

COMMITTED TO REFORM?

EUROPEAN STUDIES IN LAW AND ECONOMICS SERIES

1. *Group Litigation in European Competition Law. A Law and Economics Perspective*, Sonja E. Keske
2. *Behavioural Economics in Consumer Policy*, Hanneke Luth
3. *Ex-Post Liability Rules in Modern Patent Law*, Rosa Castro Bernieri
4. *Competition and Innovation in the EU Regulation of Pharmaceuticals: The Case of Parallel Trade*, Claudia Desogus
5. *The Law and Economics of Organ Procurement*, Firat Bilgel
6. *Law and Economics in the RIA World. Improving the use of economic analysis in public policy and legislation*, Andrea Renda
7. *Regulatory Competition in European Corporate and Capital Market Law*, Lars Hornuf
8. *Economic Criteria for Criminalization: Optimizing Enforcement in Case of Environmental Violations*, Katarina Svatikova
9. *Definition of the Relevant Market. (Lack of) Harmony between Industrial Economics and Competition Law*, Hila Nevo
10. *Patents as Protection of Traditional Medical Knowledge? A Law and Economics Analysis*, Petra Ebermann
11. *Rethinking the New York Convention. A Law and Economics Approach*, Shen Wei
12. *Towards a Better Assessment of Pain and Suffering Damages for Personal Injuries*, Vaia Karapanou
13. *Comparative Analysis of Merger Control Policy. Lessons for China*, Jingyuan Ma
14. *Does Law Matter for Economic Growth? A Re-examination of the 'Legal Origin' Hypothesis*, Guangdong Xu

COMMITTED TO REFORM?

Pragmatic Antitrust Enforcement in Electricity Markets

Małgorzata SADOWSKA



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinerstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Committed to Reform? Pragmatic Antitrust Enforcement in Electricity Markets
Małgorzata Sadowska

© 2014 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

ISBN 978-1-78068-250-1
D/2014/7849/113
NUR 823

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to people who saw me through this book; to all those who provided support, talked things over, read, offered comments and assisted in the editing, proofreading and design.

Particular thanks go to Massimo Motta, Klaus Heine, Bert Willems, Leigh Hancher, Ann-Sophie Vandenberghe, Hans Vedder, Roger Van den Bergh, Michael Faure, Luigi Franzoni, Firat Cengiz, Andrew Gabil, Natalia Fabra, Jan Bouckaert, Pierre Larouche, Niels Philipsen, Alexander Morell, Björn ter Bruggen, Paul Giesbertz, Martin Godfried, Lars Kjølbye, Peter Willis, Matti Supponen, Edouard Leduc, Marianne Breijer, Lisa Verniti, Adelio Garcia Alfisi, Meltem Bayramli, Vaia Karapanou, Alejandra Martinez Gándara, Firat Bilgel, Weiqiang Hu, Bernadeta Sadowska, Mieczysław Sadowski, Paulina Samsel, Anna Sadowska, Nicolas Klecha, Maksymilian Klecha, Marcin Klecha and Killian Kehoe.

The views expressed and all remaining errors are those of the author.

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>List of Tables and Figures</i>	xi
Chapter 1. Introduction	1
1.1. Problem Definition	2
1.2. Context	4
1.2.1. What Are Commitment Decisions?	4
1.2.2. Potential Benefits of Commitment Procedure and Incentives to Engage in Negotiations	6
1.2.3. Making the Link with Electricity Markets	10
1.2.4. What's at Stake? The EU Internal Market for Electricity	17
1.2.4.1. Early Legislative Reforms: the 1 st and the 2 nd Energy Package	19
1.2.4.2. The Use of Competition Toolbox: the Energy Sector Inquiry and the Follow-Up Actions	21
1.2.4.3. Where Do We Stand Now? The 3 rd Energy Package	24
1.2.4.4. Actions for Non-Compliance	25
1.2.4.5. On the Home Straight?	26
1.3. Energy Policy and Competition Policy: Definitions	27
1.4. Dealing with Gap Cases: Some Comments on the <i>Greek Lignite Case</i> ...	29
1.4.1. The Case	30
1.4.2. Discussion	33
1.5. Literature Review	34
1.5.1. Debate on Commitments	36
1.5.1.1. Optimal Use of Commitment Decisions	38
1.5.1.2. Suboptimal Use of Commitment Decisions	42
1.5.2. Debate on the Use of Commitments for Regulatory Purposes: Instrumentalisation	43
1.5.2.1. Suboptimal Outcomes and the Risks of Instrumentalisation	44
1.5.2.2. Formlessness of Article 9 and the Opportunities It Creates	48
1.5.2.3. Some Final Remarks	55
1.5.3. Research Justification	57

1.6. Research Question and Methodology	59
1.6.1. Why Electricity Markets?	60
1.6.2. Why the <i>E.ON</i> and <i>SvK</i> Cases?	61
1.7. Chapter Overview	63
1.7.1. Chapter 2	64
1.7.2. Chapter 3	66
1.7.3. Chapter 4	70
1.7.4. Chapter 5	74

Chapter 2. Energy Liberalisation: Excessive Pricing Actions Dusted Off? ... 79

2.1. Chapter Summary	79
2.2. Introduction	79
2.3. The Paradox	81
2.4. Invalidating the Criticism	82
2.4.1. Intervention might be Superfluous or Even Harmful.	82
2.4.2. Assessment Problems	84
2.4.2.1. Sector Inquiry Opens the Case... ..	84
2.4.2.2. ... And a Commitment Decision Closes It.....	87
2.4.3. Price Regulation	89
2.4.3.1. ... With a Structural Solution.	89
2.5. Conclusions	90

