

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>About the contributors</i>	xxv

A. BACKGROUND AND LOOPHOLES OF THE EWC DIRECTIVE 94/45

1. The fundamental right of workers to information and consultation under the European Social Charter

CSILLA KOLLONAY LEHOCZKY	3
--------------------------------	---

Introduction	3
--------------------	---

I. Precedence and sequence of emerging involvement rights in Europe	6
1. The alleged precursor: Article 6 paragraph 1	6
2. The sequence of emerging involvement rights in Europe	8
II. Common features of Articles 21 and 22	10
1. Legal framework	10
2. Personal scope	11
2.1. Employers obliged to involve workers in issues of management	11
2.1.1. Restriction of the obligation to ‘undertakings’	11
2.1.2. Exempting religious communities and spiritual/ ideological undertakings	14
2.1.3. Exempting small employers	14
2.2. The concept of workers’ representatives	16
2.3. The ‘great majority’ rule	18
III. The different attributes of Articles 21 and 22	20
1. Material scope, rules and procedures under Article 21	20
2. Material scope, rules and procedures of Article 22	23
IV. Article 29: scope, content, rules and procedures	26
V. Sanctions	28

2. Worker involvement in secondary EC law prior to the Recast Directive

FILIP DORSSEMONT	31
------------------------	----

Introduction	31
--------------------	----

I.	A conceptual study	34
1.	Worker involvement	37
2.	Information	38
3.	The right to consultation.	39
4.	The right to participation	46
5.	The representation and the collective defence of the interests of workers	48
II.	Basic principles of the Community right to worker involvement.	50
III.	The substantive scope of application of the directives in retrospect.	54
IV.	The spirit of cooperation: re-negotiational, pre-contractual and post-contractual.	55
V.	Horizontal subsidiarity	58
VI.	To whom does this right to information and consultation belong?	62
VII.	Limitations of the fundamental right to information and consultation	66
1.	Limitations <i>ratione personae</i> in Treaty articles and human rights instruments	67
2.	The limitation <i>ratione personae</i> in the worker involvement directives.	68
2.1.	Undertakings, public and/or private sector	68
2.2.	Thresholds and levels	71
2.3.	<i>Tendenzschutz</i>	74
2.4.	Seagoing vessels.	77
3.	Reservation and confidentiality	78
4.	Bankruptcy and analogous insolvency proceedings	83
VIII.	Sanctions	84
IX.	Conclusion: On articulation and codification	87
1.	The issue of definitions	87
2.	Articulation	88
2.1.	Collective Redundancies Directive, Transfer of Undertakings Directive, Framework Directive versus European Works Council Directive	88
2.2.	EWC Directive and the transfer of undertakings: Effects of structural change.	88
2.3.	SE Directive and EWC Directive.	89
3.	The first test of the Maastricht Social Protocol: European works councils	
	JON ERIK DØLVIK	91
I.	Background	91
II.	The talks about talks.	95
III.	Organizational and analytical lessons	99
	References	103

4. The EWC in domestic and ECJ case law	105
I. European works councils related litigation – Rationale for a systematic analysis	
ROMUALD JAGODZIŃSKI	107
Summary	107
1. Existing legal studies on EWCs	107
2. Background of the research project on EWC-related case law	109
3. Research approach	110
4. Conclusion	112
References	113
II. National reports	115
<i>Austria</i>	
DOMENICO RIEF	115
Procedural part	115
1. List of the judgments	115
a. Austrian judgments: <i>Kühne & Nagel AG & Co KG (Germany) v Kühne & Nagel GmbH (Austria)</i>	115
b. Parties	115
c. Stage of the procedure	116
2. Procedure to take legal action	116
a. Standing	116
b. Financial costs of the legal procedure	118
3. Judicial interpretation of Article 6 and Article 13 Agreements	120
Substantial part	120
1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 agreements	120
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers ('representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational establishments and of enterprises	120
a. Decision of the Court of first instance	121
b. Decision by the Court of Appeals	123
c. Decision by the Supreme Court	123
d. Comment	125
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European works council	126
4. Legal issues of Article 6 Agreements	126
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC	126

