BEYOND THE DEATH PENALTY
BEYOND THE DEATH PENALTY

Reflections on Punishment

Edited by

Hans NeLEN
Jacques Claessen

intersentia
Cambridge - Antwerp - Portland
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book contains a selection of papers that were presented during the multidisciplinary conference ‘Beyond the Death Penalty; Reflections on Punishment’, organised by the Maastricht Centre for Human Rights on 28 and 29 October 2010. The event marked the 150th anniversary of the de facto abolition of the death penalty in the Netherlands.

The original idea to organise the conference (and a parallel cultural programme) came from our colleague (and freelance journalist) Paul van der Steen. Due to personal circumstances, he had to withdraw from the organising committee himself. However we managed to enthuse some of our colleagues and succeeded in turning our original ideas into a programme that covered a wide range of topics in relation to punishment. Special references, in this respect, have to be made to David Roef, Gerard de Jonge, Louis Berkvens, Luc Bien and Peter Bal. The latter passed away suddenly on 26 March 2010. This book is dedicated to him. Our dear colleague and friend Peter Bal was really looking forward to a stimulating multidisciplinary conference, and we still feel deep regret that he was not there to attend the conference.

Based on the positive feedback the organisers received from many participants, the conference turned out to be a success. The participants enjoyed the pleasant academic atmosphere, the debates, and the high quality of the presentations. We want to thank all speakers and participants at the conference for their input.

The conference could not have been organised without the financial support of a number of institutions. We are indebted to the Province of Limburg, the Research and Documentation Centre of the Ministry of Safety and Justice (WODC), the Limburg University Fund/SWOL, and the Maastricht Faculty of Law, for their donations. The ancient Maastricht City Hall was kindly placed at our disposal by the local authorities for the re-enactment of the last criminal case in the Netherlands that led to a public execution.

The organisational support of Chantal Kuypers and Yleen Simonis during the conference was invaluable. Yleen was also a great help to us throughout the whole preparation period. We also want to thank Stephan van Uden and, in particular, Evelyn Bell, for their assistance in providing the layout for this book. For a long time, Ben van Wersch belonged to the team of editors of this book. We are very grateful for his input and have good memories of our fruitful and pleasant meetings.
Acknowledgements

What we hoped to achieve with the conference was a reflection on punishment from a variety of angles, and, additionally, to give some food for thought to the contemporary debate on crime and punishment. Without doubt, the conference served these purposes. We hope this book will have the same impact on its readers.
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ................................................................. v

Chapter I. General Introduction
Hans Nelen and Jacques Claessen ........................................ 1

1. Historical and Cultural Background .................................. 3
2. Punishment in a Populist Context ....................................... 5
3. Reconciliation and Rehabilitation ...................................... 6
4. Prison Life ......................................................................... 7
5. Efficiency and Effectiveness .............................................. 8

PART I.
HISTORICAL AND CULTURAL BACKGROUND

Chapter II. Whatever Happened to the Death Penalty?
David Garland ........................................................................ 13

1. Introduction ....................................................................... 13
2. The Character and Capacity of States ................................. 15
3. Political Processes of Reform ............................................. 17
4. Cultural Processes of Reform ............................................. 19
5. Conclusion ......................................................................... 22

Chapter III. The Abolition of the Death Penalty in the Netherlands
Chrisje Brants ........................................................................ 25

1. Introduction ....................................................................... 25
2. Theories on the Disappearance of Public Punishment .......... 26
3. Legal Culture and the Legitimacy of Criminal Justice ......... 29
4. The Seeds of Dutch Legal Tradition: the Republic of Seven United Provinces ........................................ 31
5. A Dutch Revolution and the Reception of Ideas of the Enlightenment on Criminal Justice ........................................ 36
6. The Struggle for Reform .................................................... 39
Chapter IV. The Long and Peculiar History Without the Death Penalty in Finland

Jukka Kekkonen ................................................................. 45

