

ISLAMISM, STATEHOOD AND HUMAN RIGHTS

A World of Difference

Olufemi Ojo ILESANMI



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:
NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinerstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Islamism, Statehood and Human Rights. A World of Difference
Olufemi Ojo Ilesanmi

© 2015 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

ISBN 978-1-78068-331-7
D/2015/7849/80
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

To
The Prince of Peace,
and
His Heiresses: Victoria and Shekinah

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thanks to passion, mission and life experience, I often find myself wrestling with questions bordering on values, rights and the rule of law. And so many great minds have been around me to make life enjoyable and its experience worth sharing. As I meditate on the nature and content of this study, these characters have down the years been challenging, disturbing and inspiring. Without their presence and backing, publishing this work would have been unthinkable.

For believing in the depth and style of my doctoral thesis, many thanks to the examiners: Professors Andreas Philippopoulos-Mihalopoulos and John Paterson. I equally appreciate the fruitful ideas and guidance from my supervisors, Professors Chris Gane and Zucca Lorenzo. The research 'work' was very demanding and the 'walk' horribly lonely. But the idea of giving up never crossed my mind given the unceasing support from patient mentors like Professors Ilias Bantekas, Archie Boyd, Anthony Carty, David Fergusson, Duncan Forrester, Christian Haerpfer, Grant Jordan, Olufemi Oluniyi, Michael Plaxton and the Rt Revd Ben Enwuchola.

Many research communities in the United Kingdom identified with my aspiration as I crossed the unfamiliar but enriching ethnographical terrain. These include the law schools at the University of Westminster, the University of Aberdeen, as well as the University of Edinburgh (New College). My engagement with 'black letter' law has been at Robert Gordon University.

I am indebted to members of the Aberdeen Business School: many have been intelligent, critical and helpful colleagues and advisers. Professor Ken Mackinnon and Margaret Downie were always at hand not only to make my teaching of law done proficiently but also to make the learning of it pleasurable. Drs Sarah Christie, Elimma Ezeani, and Leon Moller deserve mention for their interest in my research activities. It was Dr Sam Middlemiss and his fellow interview panellists who offered me a lectureship. I think they believed I could contribute to the budding law school. Thank you all for being so kind and accommodating.

Making the arguments and findings of this research more accessible to readers was going to be a challenge. Firstly, the interdisciplinary research cuts across notoriously tedious academic subjects such as comparative religions, law and philosophy. So, for their critical but constructive comments on the drafts, the involvement of Dr Ross Thompson, an expert in philosophy of religions, and Dr Hamish Ross, a legal theorist, was very much appreciated. Secondly,

Moira Campbell had to bring her skills, experience, and temperament into proofreading the drafts and pointing out errors: she deserves special recognition. I must also thank Intersentia's editorial team for paying close attention to the content and presentation of the book. All other errors are a reflection of my weaknesses, limitations and needs, being human and – as such – are my own fault. Such slips are deeply regretted.

It is not possible to provide a full list of the heaven-sent folks whose selfless presence and sacrificial giving helped to complete the research. I have at the same time had to offer intimate friends and family members the cloak of decent anonymity: I spent valuable hours with attentive companions either discussing or lamenting about studies and struggles as a self-sponsored international student in Britain. I thank family members who have, as usual, had to go without me for unconscionably long periods of time. They may even be unaware of how indebted I am to them but, for being so loving and caring, I am eternally grateful!

Olufemi O. Ilesanmi, PhD FHEA
December 1, 2015

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>On the Explored Legal and Human Rights Environments</i>	xv
Chapter 1.	
Introduction	1
1.1. Research Questions	1
1.2. Background of Study (Emergence of Theocracies in 21 st Century Nigeria)	1
1.3. Purpose Statement of the Study	3
1.4. Thematic Overview of Human Rights (and Religiously Based Systems) ...	4
1.4.1. The Development of the Notion of Human Rights	4
1.4.2. Problems of Competing Values in Human Rights	12
1.5. Methodology	16
1.6. Expected Contribution and the Significance of this Study	17
1.7. Scope and Limitation of the Study	18
1.7.1. Jurisdictions Explored and Human Rights Issues	18
1.7.1.1. Turkey	19
1.7.1.2. Sudan	19
1.7.1.3. Malaysia	21
1.7.2. Caveat	22
Chapter 2.	
Theocracies: Towards a Working Definition	23
2.1. Introduction	23
2.2. Religio-Political Monism: The Abrahamic Example	25
2.2.1. An Overview of Talmudic Regime	27
2.2.1.1. Jewish Law: Meaning and Concepts	27
2.2.1.2. Sacredness of the Law	28
2.2.1.3. Sources of the Talmud	29
2.2.1.4. The Place of Law in Traditional Jewish Theocracy	30
2.2.1.5. Talmudic Legal Regime: Past and Present	30
2.2.2. Islamic Theocracies	32
2.2.2.1. Revelation and Theocracy in Islam	33
2.2.2.2. Between Theology and Law: Taxonomy	36
2.2.2.2.1. Law as Equal to Theology	36
2.2.2.2.2. Rating Law and Theology Differently	38