6.	Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure	126
7.	Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation	126
8.	External restrictions to information and consultation.	126
9.	Subsidiary requirements	126
10.	Other issues	126

Belgium

FILIP DORSEMONT	127
-----------------------	-----

Procedural part	127
-----------------------	-----

1.	List of all the cases	127
2.	Procedure to take legal action	128
3.	Judicial interpretation of Article 6 and Article 13 agreements	130
4.	Judicial and territorial competence	130

Substantial part	130
------------------------	-----

1.	The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 agreements	130
	a. Facts	131
	b. Ruling	132
	c. Anticipatory agreements and representativity	132
2.	Legal issues related to the assessment by workers ('representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational undertakings or groups of undertakings	136
3.	"The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European Works Council"	136
4.	Legal issues of Article 6 agreements	136
5.	Functioning of the SNB and the EWC	136
6.	Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure	136
	a. Facts	136
	b. Ruling	137
	c. Assessment	138
	d. Sanctions in case of violation of the information and consultation procedure	138
7.	Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation	138
8.	External restrictions to information and consultation.	138
9.	Subsidiary requirements	138
10.	Other issues	139

France

RACHID BRIHI.....	141
Introduction.....	141
Procedural part.....	141
1. List of all cases.....	141
2. Standing of the EWC: the issue of legal personality.....	142
3. Procedure to take legal action.....	143
Substantial part.....	144
1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 Agreements.....	144
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers ('representatives) of the community-scale dimension of transnational undertakings or groups of undertakings.....	144
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European works council.....	144
4. Legal issues of Article 6 Agreements.....	144
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC.....	144
6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ...	144
a. On the EWC's right to information.....	144
b. On the EWC's right to consultation.....	146
c. What sanctions should there be for the rights of the EWC?.....	152
7. On the links between the EWC and the national bodies for the representation of workers.....	154
8. External restrictions to information and consultation.....	156
9. Subsidiary requirements.....	156
10. Other issues: towards the affirmation of a true transnational stakeholder?.....	156

Germany

THOMAS BLANKE.....	159
List of abbreviations.....	159
1. Case studies.....	159
1.1. Schneider Electric: Review of the appointment of national employees' representatives to the EWC – national jurisdiction ..	159
1.2. Forbo: The European works council does not supersede national participation rights.....	162
1.3. Valora/Stielke: Priority of the request to set up a Special Negotiating Body pursuant to §9 EBRG over a judicial declaration of the invalidity of an agreement in accordance with §41 EBRG (= Article 13 Directive).....	164

1.4.	British Airways: Injunctive relief for the European Works Council in the case of a failure to consult in temporary injunction proceedings and inadmissibility of the cautioning of a EWC chairperson because she visited a works council abroad (Vienna) in connection with outsourcing measures	166
1.	Judgment of the Labour Court of Brussels (6.12.2006) in temporary injunction proceedings: injunctive relief for the EWC in the case of a failure to consult.	166
2.	Judgment of the Labour Court of Düsseldorf (19.3.2008): Inadmissibility of the cautioning of the EWC chair on account of a visit to a works council abroad (Austria) with regard to an outsourcing matter	168
1.5.	Junk/Kühnel: Timeliness of the consultation procedure	170
1.6.	Junghenrich: Free choice of venue for the EWC committee and the scope of the information obligation – no decision on the merits	172
1.7-8-9	Bo-frost, Kühne & Nagel, ADS Anker: The right to information in accordance with Article 11, subsection 2 EWC Directive (§5, subsection 1 and 2 EBRG)	173
1.7.	Bo-frost: Claim for information by the EWC for the purpose of clarifying the scope of application of the EBRG	175
1.	History of the proceedings and central legal issues	175
2.	The reception of the ECJ decision in the German literature	178
3.	The decision of the first division of the Federal Labour Court of 30.3.2004: The right to information presupposes a certain real probability if the directive is to be applicable	179
4.	The internal right to information between undertakings	180
1.8.	Kühne & Nagel: Horizontal request for information by the deemed central management against all group undertakings	181
1.	Facts of the case: Judicial proceedings in connection with preparing an application	181
2.	Judicial proceedings to assert the right to information	183
3.	Enforcement of adjudicated claims.	185
4.	The central works council's own efforts.	186
5.	Alternative courses of action and evaluation: Self-constitution of a EWC?	186
1.9.	ADS Anker: 'Horizontal' right to information also against a foreign parent company	188
1.10.	General summary of cases VII–IX: Need for further proceedings	189
1.11.	Crawford Tar: No information.	191