1. Introduction ................................................................. 45
2. *De Facto* Abolition of the Death Penalty: 1826 .................. 48
   of 1889 ......................................................................... 50
4. Crisis Episodes: Finnish Civil War ....................................... 52
   4.1. Interwar Period .......................................................... 56
   4.2. The Second World War .............................................. 57
   4.3. The Abolition of the Death Penalty ........................... 58
   4.4. Conclusions .............................................................. 59

Chapter V. Imprisonment as an Alternative to the Death Penalty. Historical Observations Complementary to an Emerging Discussion

Lydia Bertram ................................................................. 63

1. Introduction ................................................................. 63
2. Joint Versus Solitary Confinement ..................................... 64
7. Debates on the Penal Code: 1859–1860 ............................. 70
8. The Debate on the Abolition of the Death Penalty .............. 71
9. Conclusion ................................................................. 74

Chapter VI. Towards Abolition of the Death Penalty Based on International Obligations of a State

Diana Merten ................................................................. 77

1. Introduction ................................................................. 77
2. The Hypothesis .............................................................. 78
3. Substantiation ................................................................. 80
   3.1. Travaux Préparatoires to Article 6, Paragraph 1 ICCPR .......... 81
   3.2. Travaux Préparatoires to Article 6, Paragraph 2 ICCPR .......... 83
       3.2.1. Reference to ‘Most Serious Crimes’ ............................ 83
       3.2.2. Reference to ‘the Law in Force at the Time of the
               Commission of the Crime’ ...................................... 84
       3.2.3. Reference to the CPPCG ....................................... 84
       3.2.4. Reference to a Final Judgement Rendered by a Competent
               Court ................................................................. 86
4. Challenging the Hypothesis .............................................. 88
5. Consolidating the Hypothesis ........................................... 89
6. Conclusion ................................................................. 91

PART 2.
PUNISHMENT IN A POPULIST CONTEXT

Chapter VII. Crime and Punishment in a Populist Context
Hans Boutellier ............................................................... 95
1. Introduction ................................................................. 95
2. Security as a Populist Theme .......................................... 96
3. Times of Confusion .................................................... 98
4. Social Ordering .......................................................... 99
5. A Reply to Populism? ................................................... 101

Chapter VIII. Too Readily Dismissed? A Victimological Perspective on Penal Populism
Antony Pemberton .......................................................... 105
1. Introduction ................................................................. 105
2. Victimology Versus Penal Populism ................................. 107
   2.1. Victims Are Not More or Less Punitive than Non-Victims .... 107
   2.2. Victims Are Not as Much Interested in Retribution and Revenge as They Are in Other Matters .......... 108
   2.3. Even if Victims Express an Interest in Punishment It Will Do Them No Good ........................................ 109
3. Punitiveness in Victims: Questioning the Victimological Consensus ......................................................... 110
4. Addressing Harms and Wrongs, Overlapping but Distinct Aspects of Reacting to Victimisation ................................. 112
5. The Importance of Revenge and Retribution ...................... 115
6. Conclusion ................................................................. 119

Chapter IX. A ‘Natural Right’ to Revenge?
Bas van Stokkom .......................................................... 121
1. Introduction ................................................................. 121
2. A ‘Natural Right’ to be Enraged? ..................................... 123
3. Penal Populism and Using Victims ................................... 126
4. Victim Impact Schemes and Punitive Desires ..................... 128
5. Is Revenge Helpful? ...................................................... 131
6. Victim Duties ............................................................. 133
7. Concluding Thoughts ................................................... 137
### Chapter X. Lay Participation in the Dutch Criminal Procedure Will Not Result in Higher Public Satisfaction

**Henk Elffers**

1. Introduction ........................................... 139
2. Public Satisfaction with the Judiciary .................. 140
3. Dissatisfaction Is Not a Function of Lack of Lay Participation ...... 142
4. Laymen Will Not Decide Differently from Professional Criminal Judges 143
5. Summing Up ........................................... 143

