FEMINIST PERSPECTIVES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE
SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

The Series on Transitional Justice offers a platform for high-quality research within the rapidly growing field of transitional justice. The research is, of necessity interdisciplinary in nature, drawing from disciplines such as law, political science, history, sociology, criminology, anthropology, and psychology, as well as from various specialized fields of study such as human rights, victimology and peace studies. Furthermore, the research is international in outlook, drawing on the knowledge and experience of academics and other specialists in many different regions of the world.

The series is aimed at a variety of audiences who are either working or interested in fields such as crime and justice; human rights; humanitarian law and human security; conflict resolution and peace building. These audiences include academics, researchers, students, policy makers, practitioners, non-governmental organisations and the media.

All books published within the series are subject to a double-blind peer review by recognised authorities in the field.

The General Editors of the Series are:
– Prof. Stephan Parmentier (Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium)
– Prof. Jeremy Sarkin (University of South Africa)
– Prof. Elmar Weitekamp (University of Tübingen, Germany)

The general editors receive the support from an Editorial Committee and an Advisory Board, consisting of internationally renowned academics and practitioners.

Published titles within the series:
2. Laura Stovel, Long Road Home, Building Reconciliation and Trust in Post-War Sierra Leone (2010), 978-94-000-0028-5
5. Antoine Buyse (ed.), Margins of Conflict. The ECHR and Transitions to and from Armed Conflict (2011), 978-94-000-0157-2

SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE, Volume 13
FEMINIST PERSPECTIVES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

From International and Criminal to Alternative Forms of Justice

Edited by
Martha Albertson Fineman
Estelle Zinsstag

intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
Feminist Perspectives on Transitional Justice. From International and Criminal to Alternative Forms of Justice
Martha Albertson Fineman and Estelle Zinsstag (eds.)

© 2013 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk


ISBN 978-1-78068-142-9
D/2013/7849/19
NUR 828


No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.
To the memory of Katherine Rorabach
Martha

To Georges and Georgios
Estelle
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We are indebted to the editor of the transitional justice book series, Stephan Parmentier, and his colleagues Jeremy Sarkin and Elmar Weitekamp at Intersentia. Their initial interest in this project and encouragement as it progressed made this collection possible. We are also grateful for the wonderful contributions of our authors and appreciate the patience they displayed when the project took longer to complete than originally anticipated. Melanie Mendenhall deserves a special thank you for her attention to detail and wonderful editorial assistance in getting the book ready for publication. Finally, we both are consistently grateful for and enriched by the support and encouragement of our respective families and friends.
CONTENTS

Acknowledgments ................................................................. vii

Introduction: Feminist Perspectives on Transitional Justice
    Martha Albertson Fineman and Estelle Zinsstag ......................... 1

PART 1
FEMINIST PERSPECTIVES IN CONTEXTS

Introduction ............................................................................ 9

Chapter 1
International Law and Domestic Gender Justice, or Why Case Studies Matter
    Catherine O’Rourke ............................................................... 11
1. Introduction ........................................................................ 11
2. Feminist critiques of international criminal law ......................... 13
   2.1. ICL as legally deficient ............................................... 15
   2.2. ICL as sexualising and infantilising women ..................... 17
   2.3. ICL as silencing individual women and more radical feminist critiques ................................................................. 19
   2.4. Feminist engagement with ICL as hegemonic and imperialist . . 20
3. A ’Boomerang Pattern’? ....................................................... 22
4. International law, local gender justice? The case of Chile ......... 25
   4.1. Women, gender and transitional justice in a pacted transition ... 25
   4.2. ICL as legally deficient ............................................... 30
      4.2.1. Truth, phase 1, the Chilean National Truth and Reconciliation Commission ......................................................... 30
      4.2.2. Truth, phase 2, the National Commission on Political Imprisonment and Torture .................................................. 32
   4.3. ICL as sexualising and infantilising women ..................... 33
      4.3.1. Sexual violence as women’s exclusive experience of conflict and repression, obscuring other harms suffered by women, such as socioeconomic harms or the loss of a family member. ...................................................... 33

Intersentia ix
## Contents

4.3.2. Focus on sexual violence establishing exclusionary categories of ‘ideal’ female victimhood that reinforce the restrictive regulation of female sexuality ................. 34

4.3.3. Focus on women’s sexual victimhood marginalising women as agents of political change ................. 36

4.4. ICL as silencing individual women victims and more radical feminist critiques ................................................. 37

4.4.1. Silencing of individual women victims .............................. 37

4.4.2. Engagement with international criminal law as silencing more radical feminist critique ......................... 38