**Chapter 3. Energy Liberalisation in an Antitrust Straitjacket:
A Plant Too Far? 93**

3.1. Chapter Summary	93
3.2. Introduction	93
3.3. Far-Fetched Concerns	96
3.3.1. Dominance	98
3.3.2. Abuse	100
3.4. Far-Reaching Remedies	103
3.4.1. Step 1: Alternative Behavioural Commitments?	107
3.4.2. Step 2: Appropriate and Necessary Structural Commitments? ..	108
3.4.3. Commitments and Exploitative Concerns	111
3.4.4. Commitments and Exclusionary Concerns	115
3.5. Conclusions	116
3.6. Annex 1	117
3.7. Annex 2	122
3.7.1. Spain	122
3.7.2. Denmark	123
3.7.3. Germany	125
3.7.4. The UK	126

3.7.5. Italy	128
3.7.6. Belgium	129
3.7.7. Discussion	130
Chapter 4. Market Integration and Economic Efficiency in Conflict?	
Commitments in the <i>Swedish Interconnectors Case</i>	135
4.1. Chapter Summary	135
4.2. Introduction	136
4.3. Model	138
4.3.1. Set-Up	138
4.3.2. First-Best	140
4.3.3. Scenarios	143
4.4. Results	146
4.4.1. Counter-Trading with Full Congestion Shifting (Alleged Abuse)	146
4.4.2. Counter-Trading without Congestion Shifting (Interim Remedy as Implemented)	151
4.4.3. Counter-Trading with Partial Congestion Shifting (Optimal Interim Remedy)	154
4.4.4. Market Splitting (Final Remedy)	157
4.4.5. Comparison of Four Scenarios	160
4.5. Conclusions	163
Chapter 5. Power Markets Shaped by Antitrust	169
5.1. Chapter Summary	169
5.2. Introduction	169
5.3. The Case and Its Context	171
5.4. Internal Market Objective Reached with Competition Policy	174
5.4.1. Political Climate and Legal Concerns Likely Delayed the Case	175
5.4.1.1. Political Climate	175
5.4.1.2. Legal Concerns	177
5.4.2. Commitment Procedure Simplifies the Case	179
5.4.3. Promotion of Market Integration as a Key Objective in the SvK Case	180
5.4.4. Neglecting Objective Justification	183
5.4.4.1. Objective Justification and Commitment Procedure	183
5.4.4.2. Objective Justification Based on Efficiencies	186
5.4.4.3. Objective Justification Based on Public Interest	187
5.4.5. Proportionality of the Final Remedy	189
5.5. SVK's Commitments in the Light of the Nordic Debate	191

5.6. European Rules on Congestion Management	197
5.6.1. Existing EU Rules on Congestion Shifting.....	198
5.6.2. Existing EU Rules on Congestion Shifting: What Do They Mean for the TSOs?	200
5.6.3. The New CACM Network Code and Its Impact on Congestion Shifting.....	203
5.6.4. Limits of the EU Regulation	207
5.7. Conclusions	209
Chapter 6. Conclusions	213
6.1. Energy Policy Dimension	213
6.1.1. Regulatory Objectives Pursued by the Commission.....	213
6.1.2. Overcoming the Limits of Sector-Specific Regulation	214
6.1.3. Overcoming Political Opposition	216
6.1.4. The Commission’s Bigger Toolbox for Regulatory Purposes.....	217
6.2. Competition Policy Dimension	218
6.2.1. Suboptimal Case Selection and Prioritisation (1a)	219
6.2.2. Suboptimal Antitrust Response (1b)	221
6.2.3. Pro-Article 9 Bias (2)	222
6.2.4. The Commission’s Smaller Toolbox for Regulatory Purposes ...	222
6.3. Addressing the Research Question	223
6.4. Scope for Further Research.....	224
Chapter 7. Summary.....	227
<i>References</i>	<i>231</i>

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

TABLES

Table 1.	Overview of antitrust cases closed by commitment decisions between 2004 and 2014.	13
Table 2.	Energy antitrust investigations launched by the Commission between 2004 and 2014	15
Table 3.	E.ON's generation capacity by sources: Germany, 2007.	109
Table 4.	E.ON's divested capacity by sources: November 2008	110
Table 5.	E.ON's generation portfolio post- versus pre-divestiture.	111
Table 6.	Data for the numerical illustration	140
Table 7.	Four scenarios.	145
Table 8.	Numerical results for four scenarios	149

FIGURES

Figure 1.	Well-functioning and competitive electricity markets according to my nephews and my sister	27
Figure 2.	Positioning the research topic in the context of current scholarly debates.	35
Figure 3.	The concept of proportionality under Article 7 and Article 9 of EC Regulation 1/2003: comparison.	105
Figure 4.	Merit order curve for Germany, 2008	112
Figure 5.	Price formation on a short-term competitive electricity market	117
Figure 6.	The effect of capacity withdrawal on price formation in a competitive short-term electricity market	119
Figure 7.	Set-up of the model.	139
Figure 8.	First-best outcome	142
Figure 9.	First-best: gross consumer surplus and production costs	142
Figure 10.	Counter-trading with full congestion shifting: regional prices, import and export quantities	148
Figure 11.	Counter-trading with full congestion shifting: producer surplus and consumer surplus	150
Figure 12.	Counter-trading without congestion shifting: regional prices, import and export quantities	152

Figure 13. Counter-trading without congestion shifting: producer surplus and consumer surplus 153

Figure 14. Counter-trading with partial congestion shifting: regional prices, import and export quantities 155

Figure 15. Counter-trading with partial congestion shifting: producer surplus and consumer surplus 156

Figure 16. Market splitting: regional prices, import and export quantities. . 158

Figure 17. Market splitting: producer surplus and consumer surplus 158

Figure 18. Market splitting with strategic congestion: regional prices, import and export quantities 159