### Chapter XI. Eye to Eye with the Dutch Anti-Social Behaviour Agenda

**Patrick van Calster and Marc Schuilenburg**

1. Introduction ........................................... 145
2. Background of Collective Shop Ban ........................... 147
3. Differences with Criminal Law ............................... 149
4. Quasi Criminal Law ....................................... 151
   4.1. Public Familiarity with the Measure .................... 152
   4.2. Arbitrariness in the Enforcement ...................... 154
   4.3. Individual Modes of Settlement ....................... 156
5. Conclusion ............................................. 158

### Chapter XII. Sex with a Child Robot. Psychological, Ethical and Legal Arguments

**David Bamps**

1. Introduction ........................................... 161
1.1. Theoretical Framework .................................. 162
1.2. Statement of the Problem .............................. 164
1.3. Research Questions .................................. 164
1.4. Methodology ........................................ 165
2. Commnis Opinio ......................................... 166
   2.1. Poll 2009 ............................................ 166
   2.2. Questionnaire 2010 .................................. 167
   2.3. Intuitive Law and Contradictory Moral Beliefs ............ 169
3. Robotics and Underage Sex Workers .......................... 170
   3.1. Stepping Stone Theory ................................ 171
   3.2. Canalisation Theory .................................. 171
4. Sex Robotics, Children and the Law .......................... 172
   4.1. Indirect Harm Argument ................................ 173
   4.2. The Persuasive Argument ............................. 173
   4.3. The Realistic Argument .............................. 174
5. Videogame Industry and Sex Robotics? ....................... 175
6. Conclusion and Recommendations ............................. 177
PART 3.
RECONCILIATION AND REHABILITATION

Chapter XIII. Crime and Punishment: Reflections on (Capital) Punishment from a Religious Perspective
Jacques CLAESSEN ................................................. 183
1. Introduction ................................................. 183
2. Religion as a Neglected Interest in Criminology .......... 184
3. Religion and Religion ........................................ 185
4. Religion in the Public Sphere ............................. 186
5. Religious Views on Crime and Punishment ............... 188
  5.1. Religious Fundamentalism and Conservatism .......... 188
  5.1.1. American Criminological Research .................. 189
  5.1.2. God is Love. Still, He Punishes .................. 191
  5.2. Mysticism ............................................. 193
  5.2.1. A Mystical Theory of (Criminal) Justice .......... 194
  5.2.2. No Room for the Death Sentence ................. 196
6. The Mystical Roots of Restorative Justice ................. 198
  6.1. Crime as a Relational Conflict and Law Governing Wrongful Conduct to Restore Relations .......... 198
  6.2. Man as a 'Junction of Relations' ..................... 199
  6.3. Restorative Justice Means Attention to the Needs of all Parties .. 200
  6.4. Restorative Justice as a Mystical-Legal Perspective in Action .... 201
7. Epilogue ..................................................... 201

Chapter XIV. The South African Model of Transitional Justice: Revenge or Reconciliation?
Georgi VERBEECK ................................................. 203
1. Introduction ................................................. 203
2. Dealing with the Past in Post-Conflict Societies .......... 204
  2.1. Amnesia ............................................. 205
  2.2. Trials and Justice ..................................... 206
  2.3. Lustration ............................................. 207
  2.4. Restitution and Compensation ........................ 207
  2.5. Political Re-Education ................................ 208
  2.6. Truth and Reconciliation Commissions ............... 208
3. Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa ................. 209
4. Towards a 'Culture of Apology' .......................... 213
5. South Africa: Model or Miracle? .......................... 216
Chapter XV. Criminal Records and Judicial Rehabilitation in the Netherlands
Miranda Boone .......................................................... 219
1. Introduction ............................................................ 219
2. Re-Socialisation and Rehabilitation in the Netherlands ............... 220
3. Criminal Records .................................................... 222
   3.1. Content .......................................................... 222
   3.2. Access to Criminal Records .................................. 223
4. Conduct Certificate .................................................. 225
   4.1. Admissibility .................................................... 226
   4.2. Judicial Data in the Decision to Assign a Conduct Certificate . 227
   4.3. Practical Implications ........................................... 228
5. Expunging Techniques/Rehabilitation Opportunities ..................... 229
   5.1. Automatic Measures ............................................ 229
   5.2. Measures Requiring Some Form of Merit ........................ 230
6. Issuing a Conduct Certificate ......................................... 231
   6.1. Objective Criterion ............................................. 232
   6.2. Subjective Criterion ............................................. 233
7. Retrospective Period .................................................. 234
8. Rehabilitation Rituals ................................................ 234
9. Conclusion .................................................................... 235