4.5. Feminist engagement with ICL as hegemonic and imperialist ................................................................. 38

4.5.1. The hazards of governance feminism ................................. 38

4.5.2. Feminism and the imperialist mission of international law 40

5. Conclusion ........................................................................... 41

### Chapter 2

**Advancing a Feminist Analysis of Transitional Justice**

Fionnuala Ní AOLÁIN ............................................................. 43

1. A brief history of presence and engagement ........................................ 45

2. The limits of law ........................................................................... 53

3. Conclusion ........................................................................... 61

### Chapter 3

**Feminist Perspectives on Extraordinary Justice**

David C. GRAY and Benjamin A. LEVIN ................................. 63

1. The moral meaning of violence .................................................. 68

2. Intersectional identity and dynamic stability ................................ 72

3. Women and extraordinary justice ........................................... 76

4. Women at the nexus ............................................................... 84

5. Conclusion ........................................................................... 87

### Chapter 4

**Intersectionality: A Feminist Theory for Transitional Justice**

Eilish ROONEY ................................................................. 89

1. Introduction ........................................................................... 90

2. Travelling modalities .............................................................. 95

3. Awkward absences ............................................................... 97

4. Negotiating presence .............................................................. 103

5. Intersecting transitions ......................................................... 108

6. Conclusion ........................................................................... 112

**Intersentia**
PART 2
FEMINIST LEGAL STRATEGIES AND THEIR CONSEQUENCES

Introduction ................................................................. 117

Chapter 5
International Law, Crisis and Feminist Time

Mary H. HANSEL ......................................................... 119

1. Introduction ............................................................. 120
2. The crisis model of international law and humanitarian intervention .................................................. 121
   2.1. The nature of the crisis model .................................... 122
   2.2. The NATO intervention in Kosovo ............................. 123
   2.3. Conclusion .......................................................... 124
3. The marginalization of women under the crisis model ................................................................. 124
   3.1. White male heroism in the crisis model ......................... 124
       3.1.1. The centrality of the hero’s rescue ....................... 125
       3.1.2. The presumed benevolence of the hero ................ 126
   3.2. The crisis model’s effects on women in targeted states ........ 128
       3.2.1. Obscuring the ‘international law of everyday life’ ..... 128
       3.2.2. Neglecting hardships endured during crisis .......... 129
       3.2.3. Failures to consider women in the aftermath .......... 129
       3.2.4. Conclusion .................................................... 130
4. The crisis model’s temporal underpinnings ................................................................. 130
   4.1. ‘Emergency time’ governing the crisis model ............... 131
   4.2. Developing a broader temporal view .......................... 133
   4.3. Conclusion .......................................................... 134
5. Feminist temporal approaches to inform international law .... 134
   5.1. Predominant strains of feminist temporality and applications to the crisis model ......................... 135
       5.1.1. Time as regression ............................................ 135
       5.1.2. Time as redemption .......................................... 137
       5.1.3. Time as rupture .............................................. 138
       5.1.4. Time as repetition .......................................... 140
   5.2. Conclusion .......................................................... 142
6. Conclusion ............................................................... 142
Chapter 6
Justice as Practised by Victims of Conflict: Post-World War II
Movements as Sites of Engagement and Knowledge

Cheah Wui Ling ................................................................. 145

1. Introduction ................................................................. 145
2. The response of international law to conflict-related harms:
   Evolving approaches .................................................. 148
   2.1. International humanitarian law and international criminal law 148
   2.2. International human rights law ........................................ 150
   2.3. The 2005 UN Basic Principles ...................................... 151
3. The rise and development of post-World War II movements .......... 153
   3.1. The Japanese American redress movement ...................... 154
   3.2. The Hibakusha movement and the global anti-nuclear
        movement ............................................................... 157
   3.3. The 'comfort women' movement ................................... 160
4. Justice as conceptualised by post-World War II movements:
   Recognition and atonement ............................................ 163
   4.1. Recognising the suffering and rights of victims .................. 164
   4.2. The atonement of wrongdoers ..................................... 166
5. Conclusion: Learning from victims and justice as practised .......... 168

Chapter 7
The Symbolic and Communicative Function of International Criminal
Tribunals

Teresa Godwin Phelps ..................................................... 171

1. The early ICTR and ICTY trials ..................................... 175
2. Later ICTY and ICTR trials ............................................ 180
3. The Special Court for Sierra Leone .................................. 181

PART 3
EMERGING ALTERNATIVES WITHIN TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

Introduction ................................................................. 187