2. European works councils – A foreign body in German law? 191

The Netherlands

ROBBERT VAN HET KAAR 193

I. Procedural part 193

1. List of cases 193

2. Legal standing 193

3. Costs 193

4. Role of trade unions 194

5. Interpretation of judges 194

6. Forum 194

II. Substantial part 194

1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 agreements 194

2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers (‘representatives’) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational undertakings or groups of undertakings 194

3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European works council 194

4. Legal issues of Article 6 agreements 197

5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC 197

6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure 197

7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation 197

8. External restrictions to information and consultation 197

9. Subsidiary requirements 197

10. Other issues 197

References 198

Slovak Republic

MARIA SVORENOVA 199

Procedural part 199

1. List of all the cases 199

2. Procedure to take legal action 200

3. Financial costs of legal proceedings 200

4. The role of trade unions 201

5. Judicial interpretation of Article 6 and 13 Agreements 201

6. Judicial and territorial competence 201

Substantial part	201
1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 agreements	201
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers ('representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational undertakings and of groups of undertakings	201
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishing of a European works council	202
a. Legal framework	202
b. Summary	203
c. Commentary	205
4. Legal issues of Article 6 agreements	206
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC	206
6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ...	206
7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation	206
8. External restrictions to information and consultation	206
9. Subsidiary requirements	206
10. Other issues	206
<i>Sweden</i>	
MAGNUS LUNDBERG	207
Procedural part	207
List of all the cases	207
Substantial part	207
1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 agreements	207
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers ('representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational undertakings and of groups of undertakings	207
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European works council	207
a. Background	207
b. The legal issue	208
4. Legal issues of Article 6 agreements	211
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC	211
6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ...	211
7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation	211
8. External restrictions to information and consultation	211

9. Subsidiary requirements 212
 10. Other issues 212
 References 212

United Kingdom

PASCAL LORBER 213

Procedural part 214

1. List of all cases 214
 2. Procedure to take legal action 216
 a. Standing 216
 b. Financial cost of the legal procedure 217
 c. Role of trade unions 217
 3. Judicial interpretation of Article 6 and 13 agreements 217
 4. Judicial and territorial competence 218

Substantial part 219

Thematic Analysis Structure 219

1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive) 219
 2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers ('representatives') of the Community-scale dimension of transnational establishments and of enterprises 220
 3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European works council 221
 a. EWC1/2004 Mr. Haines, Ms. Dickson & Mr. Plews and The British Council 221
 b. EWC4/2008 Unite the Union and Easyjet 222
 4. Legal issues of Article 6 agreements 223
 5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC 223
 6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ... 223
 7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation 223
 8. External restrictions to information and consultation 223
 9. Subsidiary requirements 223
 10. Other issues 223