PART 4.
PRISON LIFE

Chapter XVI. Life Without Parole
Hans Nelen ................................................................. 241
1. Introduction ............................................................ 241
2. Deprivation of Liberty and Autonomy .................................... 243
3. Deprivation of Security ............................................... 244
4. Resistance .................................................................. 245
5. Playing the Opposites ................................................... 246
6. Interaction with Other Prisoners ........................................ 247
7. Social Cleansing ........................................................ 249
8. Epilogue .................................................................... 250

Chapter XVII. Working as a Prison Officer: To Be Human is To Be Emotional
Hanne Tournel ............................................................... 253
1. Introduction ............................................................ 253
2. What is Meant by ‘Emotions’? ........................................ 254
3. Prisons as Emotional Arenas: The Importance of Context .......... 256
4. Working as a Prison Officer: A View on the Emotional Impact . . . . . . . .  257
  4.1. Prison Officers and Emotional Labour ................................. 257
  4.2. Dynamic Security: A Complex Task ................................. 258
  4.3. Emotions and the Professional and Organisational Culture . . . . . . . 260
  4.4. The Stigma of Prison Officers As a Considerable Stressor . . . . . . . 262
5. Emotion Management by a Prison Officer .............................. 263
6. The Costs Associated with the Emotional Impact and the Required
   Emotion Management .................................................................. 265
7. Conclusion ............................................................................. 266

Chapter XVIII. Health care in Detention in the Netherlands: Dilemmas
   and Decisions
   Wilma Duijst, Tatjana Naujocks and Jan Vosters ............................ 269
  1. Introduction ........................................................................... 269
  2. The Right to Health Care .......................................................... 270
  3. Obligations for the State ............................................................. 271
  4. Medical Care in Detention in the Netherlands ................................ 273
     4.1. Just Doctoring? ................................................................. 274
     4.2. Refusal of Medical Care in a Police Station .......................... 274
     4.3. Medical Care and Safety ..................................................... 275
     4.4. Communication Between the Police Station and Prison .......... 275
     4.5. Medical Care in Prison ........................................................ 276
     4.6. Drugs ............................................................................. 276
     4.7. Refusal of Medical Care in Prison ........................................ 276
     4.8. End of Life Decisions ......................................................... 277
     4.9. Choosing Means Being Responsible ..................................... 277
  5. Death in Detention ................................................................. 278
  6. Death in a Dutch Prison or Police Station ................................... 279
  7. Conclusion ............................................................................. 281

PART 5.
EFFICIENCY AND EFFECTIVENESS

Chapter XIX. The Efficiency of Solving Criminal Conflict through
   Negotiation
   Stephanie Verhelst ................................................................. 285
  1. Introduction ........................................................................... 285
  2. Law, Economics and Efficiency ................................................ 286
     2.1. Law and Economics ......................................................... 286
     2.2. Efficiency and Criminal Law ............................................. 286
3. Different Methods for Reaching a Negotiated Solution in Criminal Conflict
   3.1. Settlement .................................................................................. 288
   3.2. Mediation in Criminal Law ............................................................ 290
   3.3. Restorative Mediation ................................................................. 291
4. A Comparison with 'Efficiency' as Starting Point ............................ 293
   4.1. Arguments Pro ........................................................................... 293
   4.2. Arguments Contra ..................................................................... 297
5. Conclusion .......................................................................................... 300

Chapter XX. Recidivism in the Netherlands: Dutch Research on the Effectiveness of Penal Interventions
   Bouke WARTNA, Daphne ALBERDA and Suzan VERWEIJ ................. 305
1. Introduction ....................................................................................... 305
2. Method ............................................................................................. 309
3. Results ............................................................................................... 312
4. Conclusion and Discussion .............................................................. 317

About the Authors .............................................................................. 319