INTERNATIONAL LAW IN DOMESTIC COURTS:
RULE OF LAW REFORM IN POST-CONFLICT STATES
SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

The Series on Transitional Justice offers a platform for high-quality research within the rapidly growing field of transitional justice. The research is, of necessity inter-disciplinary in nature, drawing from disciplines such as law, political science, history, sociology, criminology, anthropology and psychology, as well as from various specialised fields of study such as human rights, victimology and peace studies. Furthermore, the research is international in outlook, drawing on the knowledge and experience of academics and other specialists in many different regions of the world.

The series is aimed at a variety of audiences who are either working or interested in fields such as crime and justice; human rights; humanitarian law and human security; conflict resolution and peace building. These audiences include academics, researchers, students, policy makers, practitioners, non-governmental organisations and the media.

All books published within the series are subject to a double-blind peer review by recognised authorities in the field.

The General Editors of the Series are:
– Prof. Stephan Parmentier (Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium)
– Prof. Jeremy Sarkin (United Nations Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances)
– Prof. Elmar Weitekamp (University of Tübingen, Germany)

The general editors receive the support from an Editorial Committee and an Advisory Board, consisting of internationally renowned academics and practitioners.

Published titles within the series:
2. Laura Stovel, Long Road Home, Building Reconciliation and Trust in Post-War Sierra Leone (2010), 978-94-000-0028-5
5. Antoine Buyse (ed.), Margins of Conflict. The ECHR and Transitions to and from Armed Conflict (2011), 978-94-000-0157-2

Series on Transitional Justice, Volume 9
INTERNATIONAL LAW IN DOMESTIC COURTS: RULE OF LAW REFORM IN POST-CONFLICT STATES

Edda Kristjánsdóttir
André Nollkaemper
Cedric Ryngaert
(editors)

intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
PREFACE

This volume is the product of a working group on the international rule of law and international law in domestic courts, which commissioned a number of chapters on post-conflict situations.1

The editors wish to thank the authors who responded to the invitation to participate in this project, some of whom are promising new voices in their field and others who are established experts, but all of whom have acquired a deep and personal first-hand knowledge of the legal cultures they write about. The Rule of Law Working Group also deserves acknowledgment for the initial conceptual discussions that led to the present collection. Aristotle Constantenides and Cyprus Law School deserve thanks for accommodating the first meeting in Nikosia; Rosemary Byrne, likewise, hosted a meeting at Trinity College in Dublin. Special thanks go to Martine van Trigt for organization and support not only of a meeting in Amsterdam but throughout the life of the project. Sincere thanks also to Belinda Macmahon and Scarlet Wagner for their editorial work on the manuscript.

1 The Working Group was funded by the COST Action ISO602 on International Law in Domestic Courts (European Cooperation in the field of Scientific and Technical Research), an intergovernmental framework for European Co-operation in the field of Scientific and Technical Research, allowing the co-ordination of nationally funded research on a European level.
## CONTENTS

*Preface* ................................................................. v

**Introduction**

Edda Kristjánsdóttir, André Nolkaemper and Cedric Ryngaert. ........................................ 1

Lost in Transition? Domestic Courts, International Law and Rule of Law ‘À la Carte’

Stéphane Beaulac.......................................................... 17

1. Introduction ...................................................................... 17
2. The United Nations and the Rule of Law ................................. 19
3. Interlegality and International Rule of Law Complementarity .......... 21
4. The Thin- Thick Rule of Law Spectrum and its Limits .................. 25
5. Rule of Law ‘À la Carte’ and Recommendations of the Chef ............ 31

International Law in the Russian Courts in Transitional Situations

Sergei Yu. Marochkin............................................................. 35

1. Introduction ...................................................................... 35
2. A Brief Look at the Period Prior to the Breakdown of the USSR .......... 36
3. Transition to a New State and Legal Order and to a New Constitution ... 39
   3.1. From “Putsch” in 1991 and the Breakdown of the USSR to the Adoption of the New Constitution of Russia ................... 39
   3.2. The Constitution of Russia 1993 and International Law ............... 40
4. The Role of the Courts in Entrenchment of International Norms in the Legal Order of Russia .................................................. 42
   4.1. The Norms of International Law as a Framework for Legislation and for its Implementation ........................................ 43
   4.2. The Norms of International Treaties in Determining the Applicable Law and as a Basis of the Decision in the Case ............ 45
   4.3. Generally Recognized Principles and Norms of International Law in Judicial Decisions ........................................... 47
   4.4. Recommendations and Decisions of Bodies of International Organizations, Acts of International Conferences .................. 50
Thickening the Rule of Law in Transition: The Constitutional Entrenchment of Economic and Social Rights in South Africa
Evelyne Schmid ................................................................. 59