III. The European Works Council Directive and the domestic Courts. A critical analysis of the *legal* issues at stake

FILIP DORSSEMONT 225

Procedural and general issues 225

Procedural issues 225

1. The EWC and Recast Directive 225

2.	The reported case law: litigation in four stages	226
a.	Legal disputes prior to the start of negotiations	227
b.	Legal disputes which arise at the start or during the negotiations	228
c.	Legal disputes at the start and in the course of a statutory or conventional EWC	229
d.	Legal disputes subsequent to the expiry or the termination of the agreements	233
3.	The standing of the European Works Council	233
4.	The domestic Courts and the issue of interpretation	235
5.	Private International Law Issues: the issue of competence and standing	238
	Substantial issues	241
1.	The exemption from the “obligations arising from the EWC Directive”: the validity of existing agreements challenged	241
2.	Legal issues related to the assessment of the Community-scale dimension of transnational establishments and of enterprises	243
3.	The designation of national workers’ representatives	248
4.	Issues related to the internal Functioning of the SNB and the EWC in view of the new Recast Directive	250
5.	Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure	253
a.	The competence of the EWC regarding transnational matters	253
b.	The right to information and consultation within the Recast Directive	256
c.	Quality of the information and consultation procedure	260
d.	Time is of the essence	261
e.	Sanctions in the case of violation of the information and consultation procedure	261
6.	Issues related to the termination of an Article 6 agreement	262
7.	External restrictions to information and consultation	263
8.	Articulation or <i>concordantia</i> with other EC instruments related to worker involvement	264
	Conclusions	268
IV.	Format for the national reports related to EWC case law	
	FILIP DORSEMONT	271
	Procedural part	271
	Substantial part	272
	Third part: Collected materials	272
	Thematic analysis structure (cf. second part)	273
1.	The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive)	273

2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers (representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational undertaking and groups of undertakings	273
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European Works Council	273
4. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC	273
5. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure	274
a. Content and space	274
b. Time is of the essence	274
c. <i>Quality</i> of the information and consultation procedure	274
d. <i>Sanctions</i> in case of violation of the information and consultation procedure	274
7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation	274
8. External restrictions to information and consultation	275
9. Subsidiary requirements	275
10. Other issues	275

B. THE RECAST OF THE EWC DIRECTIVE (2009/38)

1. Straightjacketing, time travelling and unifying: The multiple impact of the recast European Works Council Directive	
SÉVÉRINE PICARD	279
I. The recasting technique: the EU legislator in a straightjacket	280
1. Recast vs revision – definitions and procedural consequences	280
2. Political consequences of the recast – a limited agenda for reform	282
II. ‘Back to the future’ – the scope <i>ratione temporis</i> of the Recast Directive	283
1. No obligation to renegotiate existing agreements	284
2. A tailored application of the new rules to existing agreements	284
III. Towards a unification of the applicable regime to all company agreements? The key role of the adaptation clause	290
2. Review, revision or recast? The quest for an amended EWC Directive	
ROMUALD JAGODZIŃSKI	293
Introduction	293
I. The prelude to the EWC Directive of 1994	294
II. The first missed deadline for revision	294
III. Position of the European Trade Union Confederation	295
IV. The employers’ organisations	296
V. 2008: The final phase in the quest for a EWC revision	297

VI.	The ETUC's reviewed position.....	298
VII.	The European Commission's proposal for a revised EWC Directive ...	299
VIII.	Review, revision or recast?	300
IX.	Reactions of the social partners.....	301
X.	The new EWC Directive	303
XI.	Conclusion	308
	References	309

3. Information and consultation in the Recast Directive

	CORINNE SACHS-DURAND	313
--	----------------------------	-----

	Introduction.....	313
--	-------------------	-----

I.	Comparison between different concepts of information-consultation .	315
1.	The notion of information and consultation	315
1.1.	Effectiveness of information and consultation.....	315
a.	Effectiveness for the workers	315
b.	Effectiveness for the employers	315
1.2.	The definitions	316
a.	The information	316
b.	The consultation	317
c.	The relation with contractual autonomy.....	318
d.	Information and consultation in the subsidiary requirements	318
2.	Anticipation and action	319
II.	Will the new concept of information and consultation be effective? ...	321
1.	The agreements: a possible evolution?.....	321
2.	The case law: some tracks for the interpretation of the recast directive?.....	323
2.1.	The autonomy of the EWC concerning the content of the information.....	323
2.2.	The necessary quality of the information	324
2.3.	The respect of a time schedule allowing the workers' representatives to play their role	324
2.4.	The powers of the judge (in France) to modify the process, if necessary	325

