SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

The Series on Transitional Justice offers a platform for high-quality research within the rapidly growing field of transitional justice. The research is, of necessity, inter-disciplinary in nature, drawing from disciplines such as law, political science, history, sociology, criminology, anthropology and psychology, as well as from various specialised fields of study such as human rights, victimology and peace studies. Furthermore, the research is international in outlook, drawing on the knowledge and experience of academics and other specialists in many different regions of the world.

The series is aimed at a variety of audiences who are either working or interested in fields such as crime and justice; human rights; humanitarian law and human security; conflict resolution and peace building. These audiences include academics, researchers, students, policy makers, practitioners, non-governmental organisations and the media.

All books published within the series are subject to a double-blind peer review by recognised authorities in the field.

The General Editors of the Series are:
– Prof. Stephan Parmentier (Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium)
– Prof. Jeremy Sarkin (University of South Africa)
– Prof. Elmar Weitekamp (University of Tübingen, Germany)

The general editors receive the support from an Editorial Committee and an Advisory Board, consisting of internationally renowned academics and practitioners.

Published titles within the series:
5. Antoine Buyse (ed.), Margins of Conflict. The ECHR and Transitions to and from Armed Conflict (2011), 978-94-000-0157-2

For previous volume in the series, please visit http://tj.intersentia.com

SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE, Volume 14
HISTORICAL MEMORY AND
CRIMINAL JUSTICE IN SPAIN

A Case of Late Transitional Justice

Josep M. Tamarit Sumalla

Collaborators:
Ana Beltrán Montoliu
Joan Sagués San José

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
## CONTENTS

Chapter 1.  
Introduction ................................................................. 1

Chapter 2.  
Transitional Justice and the Spanish Case ................................. 7

1. Theoretical background: models of transitional justice .......... 7
2. Transitional justice and historical memory ......................... 10
3. Victims' rights ............................................................... 14
   3.1. The triad of truth, justice and reparation ...................... 14
   3.1.1. Truth ............................................................. 14
   3.1.2. Justice ............................................................ 15
   3.1.3. Reparation ......................................................... 15
3.2. The development of international law: the basic principles .... 16
3.3. New victims' rights within a transitional context: identity and personal memory ........................................... 18
4. Evaluating the Spanish case .............................................. 19
   4.1. Time ................................................................. 19
   4.2. The symmetry and asymmetry of victimisation .............. 20
   4.3. The weakness of democratic forces ............................. 21
   4.4. A smooth and non-violent transition .......................... 21

Chapter 3.  
The Burden of Spain's 20th Century History ............................ 23

1. Introduction ................................................................. 23
2. The battle for memory ..................................................... 24
3. The democratic experience of the Republic .......................... 27
4. The denial of democracy leads to war ................................ 31
5. Dictatorship, repression and memory according to the victors .... 34
6. The difficult relationship between Spanish democracy and its uncomfortable history ........................................ 44
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 4.</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Repression and Its Legal Structure</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Basis of the repression</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Depuration</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Criminal law under Francoism</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Large legislation on criminal matters</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The Penal Code of 1944</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Moral and religious inspiration</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 A socially insensitive criminal justice system</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 A “criminal law of author”</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Sexism</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Victor’s justice and retaliation: the <em>Causa General</em></td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 5.</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Transition without Justice?</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The “Spanish model”: rhetoric about reconciliation and a decision not to look back to the past</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Amnesty</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Repairing the past: gradual and partial measures of reparation</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The victim’s policy</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 6.</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Questioning the Transition: Late Transitional Justice?</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. A new social and political context</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Social activism</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The political response</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Evaluating the transition</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 7.</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Historical Memory Act and Its Implementation</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. General remarks</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Rehabilitation of condemned persons</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Reparation</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The exhumation and identification of the victims</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Social reaction and implementation</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The Catalan Mass Graves Act 2009</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. New provisions concerning the declaration of death</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 8.
Prosecuting the Crimes of Francoism .................................................. 107

1. Precedents ............................................................................................. 107
   1.1. An exceptional case for prosecution .............................................. 107
   1.2. Prosecution of crimes committed in other countries .................. 109
      1.2.1. Universal jurisdiction ............................................................ 109
      1.2.2. Chile ................................................................................. 110
      1.2.3. Argentina ........................................................................... 111
      1.2.4. Guatemala ....................................................................... 113
      1.2.5. Sahara .............................................................................. 114
      1.2.6. From absolute universal jurisdiction to its legal restriction .... 114
      1.2.7. Cases with Spanish victims of on-going prosecution ........... 116
      1.2.8. An internal echo: the Paracuellos case .............................. 117

2. A judicial decision to prosecute the crimes of Francoism and its consequences .................................................. 118
   2.1. The Garzón case ........................................................................... 118
   2.2. An overview from the procedural perspective .......................... 125

Chapter 9.
Is Criminal Prosecution Viable? The Theoretical Debate ...................... 133

1. The legal description of crimes and the problem of retroactivity .......... 133
   1.1. Crimes against humanity under Spanish criminal law .............. 133
   1.2. An appeal to natural law .............................................................. 134
   1.3. An appeal to international criminal law ..................................... 136
   1.4. Convictions for other crimes ....................................................... 140
      1.4.1. An innovative solution? ....................................................... 140
      1.4.2. Murder ............................................................................. 142
      1.4.3. Forced disappearances ....................................................... 142

2. Prescription .......................................................................................... 145

3. The Amnesty Act .................................................................................. 149
   3.1. Amnesty under Spanish law ....................................................... 149
   3.2. Types of amnesty ....................................................................... 151
      3.2.1. Self-amnesty .................................................................... 152
      3.2.2. Individualised and conditional amnesties ...................... 153
      3.2.3. General amnesty aimed at peacekeeping ...................... 154
   3.3. The legitimacy of amnesty laws ................................................. 155
   3.4. The effects of the Spanish Amnesty Act .................................... 160

4. The lost children of Francoism ............................................................ 163

5. Abduction of minors and unlawful adoptions .................................... 167
Chapter 10.
Seeking Justice more than Thirty Years after the Transition ............. 171

1. What kind of justice and for which victims? ......................... 171
2. Recognising the limits of criminal justice ......................... 176
3. Why not a truth commission? .................................. 178

Bibliography ....................................................................... 185
Internet resources ............................................................. 193
Appendix. Spanish Historical Memory Act ............................ 195