Chapter 8
Sexual Violence Against Women in Armed Conflicts and Restorative
Justice: An Exploratory Analysis

Estelle Zinsstag ............................................................. 189

1. Introduction ................................................................. 189
2. Sexual violence against women in armed conflicts .................. 191
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Greensboro and Beyond: Remediating the Structural Sexism in Truth and Reconciliation Processes and Determining the Potential Impact and Benefits of Truth Processes in the United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peggy Maisel                                                                                    215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction                                                                                     215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Feminist critique of human rights and TRC processes                                               218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The South African TRC                                                                             223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Brief history of the development of the TRC                                                    224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. A ‘gender-neutral’ TRC                                                                         225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Comparison to other TRC processes                                                               232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Greensboro                                                                                       234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Establishing the Greensboro TRC                                                                236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. The Greensboro mandate                                                                        238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. The Commission process                                                                       240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4. The final report, recommendations, and impact in Greensboro                                      244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Beyond Greensboro                                                                                247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Conclusion                                                                                       253</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Exclusion of Women in Post-Conflict Peace Processes: Transitional Justice in Northern Uganda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joseph Wasonga                                                                                       255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction                                                                                     255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Historical perspective of the conflict in northern Uganda                                        256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Transitional justice initiatives                                                                 260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Place of women in transitional justice in northern Uganda                                         268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusion                                                                                       273</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 11</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shifting Paradigms for State Intervention: Gender-Based Violence in Cuba</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deborah M. Weissman                                                                                  275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction                                                                                     275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Cuba in the international: Human rights as political opportunity structures                         276</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Contents

3. Objective and subjective elements of gender equality as framework ........................................ 278
4. Specific approaches to domestic violence ................................................................. 280
    4.1. Definitions and determinants ........................................................................ 280
    4.2. Cuban responses to domestic violence ...................................................... 281
        4.2.1. Research and policy initiatives ......................................................... 282
        4.2.2. Controlling domestic violence through participatory mechanisms ............. 283
    4.3. Legal responses ....................................................................................... 284
5. Conclusion .................................................................................................. 286

### PART 4

**CASE STUDIES**

**Introduction** ......................................................................................... 291

**Chapter 12**

*Beauty and the Beast: Gender Integration and the Police in Post-Conflict Bosnia and Herzegovina*

Lisa R. Muftić and Azra Rašić ......................................................... 293

1. Introduction ....................................................................................... 293
2. Police reformation in Bosnia ................................................................. 294
3. Gender integration as part of the police reformation process .............. 295
    3.1. Recruitment and training .................................................................. 296
    3.2. Promotion ..................................................................................... 296
    3.3. Working conditions ....................................................................... 297
    3.4. Maternity leave ............................................................................ 297
    3.5. Police misconduct ......................................................................... 298
4. Research questions ............................................................................... 298
5. Methods ............................................................................................... 299
6. Female Bosnian national police officers .................................................. 300
7. Conclusion ............................................................................................ 306
8. Limitations & future studies ................................................................. 308

**Chapter 13**

*The Parallel Processes of Law and Social Change: Gender Violence and Work in the United States and South Africa*

Julie Goldscheid .................................................................................. 311

1. Introduction .......................................................................................... 311
2. Context .................................................................................................. 312
    2.1. Prevalence of abuse ....................................................................... 312
    2.2. Women’s labor market participation ........................................... 314
3. Reform efforts and critiques .................................................. 316
4. Gender violence and work .................................................. 320
5. South Africa’s potential for legal responses .............................. 324
6. Implications for reform ....................................................... 326
   6.1. Limits of litigation and employment law responses ............... 326
   6.2. Challenges of implementation, enforcement and training ....... 327
   6.3. Gender violence in a socio-political context ....................... 328
   6.4. Broad-based commitments and difficult conversations ......... 329
7. Conclusion .................................................................. 331

Chapter 14
Neoliberalism’s Impact on Women: A Case Study in Creating Supply and Demand for Human Trafficking
Dina Francesca Haynes ......................................................... 333

1. Arizona market in context ................................................... 334
   1.1. Post-war Bosnia and Herzegovina ..................................... 335
   1.2. The first myth: achieving ethnic harmony through market forces .................................................. 336
   1.3. Human trafficking at Arizona market .............................. 339
   1.4. The second myth: the actors on the ground during war should also be making economic development decisions ...... 342
   1.5. Politico-socio-economic engineering: the story of Brčko and its relationship to Arizona market ......................... 344
2. The impact of neoliberalism’s market liberalization practices on women .................................................. 348
3. Conclusion .................................................................. 353

About the Authors ................................................................. 357