1. Introduction ................................................................. 59
2. South African Constitutional Law During and After Apartheid ................. 61
   2.1. The ‘Thin’ Rule of Law During Apartheid ................................ 61
   2.2. International Law in the New Constitution ............................... 63
   2.3. The Bill of Rights and Reasons for a ‘Thick’ Conception of Rule of Law ......................................................... 65
      2.3.1. Justiciable Economic and Social Rights ............................ 65
      2.3.2. Inspiration from International Law .................................. 66
3. Evaluating the Empowerment of Courts to Address ESR ..................... 68
   3.1. If and How International Norms Have Been Used .......................... 68
   3.2. Similarities and Differences Between the South African ESR Jurisprudence and International Normative Developments ............... 70
      3.2.1. Non-Application of Relevant ESR Provisions ..................... 70
      3.2.2. Rejection of the Minimum Core Concept ........................... 71
      3.2.3. South African Jurisprudence Influences the Optional Protocol to the ICESCR .................................................... 73
   3.3. Whether Entrenching International ESR Norms Has Led to Concrete Improvements .................................................... 74
4. Identifying Lessons From a Glass Half Empty ..................................... 75
   4.1. Process and Actors ....................................................... 76
   4.2. Legal Tradition and a Shared Belief in the Relevance of Law .......... 77
5. Conclusion ........................................................................ 78

Judicial Activism and the Use of International Law as Gap-Filler in Domestic Law: The Case of Forced Disappearances Committed During the Armed Conflict in Nepal
Rishikesh Wagle ................................................................. 83

1. Introduction ................................................................. 83
2. Place of International Law in the Nepalese Legal System .................... 86
   2.1. Difficulty in Recognizing a Treaty as a Part of the Domestic Law .. 87
   2.2. Influence of International Human Rights Law in the Nepalese Legal System ......................................................... 89
3. The Dhakal Case ......................................................... 92
   3.1. Background ...................................................... 92
   3.2. Judicial Activism to Fulfil the Obligations under International Human Rights Law ................................. 93
   3.3. Obligation of the State under Domestic and International Law in Post-Conflict Situations and the Role of Courts .......... 94
       3.3.1. Recognition of ‘Right to Truth’ as a Fundamental Right ... 96
       3.3.2. Obligation of the State to Provide Relief to the Victims ... 97
       3.3.3. Obligation to Initiate Legal Proceedings Against Perpetrators ............................................. 98
   3.4. Order for Introducing Separate Legislation to Deal with Enforced Disappearances ........................................ 99
   3.5. Application of the Disappearance Convention for Dealing with the Past in Nepal ........................................... 100
   3.6. Factors that Empowered the Court to Come to the Decision .... 103
4. Conclusion .......................................................... 104

International Law and Iraqi Courts
Haider Ala Hamoudi ......................................................... 107
1. Introduction – Promising Conditions and Unfulfilled Promise ..... 107
2. Traditional Approaches ............................................... 111
3. The CPA and International Law ...................................... 113
4. The Final Constitution and the Rejection of International Law in Domestic Proceedings ............................................. 116
5. Conclusion .................................................................. 121

Constitutionalism without Governance: International Standards in the Afghan Legal System
Ebrahim Afsah ............................................................... 125
1. Introduction: The Role of Law in Stabilising Conflict ............ 125
2. Political Context of Reconstruction .................................. 128
3. Institutional Context of Reconstruction ............................... 133
4. Functional Assumptions and Cultural Norms ......................... 136
5. Ideal and Reality of Statehood ......................................... 139
6. Statehood as a Prerequisite of Constitutionalism ................... 141
7. Constitutionalism without a State? .................................... 145
    7.1. Institutions Matter ............................................... 146
    7.2. Decrepit Justice System ......................................... 148
8. Conclusion .................................................................. 150
Understandings of International Law in Rwanda: A Contextual Approach
Nicola PALMER ................................................................. 153

1. Introduction ............................................................... 153
2. The Role of Law during Transitions: A Contextual Perspective .... 156
3. International Law in Post-Genocide Rwanda ....................... 160
   3.1. International Criminal Law and the Security of the Rwandan State ................................................................. 161
   3.2. International Human Rights Law in Rwanda .................... 164
   3.3. Mitigating the Tensions in International Law and Dealing with an Impossible Caseload .................................................. 167
4. International Law and the Legal Culture of the National Courts .... 170
5. Conclusion ................................................................. 172

Virtuous Flexibility. The Application of International Human Rights Norms by the Bosnian Human Rights Chamber
Antoine BUYSE ............................................................... 175

1. Introduction ............................................................... 175
2. The Genesis of a new Institution ........................................ 176
3. The Scope of Human Rights – Flexibility in Practice ................ 179
4. Interpreting Substantive Obligations .................................... 185
5. Conclusions ............................................................... 191

War Crimes Chamber of the Court of Bosnia and Herzegovina: Seeding “International Standards of Justice”?
Katerina UHLÍŘOVÁ ........................................................... 195