2.2.3. Between Islamic and Talmudic Tradition.	39
2.3. Theocracy: Alternative Understandings Focusing on Non- Abrahamic Views	43
2.3.1. Deeply Religious Civilisation Operating Secular Government . . .	44
2.3.2. Non-Religious People(s) Labelled or Claiming to be Theocratic . .	46
2.4. Nations under God as Religious and Political Arrangements	48
2.4.1. Theocracies: A Conceptual Review	49
2.4.2. <i>De jure</i> Theocracies.	51
2.4.2.1. Caesaropapism (in Protestant Britain)	51
2.4.2.2. Ecclesiocracy.	52
2.4.3. <i>De facto</i> Theocracies.	53
2.4.3.1. Democratic Theocracies (of Church Polity, the Geneva Model and the Vatican)	55
2.4.3.2. Theocratic Democracies (in Turkey, Pakistan and the United States of America).	55
2.5. Summary	56

Chapter 3.

Contemporary Theocracies in Context	59
3.1. Introduction.	59
3.2. Islamic Theocracy as a Legal Regime.	59
3.2.1. Shari’ah Reform and Penal Codes in Northern Nigeria: An Overview	61
3.2.1.1. Criminal Justice in Islam	62
3.2.1.2. Crimes in Islamic Law	63
3.2.1.2.1. Non- <i>Huduud</i> Crimes	64
3.2.1.2.2. <i>Huduud</i>	65
3.2.2. Problems with Administering <i>Huduud</i> : Studies in Penology	68
3.2.2.1. Fundamentals of Punishment	70
3.2.2.2. On the Principles of Modern Penology.	71
3.2.2.3. Punishment and Pre-Modern Penology	73
3.2.2.4. Shari’ah and the Various Stages in Penology	75
3.2.2.5. <i>Huduud</i> in Context	77
3.2.2.6. Classical Jurisprudence and the <i>Huduud</i>	81
3.2.2.6.1. Classical Shari’ah in Practice: A Critical Discourse.	82
3.2.2.6.2. Enforcing <i>Huduud</i> : An Ideological Discourse.	84
3.2.2.6.3. Problematising Convictions through Strict(er) Rules	86
3.2.3. Classical Doctrine, Modern Realities, and Contextualisation	90

Chapter 4.	
Contemporary Islamic Regimes and Human Rights: A Review	93
4.1. Introduction.	93
4.2. Kemalist Turkey	94
4.2.1. On the Administration of Human Rights in Turkey: Illustrative Cases.	96
4.2.1.1. Adjudication at the Municipal Courts	97
4.2.1.1.1. <i>Sahin v Turkey</i>	97
4.2.1.1.2. <i>Tekin v Turkey</i>	98
4.2.1.2. Adjudication at the Regional Courts.	98
4.2.1.3. Implication of Case Law for Human Rights.	99
4.2.2. Turkish Constitution vis-à-vis Human Rights	100
4.2.3. Practices in the Human Rights Environment	102
4.3. Islamist Sudan	105
4.3.1. Sudan as an Islamist State	106
4.3.2. Political Philosophy of Khartoum vis-à-vis Human Rights	108
4.3.3. Practices in the Human Rights Environment	111
4.3.3.1. Human Rights Violations in the North	112
4.3.3.2. Humanitarian Crises in the South (and in Darfur)	114
4.3.3.3. Between Human Rights and Islamism in Sudan: An Analysis	117
4.4. Mahathirist Malaysia	119
4.4.1. On Political Identity in Multicultural Malaysia	120
4.4.2. Constitutional Principles vis-à-vis Human Rights	123
4.4.3. Practices in the Human Rights Environment	127
4.4.3.1. Human Rights Friendly Policies and Practices	127
4.4.3.2. Repressive Policies and Practices.	129
4.4.3.2.1. In Relation to Non-Muslims	131
4.4.3.2.2. Factual Inter-Faith Discourse	132
4.4.3.2.3. Implications of the Constitutional Status of Islam for Muslims	135
4.5. Summary	139
Chapter 5.	
A Jurisprudential Analysis of the Human Rights Environments	141
5.1. Introduction.	141
5.2. The World According to Islamic Classical Teaching: A Review of the Stratagem Theory.	141
5.2.1. Dar al-Islam (the World of Islam)	143
5.2.1.1. Implications of Stratagem Theory for Dhimmi.	144