4. Who is first? The correct timing of information and consultation of European works councils in relation to national rights of worker involvement

	THOMAS BLANKE and EDGAR ROSE.....	327
--	-----------------------------------	-----

I.	The relevance of correct timing of information and consultation	327
II.	The correct time for information and consultation of the EWC.....	329

1.	Concept and transposition of old EWC Directive 94/45	330
1.1.	The concept of Directive 94/45	330
1.2.	Fall-back provisions of national transposition law	333
1.3.	EWC agreements: French and German regulations at group or company level compared	336
1.3.1.	German agreements	337
1.3.2.	French agreements	338
1.3.3.	Comparison	339
1.4.	Court decisions	340
2.	Concept of Recast Directive 2009/38	342
III.	Priority regulations concerning the succession of supranational and national information and consultation procedures	344
1.	Priority regulations in times of EWC Directive 94/45	344
1.1.	Early information and consultation of national bodies in France and Germany	345
1.2.	Priority regulations in selected EWC agreements	347
1.3.	Solutions in court decisions	348
2.	Priority regulations of new EWC Directive 2009/38	350
IV.	Conclusions: The progress made by the EWC Recast Directive 2009/38	352
	References	355
5.	EWC's role recast: A European actor?	
	JOSEE J.M. LAMERS	357
I.	Introduction	357
1.	Two directives, two directions?	357
2.	Setup: the European role to play	358
II.	The principles of the EWC Directives	359
1.	Why we have a framework solution	359
1.1.	Autonomy: a key principle	360
1.2.	Autonomy v mandatory report back	361
1.3.	Autonomy v transnational competence	362
1.4.	Autonomy v negotiating transnational texts	364
2.	Subsidiarity	364
2.1.	Subsidiarity v competence EU	364
2.2.	Hierarchy of powers	365
2.3.	Subsidiarity v nomination employees' representatives	365
2.4.	Subsidiarity v insiders, court ruling	366
2.5.	Subsidiarity v confidentiality	367
2.6.	Subsidiarity v duration national mandates	368
3.	Proportionality	368
4.	Equality	370

4.1. Equality v equal access to top management	370
4.2. Equality v equal representation	371
5. Flexible rule	371
6. Spirit of cooperation	371
7. Effectiveness.....	372
8. Useful effect	372
9. Fundamental rights	373
10. Concluding remarks about the principles	373
III. The dialogue of the EWC with central management	374
1. The effectiveness of the dialogue.....	374
2. Standard setting by courts	375
3. Linking European consultation with local levels	378
4. The representation status of the EWC.....	381
5. Negotiating transnational agreements.....	383
6. The relation with the trade unions.....	385
IV. EWCs development and European actor?.....	387
V. Training and time off for EWC members	388
VI. Concluding remarks.....	392
References	395
6. Can the Recast Directive bring more and more effective EWCs?	
PETER KERCKHOFS.....	399
I. Facilitating new EWCs.....	400
1. The extending geographical scope increased the number of missing EWCs	401
2. Preparing for the written demand to start the setting up of a EWC	402
3. Legal incentives to start the process of setting up EWCs	404
4. Help for SNBs to establish missing EWCs	405
II. Upgrading existing EWCs.....	408
1. Legal upgrading of existing EWCs.....	408
1.1. What kind of legal upgrading can existing EWCs benefit from?	408
1.2. Different timing of the legal upgrading of existing EWCs	409
2. The shadow of the Subsidiary Requirements of the Recast Directive	410
2.1. The impact of the subsidiary requirements on EWC negotiations	411
2.2. Changes in the subsidiary requirements of the Recast Directive	412
III. Effect on actors providing support for EWCs	413
1. Different social partner recommendations in the transition period	414

2. More consensus-oriented approaches may prevail	415
IV. Conclusions	416
References	417