1. Introduction ............................................................... 195
2. Rule of Law versus ‘Rule of Ethnicity’ ................................. 197
   2.1. First Constitutional Moment: Dayton Peace Agreement and the Nature of the New Constitution ........................................ 197
   2.2. Role of International Law in the New Constitution ............. 199
   2.3. New Constitution found to be in Breach of the European Convention on Human Rights: How Ethnicity in BiH Still Matters ................................................................. 202
   2.4. Effects of the Constitutional Framework on Harmonization of Criminal Legislation in BiH: Implications for Prosecution of International Crimes ...................................................... 205
3. The Establishment of the War Crimes Chamber of the Court of Bosnia and Herzegovina as a Contribution to the Rule of Law Efforts in BiH ................................................................. 206
   3.1. Establishment of the WCC ............................................. 206
3.2. Contribution of International Personnel at the WCC to Rule of Law Efforts in BiH ............................... 208
3.3. Legal Basis of the WCC and the Applicable Law .............. 210
3.4. Application of Joint Criminal Enterprise by International (ICTY) and National Court (WCC): Will JCE Survive the Transplantation into Domestic Law? ......................... 213
   3.4.1. Rasević and Todović Case (JCE Applied) .................. 214
   3.4.2. Vuković Case (JCE Not Applied) .......................... 216
4. Conclusion: the Rule of Law Still in the Making ................. 217

Prosecution of War Crimes in Bosnian Cantonal and District Courts: the Role of the Rule of Law
Sanja Popovic ....................................................... 221
1. Introduction ....................................................... 221
2. Background: From the Trenches to The Hague and Then Back Again ... ............................................. 223
   2.1. Entity Judiciaries .............................................. 225
3. To Prosecute a War Crime: Determining the Appropriate Legal Standard ............................................. 228
   3.1. Determining the Domestic Legal Standard ............... 229
   3.2. Applicable Law: International or Domestic? ............ 231
4. Specific Problems in the Cantonal and District Courts in Applying International Criminal Law ....................... 232
   4.1. Can International Law Make Concession for Inadequate Evidence at Local Level? ......................... 233
   4.2. Witness Issues ................................................ 234
   4.3. Sentencing .................................................... 236
5. Lessons from Bosnia .......................................... 237

War Crimes Prosecution in a Post-Conflict Era and a Pluralism of Jurisdictions: the Experience of the Belgrade War Crimes Chamber
Sharon Weill and Ivan Jovanović ................................. 241
1. Introduction ....................................................... 241
2. The Establishment of the Belgrade War Crimes Chamber .... 243
   2.1. Between Internal Democratic Changes and External Pressure: a Background .................................. 243
   2.2. Serbian War Crimes Chamber and War Crimes Prosecution Office ............................................ 245
      2.2.1. Structure .................................................. 246
      2.2.2. Jurisdiction .............................................. 247
      2.2.3. Relationship with the ICTY ............................ 247
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Legal Framework for the War Crimes Trials</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1. Relationship between International and Municipal Law</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2. Substantive Criminal Law</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4. Strengthening the capacity of the War Crimes Chamber</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The First Years of the Belgrade War Crimes Chamber: an Assessment</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Case studies</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1. The Anton Lekaj Case</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2. 'The Scorpions' Case</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3. The Ovčara Case</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Patterns and Trends</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1. Legal Framework for Application of International Law</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2. The Ability of the WCC to Enforce International Law</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3. The Willingness of the WCC to Apply International Law</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Conclusion</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Treatment of Occupation Legislation by Courts in Liberated Territories
Eyal Benvenisti and Michal Saliternik                                   | 269  |

1. Introduction                                                         | 269  |
2. Occupations during World War II                                       | 270  |
2.1. Bulgarian Occupation of Greece: The Komotini Case                  | 271  |
2.2. German Occupation of Luxembourg: The Case of G v H                 | 274  |
2.3. Allied Occupation of Italy: The Du Ban Case                         | 275  |
4. Coalition Occupation of Iraq: The Trial of Saddam Hussein            | 278  |
5. UN Administrations                                                    | 279  |
5.1. UN Transitional Administration in East Timor: The Dos Santos Case  | 281  |
5.2. UN Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo: The Thermosystem Case | 283  |
6. Lessons Learned                                                       | 285  |
7. Conclusion                                                            | 288  |

The Use and Abuse of International Law: Choice of Applicable Criminal Law in Post-Conflict East Timor
Yaël Ronen                                                               | 291  |

1. Introduction                                                         | 291  |
2. Background                                                           | 292  |
3. The Role of International Law in Post-transition Determinations of the Law of East Timor | 295  |
| 4. The Role of International Law: Pre-October 1999 Law and the \textit{dos Santos Affair} | 298 |
| 5. Legal Factors in the Determination of East Timor’s Domestic Law | 302 |
| 7. Conclusion | 309 |

Concluding Observations

Edda Kristjánsdóttir, André Nollkaemper and Cedric Ryngaert

| 1. Constitutional Moments | 312 |
| 1.1. Types of Transition | 312 |
| 1.2. Moments in Time | 314 |
| 2. Form and Substance of Empowerment | 315 |
| 3. Actors | 319 |
| 4. Limitations | 321 |
| 5. Effects | 326 |