC Study: Protection of persons in the event of disaster	368
7.5.6.2 The Potential Application of the IDRL Guidelines and Model Act	370
7.5.7 The Right to Provide Assistance under Refugee Law	372
7.5.8 The Potential Right to Access under Refugee Law	372
7.5.9 The Right to Provide Assistance under the (Potential) IDP Framework	373
7.5.10 The Potential Right to Access under the (Potential) IDP Framework	375
7.6 Ascertaining the Legal Framework in a Humanitarian Crisis	379
7.6.1 The Applicable Lex Specialis in Armed Conflict	380
7.6.2 The Applicable Lex Specialis in Occupation	383
7.6.3 The Applicable Lex Specialis in Times of (Natural) Disaster	385
7.6.4 Determining the Problems and Gaps in the Provision of Humanitarian Assistance	386
7.7 Conclusion	390

Chapter 8	
Legal Consequences of the Denial of Humanitarian Assistance:	
Methods of Enforcement	411
8.1 Introduction	411
8.2 The Law of State Responsibility and Enforcement of Humanitarian Assistance	413
8.2.1 State Responsibility, the ARSIWA and Humanitarian Assistance	414
8.2.2 The ARSIWA, Peremptory Norms and the Denial of Humanitarian Assistance	419
8.2.3 State Responsibility and the Potential Duty to Cooperate in the Event of a Breach	426
8.2.4 State Responsibility, Humanitarian Assistance and Legal Developments	432
8.3 Acts Constituting Denial or Obstruction of Humanitarian Assistance	434
8.3.1 Circumstances of Denial or Obstruction: Determining a Humanitarian Crisis	435
8.3.2 The Refusal of Consent: Arbitrariness and Enforcement	436
8.3.3 The Denial or Obstruction of Assistance: a Violation of International Law	441
8.4 Enforcement through the Use of Force	443
8.4.1 Security Council Action: Enforcement through the UN system and the Responsibility to Protect	446
8.4.2 The Beginning of Security Council Action	450
8.4.3 Security Council Action since the UN embracement of the Responsibility to Protect	461
8.5 Enforcement through Human Rights Law	473
8.5.1 Enforcement through Human Rights Treaty Mechanisms	474
8.5.2 Human Rights Enforcement through the UN Charter-Based System	480
8.6 Methods of Enforcement through Individual (Criminal) Responsibility	483
8.6.1 Enforcement through Targeted Sanctions	484
8.6.2 Enforcement through International Criminal Law	486
8.6.2.1 War Crimes and Humanitarian Assistance	490
8.6.2.2 Crimes Against Humanity and Humanitarian Assistance	498
8.7 The Enforcement of Humanitarian Assistance and the Absence of a Sovereign	502
8.8 Conclusion	508

Chapter 9	
Conclusions and Recommendations	517
9.1 Conclusions Pertaining to the Existing Legal Framework	517
9.2 Recommendations for Improvement of the Legal Framework Concerning Humanitarian Assistance	539
9.2.1 The Basic Existing Legal Framework and Problems with Fragmentation	539
9.2.2 Fixing the Problems and Gaps in the Law	542
<i>Dutch Summary</i>	551
<i>Bibliography</i>	565
<i>Index</i>	613
<i>Curriculum Vitae</i>	619
<i>School of Human Rights Research Series</i>	621

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACHR	American Convention for Human Rights
ACHPR / African Charter AP I / II	African Charter on Human and Peoples Rights Additional Protocol I / II to the Geneva Conventions
Bruges Resolution	the Institute of International Law Resolution 2003, Bruges
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CRED	Centre for Research on the Epidemiology of Disasters
CRB	The Commission for Relief in Belgium
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
EC	European Community
ECHO	European Community Humanitarian Office
ECHR	European Convention for Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECOSOC	UN Economic and Social Council
EU	European Union
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
Fourth Geneva Convention	Convention (IV) relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War
Friendly Relations Declaration	Declaration on Principles of International Law Concerning Friendly Relations and Cooperation among States in Accordance with the Charter of the United Nations
GC I / II / III / IV	Geneva Convention I / II / III / IV
Guiding Principles on IDPs	UN Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement 1998
High-Level Panel Report	Report of the Secretary General's High Level Panel on Threats, Challenges and Change
HRC	Human Rights Committee
IACtHR	Inter-American Court on Human Rights
IASC	Inter-Agency Standing Committee
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICC Statute	Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

List of Abbreviations

ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
IDPs	Internally Displaced Persons
IDRL Guidelines	IFRC Guidelines for the domestic facilitation and regulation of international disaster relief and initial recovery assistance'
IDRL Programme	International Disaster Relief Laws, Rules and Principles Programme
IFRC	International Federation of the Red Cross
ILA	International Law Association
ILC	International Law Commission
IRO	International Refugee Organization
IRU	International Relief Union
Kampala Convention	African Union Convention for the Protection and Assistance of Internally Displaced Persons in Africa
Maastricht Principles	Maastricht Principles on Extra-Territorial Obligations (ETOs) of States in the area of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
Mohonk Criteria	Mohonk Criteria for Humanitarian Assistance in Complex Emergencies
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NGO	non-governmental organisation
OCHA	Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
Refugee Convention	Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees
RtoP	Responsibility to Protect
San Remo Institute	The International Institute of Humanitarian Law in San Remo
San Remo Principles	Guiding Principles on the Right to Humanitarian Assistance
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNDHA	United Nations Department of Humanitarian Affairs
UNDRO	United Nations Disaster Relief Organisation
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UN HRC	United Nations Human Rights Council
UNRRA	United Nations Relief and Rehabilitation Administration
Vienna Declaration	1993 Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action
1907 Hague Convention	1907 Hague ‘Convention respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land’
1907 Hague Regulations	Convention (IV) respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land’, ‘Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land’
1984 Draft Convention	UN Draft Convention on Expediting the Delivery of Emergency Relief