5.2.1.2. Implications of ‘Stratagem Theory’ for the Infidels Found in Islamic Territories	146
5.2.2. Zone of War (Territories outside the World of Islam)	147
5.2.2.1. Islamisation as a Legitimate Foreign Policy	147
5.2.2.2. Between Islamisation and Islamism	149
5.2.3. On the Authenticity of Islamic Fundamentalism	151
5.2.4. Politics of Population and Hermeneutics in Islam	153
5.3. Contemporary Dar al-Harb and Islamist Doctrine: A Review	156
5.4. Impacts of Fundamentalism on the Contemporary World of Islam	159
5.5. Selected Islamic Human Rights Environments: the Analysis	162
5.5.1. Turkey’s Herodianism	162
5.5.2. Sudan: A Cabalist Democracy	165
5.5.3. Towards an Altruistic Muslim Democracy: Malaysia’s ‘ <i>Hadhari Islam</i> ’	172
5.6. Summary	174

Chapter 6.

Shari’ah in Contemporary Theocracies: The Nigerian Example 177

6.1. Introduction	177
6.2. Applying the Penal Codes in Northern Nigeria: Historical Background	178
6.2.1. Pre-Colonial Shari’ah Regime in Northern Nigeria	179
6.2.2. Colonial Dispensation	182
6.2.3. Post-Colonial Shari’ah Regime	186
6.2.4. The New Shari’ah Question	188
6.3. <i>Zamfara State v Bariya I. Mugazu</i> : A Normative and Ethico-Legal Study	190
6.3.1. Background	192
6.3.2. Shari’ah Regime in Zamfara: Doctrine vis-à-vis Practice	193
6.3.3. Critics of the Nigerian Shari’ah and the Judgment	198
6.3.4. Apologists Defend the Regime	201
6.4. Islamic Justice and the Nigerian Shari’ah: A Reflective Analysis	207

Chapter 7.

National Constitution and the Shari’ah in Nigeria: A Contextual Analysis 213

7.1. Introduction	213
7.2. On Islamic Justice and Multi-Religious Nigeria: A Socio-Ethical Review	213
7.2.1. Background of Review: A Normative Intrafaith Discourse	214
7.2.1.1. Perspectives in Islam	216

7.2.1.2. Gender Issues	218
7.2.1.3. The <i>Huduud</i> Question	220
7.2.2. Factual Inter-Faith Implications of <i>Huduud</i>	224
7.3. Nature and Principles of the Constitution: A Politico-Legal Discourse	225
7.3.1. Understanding Constitutional Principles Relevant to Nigeria ...	226
7.3.1.1. Constitutional History of Heterogeneous Nigeria	227
7.3.1.2. On Political Democracy	229
7.3.1.3. Federalism as a Constitutional Option	230
7.3.1.3.1. Rights of the Minority	231
7.3.1.3.2. Tyranny of the Majority	232
7.3.2. Legal Stature of Nigeria's Constitution: The Primacy Question	235
7.3.2.1. Constitutionalism and the Rule of Law: A Conceptual Overview	235
7.3.2.2. International Law (of Human Rights) and the Federal Constitution	236
7.3.2.3. Legislation at the Federating Units and the Constitutional Design	239
7.3.2.4. Religio-Political Identity and the Protection of Rights	241
7.4. Nigerian Shari'ah and the National Municipal Law: A Critical Legal Study	243
7.4.1. A Contextual Overview of Relevant International Law (of Human Rights)	244
7.4.1.1. Penalties Involving the Psychosomatic and Some Relevant International Law	246
7.4.1.2. Socio-Legal Concerns and Relevant Human Rights Instruments	248
7.4.1.2.1. On the Equality of All	248
7.4.1.2.2. On the Dignity and Rights of a Child	249
7.4.1.2.3. On Religious Freedom	251
7.4.2. Municipal Laws and the Conflicting Norms: An Analysis	253
7.5. Summary	254
 Chapter 8.	
Conclusion	257
8.1. Introduction	257
8.2. Analytical Summary of Study	257
8.2.1. A Relational Hypothesis on Contemporary Theocracies and Human Rights	258
8.2.1.1. Presumption	260

8.2.1.2. Interaction	263
8.2.1.3. Exception	264
8.2.2. Compliance-Determinants in the Theocratic Human Rights Environments	265
8.2.2.1. On Politics and the Political	265
8.2.2.2. On Theology and the Theological	267
8.2.2.2.1. The Rightists	268
8.2.2.2.2. The Leftists	270
8.3. Back to the Compatibility Question: the Conclusion	272
8.3.1. The <i>Ideal</i> World of Reformers.	272
8.3.2. The <i>Real</i> World of Traditional Establishments	273
8.3.3. The Nigerian Islamic Theocracy.	274

**ON THE EXPLORED LEGAL AND
HUMAN RIGHTS ENVIRONMENTS**

